



**TREASURE ISLAND  
MOBILITY MANAGEMENT AGENCY**

1455 Market Street, 22ND Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103    415-522-4800    info@timma.org    www.timma.org

# *DRAFT MINUTES*

## **TREASURE ISLAND MOBILITY MANAGEMENT AGENCY COMMITTEE**

Tuesday, January 25, 2022

### **1. Roll Call**

Chair Haney called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.

**Present at Roll Call:** Commissioners Haney and Mandelman (2)

**Absent:** Commissioner Ronen (entered during Item 2) (1)

### **2. Approve Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953(e) - ACTION**

Britney Milton, Clerk of the Transportation Authority, presented the item.

During public comment, Jeff Klein said there was a digital divide created by having the virtual meetings and hoped the committee would return to in-person meetings as soon as possible.

Chair Haney moved to approve the teleconferencing resolution.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haney, Mandelman, and Ronen (3)

Absent: (0)

### **3. Approve the Minutes of the November 9, 2021 Meeting - ACTION**

There was no public comment.

Chair Haney moved to approve the minutes.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haney, Mandelman, and Ronen (3)

Absent: (0)

**Items 4 and 5 were called together.**

### **4. Recommend Approval of Base Toll Policy and Affordability Program and Implementation of the Associated Toll System - ACTION**

### **5. Treasure Island Mobility Management Program Implementation Report 2021 - INFORMATION**

Rachel Hiatt, Deputy Director for Planning, presented the toll program item per the staff memorandum.

Suany Chough, consulting project manager to TIMMA, presented the implementation report item per the staff memorandum.



Chair Haney thanked staff for the hard work and outreach on the project and commented on the convenience of the ferry service. He asked about the ways that the toll plan gives flexibility in connection to the actual launch and operation of the public transit options, particularly for residents, and wanted to ensure that there was time to make accessible transportation available. He pointed out that in the past, a lot of commitments were made around larger projects in San Francisco that were years late in the launch. The Chair asked how the agency was able to ensure the commitments around the public transit options were also in place when tolling was in place. Ms. Hiatt answered that the TIMMA policy body would have the authority to ensure that transit is included when the toll is launched. Chair Haney clarified that the agency was not committing to launch the toll at a certain time without transit in place, as that was a concern he had heard. He stated the committee will have further opportunities to make sure those things were in place and aligned before the final launch.

Chair Haney asked about affordability measures for future middle and low income residents, if they were treated the same way as elsewhere or if there was a particular difference in how the agency categorized people by income who lived on the island versus not in the island, as well as future residents. Ms. Hiatt answered that the agency's proposal made the exemption and discount program available to all future travelers who qualify based on their income. She further commented the program threshold was designed so that anyone who qualifies for below market rate housing will be eligible for the discount or exemption, regardless of where they live, and that staff is cognizant of future low income workers and possibly residents' visiting family members who are low income and live in another county in the Bay Area.

Chair Haney asked Ms. Hiatt to reiterate and give an overview for everyone on the exemption for current residents. Ms. Hiatt answered that according to the 2019 TIMMA Board adoption of toll exemption, current residents were defined as anyone living on the island as of the date of the toll adoption, and that those residents will be exempt from the toll any number of times of day, any day of the week through either a FasTrak, toll tag provided by the agency that could be used to exempt the motorist from any toll.

Chair Haney commented that there was a lot of additional work and care still to come and stated his desire to ensure affordability measures are in place for those that need it. He said that the goal was to have through this process a lot more people on Treasure Island and coming to Treasure Island to visit businesses to support them and to do that with an accessible, fast transit system. He noted that some people would still need to drive and affordability measures should be in place for current and future residents and future workers. He added that there was more work to be done, more conversation and final approvals, and that what was being approved was a framework.

During public comment, Ross Liebenson opposed the toll proposal, particularly for non-motorized water recreational users and cited violations of AB 981, interfering with public access to the public trust land.

Jeff Klein cited a requirement for the Treasure Island toll and Travel Demand Management program to have two-thirds approval by voters. He also cited AB 981, stating that the intent was to charge only future residents of Treasure Island rather than all drivers.

Jim McGrath cited AB 981, addressing land trust uses and ensuring that the public could access state tidelands.



A caller expressed that the toll would devastate programs and services on the island and no economic assessment of impact on residents in the long run, especially after COVID, had been conducted.

Steve Stallone with the Treasure Island Organizing Committee expressed concern about moving ahead with tolling when other aspects of plan were not completed like finalizing how the subsidies to businesses were going to be done and asked for the item to be postponed until August after other issues were figured out.

Christopher Opperman with the Treasure Island Organizing Committee expressed that both residents and those interested in the island have opposed the toll, especially without transit services in place, and could not be expected to pay a toll when there were no other options to go to and from the island to get to residences and services.

Jeff Finn said some written public comment was not posted on the agency website and hoped that an official organization letter made it into the record.

A caller asked the Committee to delay adoption of toll and that the toll would be a roadblock impeding public access to the Bay; they said the toll was meant only for new residents according to AB 981, and would not benefit those who pay the toll and were not part of the problem. They said that staff had used daily averages on the Bay Bridge and did not look at directional data.

Jim Morowsky with the Treasure Island Organizing Committee said there were no findings under AB 981 or CEQA to allow TIMMA to move forward and that businesses were needed more than transportation. He asked for an analysis on the impact to businesses, customers, suppliers, and non-profits, as well as delay of adoption of the toll policy.

Linda of Aracely Cafe expressed that even though there was a subsidy, the real cost was getting customers, vendors, and workers to come to the island with the toll affecting deliveries and raising business cost of goods. She asked for a one-way toll only and to ensure transit services were in place beforehand.

A caller expressed their disappointed with current limited and future intended transit services to and from the island with a missing bicycle path into San Francisco and said that isolating the island by toll in both directions would make it not part of any city. They asked for expansion of transit services and thanked Chair Haney for supporting his district and protecting the businesses and the residents.

Chair Haney thanked the callers for their comments and stated that staff were in direct conversation with stakeholders about public transit options and the Committee wanted to ensure those were in place and effective before implementation of the toll. He discussed the gridlock thousands of future residents driving on the island would create as the reason why the Committee from many years past included the toll as part of the plan for development. Chair Haney also stated it should not and does not apply to current residents and there should be support for current businesses, for middle- and low-income drivers who need discounts, and that there were true transit options available. He remarked that as District Supervisor, he was committed to ensuring the program's success and hoped the Committee would continue to monitor the program closely to make sure it was implemented in an equitable way.

The Chair asked Ms. Hiatt to speak to the FasTrak option and whether the agency was making commitments around low- and middle-income discounts, especially since that was not a current option, and what the agency expected could be made possible by the time the toll went into



effect. Ms. Hiatt answered there was a pilot in development on I-880 in the East Bay to allow for discounts on FasTrak which would serve as a model for the system on Treasure Island.

Chair Haney moved to approve the item.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haney, Mandelman, and Ronen (3)

Absent: (0)

**6. Recommend Acceptance of the Audit Report for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2021 - ACTION**

Due to time constraints, this item was continued.

**7. Program Cost and Funding Strategy - INFORMATION**

Due to time constraints, this item was continued.

**Other Items**

**8. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION**

There were no new items introduced.

**9. Public Comment**

During general public comment, a caller asked if other services like healthcare, delivery, and ride share for residents had been considered in the toll program.

A caller opined that the meeting violated the Brown Act and people's trust as trustees of the public land.

**10. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 10:17 a.m.