



DRAFT MINUTES

San Francisco County Transportation Authority

Tuesday, March 8, 2022

1. Roll Call

Chair Mandelman called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Chan, Haney, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (8)

Absent at Roll Call: Commissioners Mar (excused, entered during Item 6), Melgar (entered during Item 2), and Preston (entered during Item 3) (3)

2. [Final Approval on First Appearance] Approve the Resolution making findings to allow teleconferenced meetings under California Government Code Section 54953(e) - ACTION

Angela Tsao, Acting Clerk, presented the item.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Melgar moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Ronen.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Haney, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (9)

Absent: Commissioners Mar and Preston (2)

3. Community Advisory Committee Report - INFORMATION

John Larson, Chair to the Community Advisory Committee (CAC), presented the report on the virtual meeting held on February 23. He noted that although a modest request, the Bike to Work Day portion of the Prop K allocation item on the Board's agenda was a significant part of CAC members' focus, explaining that members wanted to ensure that energizer stations were throughout all 11 districts and wanted the scope of the event to be broadened to biking to wherever/everywhere to appeal to non-commute bicyclists as well. CAC Chair Larson also commented that during the discussion of the item, CAC members unanimously agreed with one member's suggestion that all allocation requests include equity benefits and impacts of proposed projects as part of the regular presentations rather than CAC members having to raise those issues themselves.

CAC Chair Larson also commented that during the Climate Action Plan item presentation, CAC members were interested in the component parts of the plan and how they interacted to achieve the climate goals like the influence of carbon sequestering through public lands and street trees, impacts of the walking and biking to reduce greenhouse emissions, and green transit that included non-fossil fuel



ferries. CAC Chair Larson continued his report by saying that during an informational update on the 2022 Expenditure Plan for the half-cent sales tax, the CAC was particularly pleased to see the Neighborhood Transportation Investment Program codified in the Transportation System Development and Management category, as well two new programs: Equity Priority Transportation Program (to fund projects focused on equity priority and disadvantaged communities) and the Development Oriented Transportation Program (for planned growth and density in neglected areas of the cities such as the West Side). CAC Chair Larson concluded by thanking CAC member Rosa Chen for serving on the Expenditure Plan Advisory Committee and the hard work devoted to putting together this comprehensive and inclusive plan together.

There was no public comment.

4. Approve the Minutes of the February 15, 2022 Meeting - ACTION

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Melgar moved to approve the minutes, seconded by Chair Mandelman.

The minutes were approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Haney, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (9)

Absent: Commissioners Mar and Ronen (2)

5. Appoint One Member to the Community Advisory Committee - ACTION

Mike Pickford, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Peter Tannen, incumbent and District 8 applicant, spoke to his interests and qualifications in seeking reappointment to the Community Advisory Committee (CAC).

Chair Mandelman said he would like to nominate Peter Tannen to continue representing District 8 and expressed gratitude for Mr. Tannen's 14 years of service, commitment, and valued transportation expertise and knowledge that he brought to the CAC.

There was no public comment.

Chair Mandelman made a motion to appoint Peter Tannen to the CAC, seconded by Commissioner Preston.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Haney, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (9)

Absent: Commissioners Mar and Ronen (2)

6. Endorse the 2022 Expenditure Plan for the Reauthorization of the Local Sales Tax for Transportation- ACTION

Michelle Beaulieu, Principal Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff



memorandum.

Amandeep Jawa, Expenditure Plan Advisory Committee (EPAC) Chair, thanked EPAC members for their work on the draft Expenditure Plan and said they had been thoughtful throughout the process. He also thanked staff for their hard work in helping EPAC members understand complex information and understand the process. He thanked sponsor agency representatives for providing information on their project needs and being available to answer questions. He said it was a lot of work but was grateful for everyone's participation and was proud of the result. He said it was likely that no one got exactly what they wanted in the Expenditure Plan, but that meant the EPAC did their job well, developing an Expenditure Plan with broad appeal.

