



RESOLUTION AFFIRMING THE SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY'S COMMITMENT TO SUPPORTING EFFORTS TO IMPROVE COST-EFFECTIVENESS AND TO ADVANCE EQUITY IN PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AND DELIVERY FOR CERTAIN SAN FRANCISCO PROJECTS PROPOSED FOR INCLUSION IN PLAN BAY AREA 2050

WHEREAS, Every four years, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission and the Association of Bay Area Governments (MTC/ABAG) are required to develop and adopt a Regional Transportation Plan and Sustainable Communities Strategy, called Plan Bay Area or PBA, to guide the region's long-term transportation investments and establish land-use priorities across all nine counties; and

WHEREAS, The next PBA, known as PBA 2050, must establish a strategy to meet the region's greenhouse gas emission reduction targets and accommodate the region's projected household and employment growth through 2050; and

WHEREAS, As Congestion Management Agency (CMAs) for San Francisco, the Transportation Authority is responsible for coordinating with local and regional partner agencies to establish San Francisco's priorities for inclusion in PBA; and

WHEREAS, On July 23, 2019, through Resolution 20-06, the Transportation Authority approved goals to guide San Francisco's work on PBA 2050 (Attachment 1) and throughout the process, staff has worked in close coordination with local transportation agencies and regional transit providers to develop San Francisco's input into PBA 2050; and

WHEREAS, On April 14, 2020, through Resolution 2043, the Transportation Authority approved a draft list of projects from San Francisco to submit to MTC for inclusion in PBA 2050; and

WHEREAS, Consistent with MTC/ABAG guidance, most projects are included in PBA through programmatic categories and typically, projects are only listed as specific named projects when required to do so for air quality conformity purposes (e.g. for major transit or roadway expansion projects); and

WHEREAS, As one part of its process, MTC staff conducted a project



performance assessment on large, regionally transformative projects, defined as projects over \$250 million in capital costs and that increase capacity on the region's transportation system; and

WHEREAS, Among other aspects, the project performance assessment included a cost/benefit analysis and identification of equity challenges defined as projects for which MTC's model shows high- and moderate-income residents receiving more transportation benefits than low-income residents; and

WHEREAS, Based on its project performance assessment, MTC staff identified high-profile, regionally-significant projects that have potential cost-effectiveness and/or equity challenges including the six San Francisco project priorities shown in Attachment 2; and

WHEREAS, As a prerequisite for these projects to seek regional discretionary funds, MTC has requested that each CMA affirm through a board action its commitment to supporting efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and to advance equity in the project development and delivery phases; and

WHEREAS, Transportation Authority staff worked closely with project sponsors including the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, San Francisco Public Works, the Transbay Joint Powers Authority, Caltrain, and MTC to document existing and future efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and to advance equity for the projects as shown in Attachment 2; and

WHEREAS, MTC staff also asked the eight agencies collaborating on the Regional Express Lanes project, which includes the US-101/I-280 Express Lanes and Bus Project, to approve a joint letter making commitments to improve the project's greenhouse gas emission, cost effectiveness, and equity performance (Attachment 3); and

WHEREAS, At its July 22, 2020 meeting, the Citizens Advisory Committee was briefed on the Transportation Authority's commitment to supporting efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and advance equity in project development and delivery for certain San Francisco projects proposed for inclusion in PBA 2050 as described in Attachments 2 and 3; now; therefore, be it



RESOLVED, That the Transportation Authority hereby affirms its commitment to working collaboratively with project sponsors, MTC and other agencies and to supporting efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and to advance equity in project development and delivery for certain San Francisco projects proposed for inclusion in PBA 2050 as described in Attachments 2 and 3; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Executive Director is directed to submit this resolution to MTC/ABAG and other interested parties.

