Toll Affordability Program: Equity Program Options

TIMMA Committee
Treasure Island Development Project will be the largest new housing development in San Francisco in decades.

Opportunities:
- Building a transit first community
- Delivering equitable solutions
- Prioritizing environmental sustainability

Potential Challenges and Risks:
- Automobile dependent environment
- Exacerbating bridge congestion
- Financial sustainability
Leverage Opportunities

Provide high-quality transit: More Muni service, new ferry service, new East Bay transit service, and an on-island shuttle.

Promote walking and biking: Bike lanes, pedestrian paths, bike stations.

Deliver Equity: Subsidized transit passes and discounts to services like car and bike share.
Manage Risks

Limit the need for a car: Provide multiple options for reliable, safe, and affordable multi-modal trips within and on/off the island.

Incentivize mode choices: Associate the cost of a trip based on its impact to travel time and air quality.

Afford options beyond Muni: Use revenue from drivers to pay for ferry and East Bay transit.
TIMMA Program Milestone Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Start Date</th>
<th>End Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Toll/TDM/Equity Policy</td>
<td>Sep-20</td>
<td>Apr-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southgate (Toll Locations 1, 2, and 3)</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Nov-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network Comms Phase 1</td>
<td>Oct-21</td>
<td>May-23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toll System Integrator Phase 1</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Dec-23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit Service (SFMTA, East Bay, Intra-Island Shuttle, Ferry)</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Jul-24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit Pass Program</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Jan-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking Program</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Jan-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Westside Bridges (Locations 4 and 5)</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Jan-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toll System Integrator Phase 2</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Jan-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AV Shuttle Pilot</td>
<td>Mar-21</td>
<td>Jan-25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Approved:
- Current Resident Exemption

In Progress for Approval:
- Mobility Support for Critical Housing & Food Services
  - Affordable Housing Nonprofits
  - Food Distribution & Service Establishments

Under Evaluation:
- Future Low-Income Travelers (residents and non-residents)
Equity Program Outreach

1:1 facilitator interviews with current businesses and workers

Co-creation workshops with

- Affordable housing program workers
- Commercial businessowners and workers

Resulted in “long list” of potential affordability supports, both toll-related and non-toll-related
Toll Policy Development Objectives

- Clarify operational details for toll system business rules
- Consistency with land use plan
- Prevent barriers to benefits for eligible residents
- Reduce likelihood of fraud or abuse
- Manage administrative cost and predict revenue effects
Current Resident Exemption
Eligibility
All Options

Lease dated on or before 11/19/2019 (policy approval) that is still valid at the time tolling commences

New leases that maintain the original leaseholder(s) who qualify for relocation assistance per TIDA

Policy to be revisited at 4000-unit development milestone (FY2029)
Option #1
One Toll Tag Per Lease

One free toll tag per lease
Unlimited trips

Note: Tags only valid on Treasure Island; invalid form of payment for all other toll facilities.
Option #1
Program Enrollment

- TIDA will verify each eligible household (leaseholder)
- TIMMA contacts each leaseholder for enrollment.
- Requires leaseholder registration (with contact information) to receive a TIMMA-owned toll tag
- TIMMA distributes toll tags free of charge along with a License and Use Agreement
- Employees with existing toll tags may register their tag with TIMMA
- Annual registration renewal required
Option #2
Two License Plates per Lease

TIMMA can exempt up to two license plates per lease
Requires proof of parking
Option #2
Program Enrollment

- TIDA will verify each eligible household (leaseholder) and vehicle
- TIMMA must contact each leaseholder for enrollment
- Requires leaseholder registration with license plate, proof of parking, and contact information
- Annual registration renewal required
Alternatives Analysis (Current Resident Exemption)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPROACH</th>
<th>BENEFIT PRIORITIZES NEEDIEST</th>
<th>LAND USE PLAN CONSISTENCY</th>
<th>ADMINISTRATIVE EFFICIENCY</th>
<th>PREDICTABLE COST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One Toll Tag per lease</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Vehicle(s) with Parking Space</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(via license plate)</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Option #1
Program Cost