BART Director Bevan Dufty, Board Director referenced BART's letter from General Manager Bob Powers indicating BART's strong support for the Expenditure Plan and this measure. He thanked the Commissioners for meeting with BART Board Directors and staff over the last six months and expressed appreciation for the increase in BART's programs in the Expenditure Plan. He said there was a better understanding of what BART was doing for San Francisco, including the Core Capacity program to increase the number of trains coming into the city. He said he was impressed with participation from the EPAC and their passion for mobility in San Francisco and the dedication they showed and said he believed the measure would be supported because of this. He also thanked Transportation Authority staff for their work throughout the process. Director Dufty said in addition to Core Capacity, next generation fare gates and modernizing elevators would also be possible because of the Expenditure Plan. He said BART had established an ambassador program, hired crisis intervention specialists, reopened bathrooms, and they understand what BART should be doing, including serving those who are transit-dependent and who made up 50% of their ridership during the pandemic. He thanked Chair Mandelman for his time and dedication throughout the Expenditure Plan development process.

Commissioner Melgar thanked staff for the democratic and community-driven process and EPAC Chair Jawa for serving on the EPAC. She thanked Joan Van Rijn for her advocacy on the EPAC on behalf of seniors and people with disabilities which resulted in an increase in paratransit funding being proposed. She expressed gratitude for the special attention paid to transportation issues on the west side, especially recommendations emerging from the ConnectSF effort and issues connecting the west side to the rest of city and the regional transportation network. She also thanked BART for their engagement with her office, including issues related to connectivity of the Daly City BART station and Balboa Park BART station to the rest of network and how that was reflected in the Expenditure Plan.

Commissioner Preston echoed the gratitude given and thanked Chair Mandelman and Chair Jawa for their work. He said he wanted to give a special thanks to Majeid Crawford, District 5 representative on the EPAC and Executive Director of the New Community Leadership Foundation. He said Mr. Crawford had been an important advocate on the EPAC, putting a lot of time and energy toward the committee and pushing the EPAC in the direction of increasing the commitment to equity which was reflected in the Expenditure Plan.

Chair Mandelman thanked Aaron Leifer, District 8 representative on the EPAC.



During public comment, Brian Haagsman, Vision Zero Organizer with Walk San Francisco (WalkSF), said WalkSF participated on the EPAC and supports the Expenditure Plan. He said WalkSF fought to increase safe streets funding for vulnerable road users, including guaranteed Safe Routes to School funding to improve infrastructure around schools and provide education to shift trips to walking, biking, and taking transit. He said the top 3 reasons parents drove their children to school were all related to dangerous streets and intersections near schools and programs to help with infrastructure improvements were needed. He said the proposed funding was still not enough to address needed Vision Zero safety improvements. He said WalkSF would continue to advocate for other sources of funding to keep true on the promise of Vision Zero and thanked the Board.

Zack Deutsch-Gross, Advocacy Director with San Francisco Transit Riders and member of the EPAC, encouraged the Board to endorse the Expenditure Plan as proposed and urged the Board of Supervisors to put it on the November 2022 ballot. He said he was impressed with the process and outcome which emphasized a more equitable and accessible transit system that riders need by maintaining and enhancing Muni, BART, ferry and Caltrain services and ensures that projects with documented support from disadvantaged populations including those harmed by past transportation policies would receive additional priority. He said that while sales taxes were regressive, this was an existing tax, not a new one, and investments were progressive. He expressed support for a ballot measure and the Expenditure Plan as proposed.

Christopher White, Director of Programs with San Francisco Bicycle Coalition and member of the EPAC, expressed support for endorsement of the Expenditure Plan and sending it to voters in November 2022. He said the process was robust and thoughtful, and the EPAC considered hours of presentations from agency representatives, public comment, hundreds of pages of information compiled by staff, and heard and weighed reports of the concurrent community outreach process. He said all of this was incorporated and the Expenditure Plan represented a careful balance of needs in the city. He said it would help transportation agencies recover from the pandemic while adequately funding street safety improvements that would help achieve Vision Zero goals, although more progress could be made elsewhere. He said the Expenditure Plan builds in equity including more funding for paratransit, the Equity Priority Neighborhood Program, and equity-focused prioritization measures including communities impacted by displacement in San Francisco. He urged the Board to move the Expenditure Plan forward and expressed appreciation for staff.

Bill Blackwell, with Plumbers and Pipefitters Local 38 San Francisco, spoke in support of the Expenditure Plan. He said plans like these give their 420 out of work members some hope that recovery is coming and would appreciate the Board's support of the plan.