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 - San Francisco Goals for PBA 2050
- Attachment 2 - Efforts to Improve Cost Effectiveness and Advance Equity for Certain San Francisco Project Priorities Proposed for PBA 2050
- Attachment 3 - Joint Letter of Project Performance Commitments for the Regional Express Lanes Project

Attachment 1.
San Francisco Goals for Plan Bay Area (PBA) 2050 (June 20, 2019)

Goals	Notes
1. Ensure that all San Francisco projects and programs that need to be in PBA 2050 in order to advance are included	<p>Projects need to be included in PBA 2050 if they:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need a federal action (e.g. federal environmental approval) or wish to seek state or federal funds before 2025 when the next PBA will be adopted • Trigger federal air quality conformity analysis (e.g. projects that change capacity of transit or major roadways)
2. Advocate strongly for more investment in transit state of good repair to support existing communities and new growth	Coordinate with the “Big 3 Cities” accepting most of the job and housing growth in PBA and regional and local transit operators
3. Advocate for increased shares of existing revenues for San Francisco priorities (partial list at right)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BART Core Capacity • Better Market Street • Blended High Speed Rail/Caltrain service from San Jose to the Transbay Transit Center • Downtown Rail Extension • Geary BRT • Muni fleet and facilities expansion • Muni Forward • Vision Zero (support eligibility for MTC fund programs) • Placeholders for transit expansion planning (e.g. west side rail, 19th Avenue/M-Line, Central Subway extension, etc.)
4. Advocate for new revenues for transportation and housing, and continue advocacy for San Francisco priorities in new expenditure plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regional transportation measure(s) • Regional housing measure(s) • State road user charge (monitor pilots) • Federal surface transportation bill
5. Support performance-based decision-making	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support transparent reporting on strategy and project performance evaluation metrics, including impact on vehicles miles travelled • Continue advocating for a better way of capturing of transit crowding in PBA evaluation, key to transit core capacity issues • Advocate for discretionary funds for high-performing and regionally significant San Francisco projects
6. Support coordinated transportation and land use planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advocate for regional policies to support jurisdictions accepting their fair share of housing and employment growth, especially in areas with existing or planned transit service to support new growth • Advocate for more funds to support Priority Development Area planning

Attachment 1.
San Francisco Goals for Plan Bay Area (PBA) 2050 (June 20, 2019)

Goals	Notes
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support update to the Regional Transit Expansion Policy to reflect appropriate land use requirements as a prerequisite for regional endorsement and investment
7. Focus on equity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Access to transportation – Late Night Transportation Study, Prosperity Plan • Affordability – MTC Means-Based Pilot, BART university pass/discount • Communities of Concern – Continue Community Based Transportation Planning grant program, more funds for Lifeline Transportation Program • Housing/Displacement – Work with the Board, Mayor, SF agencies, etc. to develop recommendations for planning, production, and preservation of affordable housing and to prevent/mitigate displacement • Vision Zero – SFTP 2040 demonstrated that communities of concern experience disproportionately high rates of pedestrian and bike injuries. Continue to advocate for regional Vision Zero policies and investments.
8. Support comprehensive, multimodal planning for the region’s network of carpool and express lanes	Develop a regional carpool/express lane vision that includes regional/local express transit service
9. Continue to show leadership in evaluating and planning for emerging mobility solutions and technologies	To the extent PBA 2050 addresses this topic, provide input to shape and lead on regional policy on emerging mobility services and technologies, including shared mobility and autonomous vehicles
10. Provide San Francisco input to shape and lead on other regional policy topics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sea level rise/adaption • Economic performance and access to jobs

**Attachment 2 – Efforts to Improve Cost-Effectiveness and Advance Equity
For Certain San Francisco Project Priorities Proposed for PBA 2050**