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COST COMPONENT</th>
<th>5-YEAR TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct Expenses (upfront capital and ongoing operations)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Purchasing FasTrak tags (if needed)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Coordinating with BATA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Setting up accounts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Managing inventory and distributing tags</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Outreach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Communicating with participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Program account database</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Setting up program reporting and evaluation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foregone Revenue (Estimated)</td>
<td>$9M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Option #2
### Program Cost

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COST COMPONENT</th>
<th>5-YEAR TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct Expenses (upfront capital and ongoing operations)</td>
<td>$1M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Purchasing FasTrak tags (if needed)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Coordinating with BATA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Setting up accounts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Managing inventory and distributing tags</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Outreach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Communicating with participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Program account database</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Setting up program reporting and evaluation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• License plate and parking validation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foregone Revenue (Estimated)</td>
<td>$12M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mobility Support for Critical Housing & Food Services
Eligibility: Affordable Housing Nonprofits and Food Businesses

One Treasure Island (OTI) member organizations, per the DDA

Includes Daycare run by Catholic Charities (OTI member)

Existing Food Distribution & Service Establishments

Policy to be revisited at development milestones (earlier of 2500 units or FY27)
Option #1
Mobility Cash

Quarterly (e.g.) cash payment to eligible businesses
Flexible use for commuters, visitors
Minimum share to support low-income workers
No toll tag handling required
Scaled at $600 per quarter per FTE (one peak round trip 5x per week)
Option #1
Program
Enrollment

TIDA will verify eligible businesses
TIMMA will distribute Mobility Cash to businesses

Businesses will

● Verify number of FTEs
● Distribute Mobility Cash among commuters, suppliers, and/or customers
● Submit proof of cash disbursement to employees
Option #2
Toll Tags

One toll tag per low-income employee

Employees with existing toll tags may register their tag with TIMMA

Pre-filled to fund one round trip daily, 5 times per week
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business Responsibilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provide proof of number of low-income workers employed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recover toll tags from workers upon termination of employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report missing toll tags to TIMMA for decommissioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redistribute toll tags to new hires</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Option #2, Program Enrollment

TIMMA will

- verify number of low-income employees
- Register employees (with contact information) to receive a TIMMA-owned toll tag
- Distribute toll tags free of charge to each business, along with a License and Use Agreement

Businesses will

- Provide proof of employment and income
## Mobility Support Options: Program Cost

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPTION</th>
<th>DIRECT EXPENSES, PROJECTED TOTAL OVER 5 YEARS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1, Mobility Cash to businesses based on FTEs</td>
<td>~$1.67M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2, Toll Tags for Low Income Workers</td>
<td>~$2M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Approach Analysis (Critical Housing and Food Services)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPROACH</th>
<th>BENEFIT PRIORITY NEEDIEST</th>
<th>LAND USE PLAN CONSISTENCY</th>
<th>ADMINISTRATIVE EFFICIENCY</th>
<th>PREDICTABLE COST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mobility Cash per FTE</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toll Tag per low-income worker</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next Steps

- Outreach to current residents, businesses, and workers
- Further develop policy for future low-income HHs, consistent with direction of Downtown SF Congestion Pricing Study
- Consider adoption of current resident and business benefits
- Fundraising
# Proposed Outreach

## BUSINESSES / EMPLOYEES

**December 2020 – January 2021**
- Direct conversations with:
  - Food services
  - One Treasure Island members
  - Treasure Island Organizing Committee

**January 2021**
- Co-creation for businesses & workers to refine affordability program options

## RESIDENT

**December 2020 – January 2021**
- Publicize toll exemption for current residents
- Survey preferences for exemption options

**February 2021 – March 2021**
- TIMMA Committee considers adoption of Current Resident and Current Business affordability programs
- Co-creation for the Downtown Congestion Pricing Study
Outreach Publicity

Participation at bi-monthly housing providers’ Community Meeting

Mailers

Social media

On-Island flyers, including at Food Pantry pickup

Existing email lists
Future Low-Income Travelers
Future Residents and Employees

Potential Benefits (consistent with direction of the Downtown SF Congestion Pricing Study):

- Affordable transit pass (50% of market rate pass)
- Transit incentives
- Toll discount
  - 100% toll discount for Very Low Income HHs
  - 50% toll discount for Low Income HHs
Thank you.

www.timma.org