BART Director Janice Li spoke in support of the Expenditure Plan, indicating alignment with Director Dufty's earlier comments. She thanked Commissioners and staff for their commitment to engaging the public and expressed deep gratitude to the members the EPAC. She said the EPAC had many priorities to weigh, and many had made time to meet with BART Board Directors to better understand BART's requests. She thanked Commissioners for meeting with BART Board Directors as well. She said she was grateful for the commitment of \$100 million for the BART Core Capacity program as well as additional funding for BART maintenance which would



help fix elevators and replace faregates. She said these were tangible investments that San Francisco riders would be able to feel and see. She referenced the letter from BART expressing support for the Expenditure Plan and said BART carried more than 55,000 riders through San Francisco daily before the pandemic. She expressed a continued commitment to be a strong collaborative partner in the City of San Francisco.

Cathy DeLuca, with Community Living Campaign (CLC), urged endorsement of the Expenditure Plan and in particular the increased allotment for paratransit. She said that during the pandemic SFMTA started the essential trip card program and CLC worked to help people sign up and partnered with the SFMTA to help pay for trips. She said to date CLC had subsidized over 150 residents. She shared stories from those grateful for the essential trip card who use it to reach doctors' appointments, grocery stores, and other daily needs. She said it gave seniors and people with disabilities the opportunity to travel with dignity. She thanked staff and the EPAC for their hard work and for coming up with an Expenditure Plan that valued seniors and people with disabilities and asked for Board endorsement of the Expenditure Plan.

Sharky Laguana, EPAC member, said he was grateful for all the work staff put into the Expenditure Plan and urged the Board to approve the Expenditure Plan and move it forward to voters. He said it was a carefully considered process and the result balanced concerns and would advance San Francisco transportation goals for the future.

Sarah Greenwald, with 360 San Francisco and resident of District 2, noted that the District 2 supervisor is acutely aware of the relationship between transit and climate. She expressed support for the plan for two reasons. She stated that the first reason was climate, saying that it was crucial to get people out of gas cars and onto public transit. Her second reason was that she did not have access to a reliable car and relies on transit. She noted that the plan has excellent new project prioritization criteria, and that funding would be directed to communities that have been impacted by displacement and neglected by past transportation projects, and to low-income communities, communities of color and Equity Priority Communities. She noted that this would help people get back to transit and help people in these communities get out of cars and onto cleaner public transit.

Rudy Gonzalez, Secretary and Treasurer with the San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council, expressed strong support for the expenditure plan. He stated that staff put in an incredible amount of time and did a great job facilitating. Mr. Gonzalez expressed gratitude for Chair Mandelman and EPAC members for demonstrating how governance can work and in real time. He stated that there was a lot of adaptive leadership that responded to paratransit, equity and BART Core Capacity needs. He stated that the Trades Council is in support of implementing the Caltrain Downtown Extension (DTX) to Salesforce Transit Center. He stated that the climate demands it, the moment for economic recovery demands it, and that the 1300 skilled and trained out-of-work San Franciscans in their crafts were hoping for it. He said that they see an incredible opportunity to pair local programs and regional priorities with once in a generation matching federal funds. He said it was a thoughtful approach that will do great things. He urged the Board's support of the expenditure plan.

Charlie Lavrie, with Operating Engineers Local 3 representing 10,000 construction



equipment operators and construction inspectors, expressed support for the new expenditure plan and for the \$300 million for DTX. He thanked the EPAC or their civic service, and the staff for their work. He wished everyone a happy International Women's Day, and that his union had the highest number of women in any craft, but that there was still a lot of work to do. He expressed excitement to be in support of a historic process that will have a global impact, to do climate mitigation, getting cars off the road and planes out of the air. He noted the equity value of the DTX project, with job creation and linking underserved communities. Mr Lavrie stated that he had served for four years on the Transbay Joint Powers Authority (TJPA) Citizens Advisory Committee for the Transbay Transit Center, where there were over 600 operating engineers, including individuals from underserved communities who served their entire apprenticeship on that single project. He stated that this is the kind of project that they need, and that the funding here is needed to leverage federal funding. He urged everyone to move the project forward.

Harry Toronto expressed support for the extra funding in the paratransit portion of the expenditure plan. He stated that unfortunately taxi drivers don't have a dedicated advocate who can seek inclusion of taxis in the expenditure plan. He noted that with the increase in gas costs, there wasn't enough of a tip included in the paratransit debit cards or Essential Trip Cards. He stated that tips were capped at 10%. He stated that they had asked for an increase in costs on these cards. He emphasized that they go the extra mile, particularly in the evenings and late nights, for seniors and people with disabilities. He said that he hoped the plan would include this, and that he would have liked to have included some medallion debt relief for taxi drivers as well. He stated that this was needed to attract more drivers, and that some drivers would have their loans foreclosed on if they do not receive aid.