Project	PBA 2050 Project Flags	Efforts to Improve Cost Effectiveness and Advance Equity	Next Steps	Supports Regional Strategies
Downtown Caltrain Extension (DTX)	Low benefit/ cost score	California High Speed Rail (HSR) interregional benefits not included in scoring	Continue working with regional and state partners on HSR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make strategic modernization & expansion investments in public transit • Extend the regional rail network • Build a new Transbay rail crossing
		Caltrain’s Enhanced Service Growth plan provides more service to support the DTX and reduces crowding	Support Caltrain’s Enhanced Growth plan in PBA 2050 along with the DTX	
		Connection to a potential second transbay tube improves score	Support regional planning for a second transbay tube	
		The Downtown Extension Project Expert Panel made a series of recommendations to improve the project and project delivery. The DTX MOU partners have committed to examining the project’s cost-effectiveness consistent with that report, including considering cost reduction, phasing and project delivery strategies and strengthening funding plans to identify an initial operating segment that can be constructed in the next 10-12 years.	All of the DTX MOU have committed to continue to support improvements to improve project benefits and reduce cost.	
	Equity challenge	Caltrain is participating in the Regional Means-Based Fare Program Pilot to provide a 50% discount to low-income transit riders (as approved by the PCJPB)	Support the Regional Pilot and the advancement of other recommendations from Caltrain’s Equity Analysis	
Treasure Island Tolling and Mobility Program	Increases travel costs for lower income residents	In December 2019, the TIMMA Board approved a toll exemption for disproportionately low-income current Treasure Island residents	Continue seeking program funding to offset toll rates for all users. Significant local (developer fees, etc), state (AHSC), and federal (ATCMTD) funding has been committed to the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enable seamless mobility with unified trip planning and fare programs • Reform regional transit fare policy • Implement per-mile tolling on congested freeways with transit alternatives
		The SFMTA has the most robust means-based transit fare pass programs in the region, and is participating in MTC’s regional means-based pilot program	SFMTA’s transit fare programs are in the agency’s adopted budgets	

**Attachment 2 – Efforts to Improve Cost-Effectiveness and Advance Equity
For Certain San Francisco Project Priorities Proposed for PBA 2050**

Project	PBA 2050 Project Flags	Efforts to Improve Cost Effectiveness and Advance Equity	Next Steps	Supports Regional Strategies
	Equity challenge	An affordability program will include subsidized multi-operator transit passes and discounts to services such as car and bike share for low-income residents	Continue planning, anticipating final program adoption in late 2020	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build a complete streets network • Advance regional Vision Zero policy • Advance low-cost transit projects • Make strategic modernization & expansion investments for public transit
Downtown Congestion Pricing Program	Increases travel costs for lower income residents	One of the goals of the current study is to advance equity by improving health and transportation access for disadvantaged communities. The current study's metrics to evaluate the equity performance of program alternatives include travel costs, with the target of maintaining travel costs as a percent of household income for low-income households.	Continue the Downtown Congestion Pricing Study, with additional outreach to traditionally under-represented communities. The SFCTA's study is scheduled to be completed in early 2021.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement per-mile tolling on congested freeways with transit alternatives • Build a complete streets network • Advance regional Vision Zero policy • Make strategic modernization & expansion investments for public transit
		The SFMTA has the most robust means-based transit fare pass programs in the region, and is participating in MTC's regional means-based pilot program	SFMTA's transit fare programs are in the agency's adopted budgets	
	Equity challenge	The current study's metrics to evaluate the equity performance of program alternatives include several metrics to ensure program benefits are focused on low-income travelers and Communities of Concern.	Continue the Downtown Congestion Pricing Study, with additional outreach to traditionally under-represented communities. The SFCTA's study is scheduled to be completed in early 2021.	

**Attachment 2 – Efforts to Improve Cost-Effectiveness and Advance Equity
For Certain San Francisco Project Priorities Proposed for PBA 2050**

Project	PBA 2050 Project Flags	Efforts to Improve Cost Effectiveness and Advance Equity	Next Steps	Supports Regional Strategies
<p>Regional Express Lanes and Bus Program, SF Link</p> <p><i>See Attachment 3 for Joint Letter of Project Performance Commitments for the Regional Express Lanes Project which will include the San Francisco Link.</i></p>	Low benefit/cost score	The Transportation Authority is only considering lane conversions, not expansions, for our express lanes facility, specifically, a “bus on shoulder” and “take a lane” option for the northbound and southbound directions, respectively. Project studies are also looking at other strategies to decrease implementation and operating costs.	MTC recommends that PBA 2050 include a Bay Area Express Lanes project definition which includes the SF link. Depending on how the draft performs with respect to GHG emissions, MTC may revise the project definition to exclude segments outside of SF that aren’t lane conversions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement per-mile tolling on congested freeways with transit alternatives • Advance low-cost transit projects • Make strategic modernization & expansion investments for public transit • Build carpool lanes & address interchange bottlenecks • Advance regional Vision Zero policy
	Increases travel costs for lower income residents	The SFCTA remains committed to including local Muni express bus service as part of the US-101/I-280 Express Lanes and Bus Project, and have included increased service in the project definition currently under environmental review.	Transportation Authority Board requested staff conduct a project Equity Study which will engage adjacent neighborhoods and vulnerable communities to help design project pricing features and policies to ensure equitable outcomes	
		The SFMTA has the most robust means-based transit fare pass programs in the region, and is participating in MTC’s regional means-based pilot program. The SFCTA also supports the development of integrated transit fare payment platforms needed to implement affordability policies and provide incentives for using transit, ridesharing, and first/last mile services.	SFMTA’s transit fare programs are in the agency’s adopted budgets.	

**Attachment 2 – Efforts to Improve Cost-Effectiveness and Advance Equity
For Certain San Francisco Project Priorities Proposed for PBA 2050**

Project	PBA 2050 Project Flags	Efforts to Improve Cost Effectiveness and Advance Equity	Next Steps	Supports Regional Strategies
	Equity challenge	<p>SFMTA considers this project to be an Equity Strategy priority, as they have identified an existing equity gap for the 8X and 14X Muni bus lines due to unreliable bus performance in this highly congested corridor</p> <p>The SFCTA participates in the regional working group for the Bay Area Express Lanes Network, which recognizes that equity is a key issue for the network.</p>	<p>Increased service on the Muni 14X and 8X routes, which currently use the facility, and as well as the future Hunters Point and Candlestick Point express routes would benefit transit users in the numerous communities of concern in southeast San Francisco, whose residents tend to be lower-income than the city's population overall.</p> <p>The working group is supportive of means-based tolling as one of various strategies in PBA 2050 that could address equity. In the near-term the working group supports a BAIFA-led pilot of means-based tolling. The working group is also identifying how the network can best support existing and potential future public transit services, including a regional express bus network and complementary transit that serves low income travelers. Other equity strategies the working group is exploring include targeted incentives (e.g. toll credit for transit use), active mobility projects/programs, and job access improvements for communities of concern.</p>	

**Attachment 2 – Efforts to Improve Cost-Effectiveness and Advance Equity
For Certain San Francisco Project Priorities Proposed for PBA 2050**

Project	PBA 2050 Project Flags	Efforts to Improve Cost Effectiveness and Advance Equity	Next Steps	Supports Regional Strategies
Geary Boulevard Transportation Improvements	Equity challenge	The Muni Equity Strategy identifies the 38/38R (Geary) route as an Equity line, serving a neighborhood with high percentages of households with low incomes and people of color.	Support the SFMTA’s Muni Service Equity Strategy, an ongoing effort to improve service performance in eight Equity Strategy neighborhoods.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build a complete streets network • Advance regional Vision Zero policy through street design and reduced speeds • Advance low-cost transit projects • Build a next generation bus rapid transit network • Make strategic modernization & expansion investments for public transit
		The SFMTA has the most robust means-based transit fare pass programs in the region, and is participating in MTC’s regional means-based pilot program	SFMTA’s transit fare programs are in the agency’s adopted budgets	
Better Market Street	Project not assessed but flagged for high cost	<p>Better Market Street is a pre-eminent example of how to build a complete street that prioritizes the movement of people over the movement of vehicles, with the goal of achieving zero traffic fatalities along the facility. It is a multi-agency project to transform 2.2 miles of Market Street by enhancing safety and accessibility, improving transit reliability, replacing aging infrastructure, and revitalizing the corridor’s streetscape.</p> <p>SFMTA and SF Public Works are the lead agencies on this project, and are currently analyzing the benefits of the Market Street Quick Build / Car-free Market, and are evaluating the first phase of Better Market Street. The agencies also plan to revise the project’s budget and scope following this assessment, including value engineering and phasing recommendations.</p>	The Transportation Authority is a funding partner for this project, and will continue to work with SFMTA and SF Public Works to improve the project’s benefits while decreasing costs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build a complete streets network • Advance regional Vision Zero policy through street design and reduced speeds • Make strategic modernization & expansion investments for public transit • Increase existing rail capacity and frequency by modernizing the network

Attachment 3 - Joint Letter of Project Performance
Commitments for the Regional Express Lanes Project

August 1, 2020

Therese W. McMillan
Executive Director
Metropolitan Transportation Commission
375 Beale Street Suite 700
San Francisco, CA 94105

RE: Bay Area Express Lanes Project Performance in Plan Bay Area 2050

Dear Ms. McMillan:

This letter is in response to the Plan Bay Area 2050 Project Performance Assessment (PPA) findings for the Regional Express Lanes Network. The PPA indicated a few performance shortcomings for the Regional Express Lanes Network, including underperforming benefit-cost ratios, equity and GHG scores. We are writing to convey the regional plan to address these underperformance issues.