Dan Torres, Business Agent with Sprinkler Fitters Local 43, spoke in support of the plan.

Bruce Agid, member of Friends of the DTX, board member and transportation representative of the South Beach Rincon Mission Bay Neighborhood Association, and former chair of the TJPA Citizens Advisory Committee, expressed his support of the resolution endorsing the 2022 Expenditure Plan. He said that as a member of the public he listened to the last EPAC meeting and appreciated the thoughtful approach to capture thoughts and perspectives of each committee member, and the process to develop a scenario, where though no group got everything they wanted, an excellent compromise was reached with a delicate balance between priorities, which ultimately everyone voted to support.

Adam Van de Water, Executive Director with the TJPA, thanked the EPAC members, Transportation Authority staff, and Commission for their time and commitment to developing the expenditure plan and for endorsing \$300 million for the DTX project. He noted this was a critical demonstration of local support as they approach significant funding opportunities at the state and federal levels with the 2023 application to the Bipartisan Infrastructure Law, and seek to bring riders through a 2 mile extension into downtown San Francisco via Caltrain and the future High Speed Rail network and deliver sustainable equitable efficient and high-quality transportation to the region. He expressed his appreciation for the hard work going into this effort and supported approval of the item.

Danny Campbell, with Sheet Metal Workers Local 104, expressed support for the plan.



He noted that the DTX project is a once in a generation investment to connect 11 transit systems. He said it would get people out of their cars and get them into San Francisco to spend their money at local businesses and rejuvenate the economy, and more importantly it would put construction workers back to work, creating good middle class union jobs building a world-class transit system.

David Pilpel stated that the Muni Reliability and Street Safety GO Bond on the June 2022 ballot may inform how this measure does in November. He stated his opposition to 3-car trains on the N-Judah line, and to forced transfers on the subway. He noted that the Muni Metro Core Capacity study funded in the plan has a broad, programmatic scope. He stated that he felt there was too much funding in enhancements and not enough for maintenance in the plan. He recognized the tension between the two and said he favored state of good repair. Mr. Pilpel said he would like to ensure that mid-life overhauls of transit vehicles and other efforts to maintain assets funded actually happen, either by policy or by language in the expenditure plan. He stated that current uncertainties in the world and in transportation planning might support a delay of the sales tax measure for two years. He said he would also like the EPAC to be consulted with respect to the implementation of the plan if the measure passes, which did not happen with the 2003 Prop K EPAC and which he feels was a missed opportunity. He also stated that he feels the SFMTA is a lightning rod while other agencies are viewed in a more neutral or favorable light in public opinion and that perception of SFMTA as it evolves going forward, may influence how this measure performs.

Pi Ra, with Senior Disability Action and EPAC member, expressed support for the plan. He stated he was honored to be a part of the EPAC, and that he had participated in the Prop K and Prop B EPACs, as well. He felt this was the best session group he'd dealt with of the three, and was happy with the recommendations particularly around paratransit, since he used to work for paratransit in the 80s and 90s. He recommended that the Board pass the recommended that the EPAC worked hard to put together and thanked the Board and staff.

Joe Cauthen, President with Bay Area Transportation Working Group, expressed support for the expenditure plan, noting that he was impressed by how balanced it was. He stated he was all for improving paratransit and hoped to see reduced waiting times. He noted that the group was very involved in Muni Metro, and that he thinks there needed to be a system worked out so that there were not so many trains entering the subway in the peak hour and at the same time making sure no one had to transfer to get downtown, that there should be a single seat ride for everybody, which can be worked out. He stated that he was impressed by how much work San Francisco had done to improve bus travel and give more priority to Muni buses, but that there was a long way to go on that. Finally, he noted that in order to improve internal circulation including buses and traffic, there needed to be alternative ways of getting people in and out of town by non-automotive means, so improvements to BART and Caltrain and to the Caltrain extension were very important.

Wesley Tam, EPAC District 2 representative, expressed support for the passage of the expenditure plan. He stated that he hoped the Commissioners would support it.

After public comment, Chair Mandelman reiterated the thanks for all of the members of the EPAC, for staff who worked hard to get to this point, and for partners from various transportation agencies.



Commissioner Preston moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Walton.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, and Walton (9)

Absent: Commissioners Haney (excused) and Stefani (2)

7. State and Federal Legislation Update - ACTION

Amber Crabbe, Public Policy Manager, and Mark Watts, state legislative consultant, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

During public comment, Julie Mitchell, with San Francisco Bay Area Families for Safe Streets, urged support for AB 2336 (Friedman and Ting), and shared the story of her son Dylan's death due to traffic violence and the impact it had on her family and her life. She said effective enforcement tools like speed safety cameras were needed to help San Francisco get to Vision Zero.

Wu Xing requested support for AB 2336 and shared multiple personal experiences of being injured in traffic collisions and the impact on her life. She said speeding is the number one factor in crashes and the bill would help San Francisco address it.

Jenny Yu shared her experience of caring for her mother after a serious injury from a traffic collision and requested more funding for speed reduction measures.

Rick Sterling shared his personal experience with traffic violence and the time and effort it took him to recover. He requested more funding for speed reduction measures.

After public comment, Commissioner Peskin moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Melgar.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (10)

Absent: Commissioner Haney (excused) (1)

8. Allocate \$1,791,758 in Prop K Funds, with Conditions, and Appropriate \$150,000 for Three Requests - ACTION

Mike Pickford, Senior Transportation Planner, and Jesse Koehler, Rail Program Manager, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Vice Chair Peskin commented that many years in the past he had expressed a concern over an outreach contract that the Transportation Authority had with a firm that doubled as a lobbyist that often contacted the Board of Supervisors in their capacity as a lobbyist. He noted he was troubled by that conflict which was eventually resolved. He continued by saying he was also troubled by a somewhat similar ethical quandary in granting funds to an organization that also plays a role in the political endorsement process. Vice Chair Peskin applauded the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition's (SFBC's) work but observed that it is troubling that officials are put in a weird position of granting funds to an organization that they in turn request



endorsements from. He noted that he voted to approve similar Bike to Work Day allocations in the past, but that he wanted to pose this ethical question to this body, noting it didn't need to be solved today and that there were various ways to resolve the issue.

Commissioner Safai recommended support for speed limit reductions in his district, for San Jose Avenue and Ocean Avenue which had a lot of traffic injuries and was an area with a lot of small businesses, families, and seniors. He said his office had been working with the community to improve traffic calming and pedestrian and bike safety. Commissioner Safai thanked members of the community and SFMTA staff for their work on the project and said he was looking forward to seeing speed limits reduced along San Jose Avenue.

During public comment, David Pilpel opposed the proposed Muni Metro Core Capacity Study allocation, saying it would lead to 3-car trains on the N Judah and M Ocean light rail lines as well as forced transfers on West Portal and Church and Market streets stations on the K, L, and J lines. He said there should be a range of stakeholders on the working group including dissenting voices and strong oversight by the SFMTA board and the Board of Supervisors or Transportation Authority Board.

Brian Haagsman, Walk San Francisco, echoed the comments from callers on Item 7 about supporting 20 mile-per-hour zones because they were half as likely as 25 mile-per-hour zones to leave someone dead in a traffic crash, stressing the importance of SFMTA's commitment to those speed reduction projects. He requested the Commissioners' continued their support for the 20 mile-per-hour zones in each district.

Barry Toronto agreed with Vice Chair Peskin's concerns about conflict of interest issues with the SFBC received grant funds. He suggested giving money to the Taxi Drivers' alliance for promotion and enforcement, and safety classes for Taxi drivers.

After public comment, Commissioner Melgar asked staff to speak on the transfer issue at the West Portal station between the M and L lines, which was understood to be a pilot program and asked staff for clarification.

Kansai Uchida with the SFMTA answered that the study will explore options for efficiency and capacity. He said several strategies will be analyzed technically and no decisions had yet been made about which strategies SFMTA will adopt.

Commissioner Melgar requested staff to ensure the study looked at impacts on ridership.

Chair Mandelman separated the first two allocations, Muni Metro Core Capacity Study and 20 MPH Speed Limit Reductions for a vote.

Commissioner Peskin moved to approve the proposed allocations and appropriation for the Muni Metro Core Capacity Study and 20 MPH Speed Limit Reductions as recommended by staff, seconded by Commissioner Mandelman.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (10)

Absent: Commissioner Haney (excused) (1)



Commissioner Melgar moved to approve the Bike to Work Day allocation, seconded by Commissioner Mandelman.

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Preston, Ronen, Stefani, and Walton (8)

Nays: Commissioners Peskin and Safai (2)

Absent: Commissioner Haney (1)

9. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

10. Public Comment

There was no general public comment.

11. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:59 a.m.