For the last year, a working group consisting of Bay Area Express Lanes partners has met to develop an Express Lanes Strategic Plan. This group is collaborating to shape the future of the Express Lanes Network, consistent with the vision and goals of Plan Bay Area 2050. We believe it shows promising benefits if integrated cost-effectively with transit, affordability, and other Plan Bay Area programs. The working group recently developed network scenarios that integrate Plan Bay Area goals and presented them to the MTC Operations Committee in May for Commissioner feedback. Having implemented the recommended changes and presented to the MTC Operations Committee in June, the working group will soon submit a revised Regional Express Lane Network for inclusion into Plan Bay Area 2050.

This letter demonstrates the working group's commitment to improving the network's cost effectiveness, equity and GHG reduction performance while meeting Federal and State operational requirements by: prioritizing segments that support transit/carpooling and provide seamless travel, incorporating projects that utilize conversion of existing right of way over expansion where possible, committing to a means-based toll discount pilot, and implementing public engagement best practices. In addition to revising the Network for Plan Bay Area 2050, the group plans to develop a series of white papers over the summer of 2020 to inform policies and future project development. The outcomes of these white papers along with the revised Regional Express Lanes Network will be documented in a final Regional Express Lanes Strategic Plan at the end of 2020. Some highlights of work to date and upcoming work include:

Increasing Benefits; Decreasing Costs

The working group is revising the Regional Express Lanes Network to reflect:

- Segments that can more realistically be built in the next 15 years as well as the next 30 years based on available funds, including local funding commitments to project development and construction, and financing. For example, the costly 580/680 and 680/80 direct connectors most likely will not fit within the funding envelope for this period.
- Segments that support existing and potential future public transit services that advance the equity and GHG goals outlined in the Strategic Plan.

Attachment 3 - Joint Letter of Project Performance Commitments for the Regional Express Lanes Project

- Prioritization of HOV lane and general-purpose lane conversions (pending changes in legislation and traffic impact analysis) over construction of new lanes to reduce per-mile capital cost and the risk of induced demand/GHG. For example, Ala-580, SF-101/280, SCL 680/280 and SM-101 will evaluate take-a-lane and/or shoulder lane strategies as potential alternatives during the environmental process to evaluate impacts on GHG emissions and operations. Where new lanes are added, it may be possible to use paved right of way to reduce costs.

Local Funding

Express lanes bring considerable resources to the table to fund their construction, operations and maintenance. This sets them apart from other transportation management strategies.

- The express lanes operating and maintenance costs are covered by express lanes toll revenue and require no regional funds to keep the express lanes in a state of good repair.
- There is \$300 million in capital funding set aside for the express lanes network in Regional Measure 3. MTC is proposing a framework for local RM3 express lane funding to leverage state and federal funding to the greatest extent possible.
- The county transportation agencies plan to leverage over \$80 million in local funds to build the Regional Express Lanes Network.
- Express lane toll revenue can be used to finance the buildout of the network. The financial analysis used in Plan Bay Area 2040 demonstrated the ability to finance up to 60% of the total capital cost. In addition, several projects already in operation and under construction have financed a share of their capital costs with future toll revenue.

Green House Gas

To decrease GHG emissions, the working group is focusing on projects and programs that increase mode shift and average vehicle occupancy, including:

- Focusing on early delivery of projects with a high potential for express bus ridership and identifying policies that support future express bus service.
- Exploring the use of express lane revenues to support investments in express buses, mobility hubs and other investments to increase bus ridership and carpooling.
- Prioritizing projects that convert existing travel lanes (general-purpose and HOV lanes) to mitigate induced vehicles miles traveled and achieve GHG reduction goals. A white paper will be developed that looks in more detail on the impacts of interregional express lanes segments and dual express lane segments on VMT/GHG.

Equity

The working group recognizes that equity is a key objective for the Express Lanes Network and is supportive of means-based tolling as one of various strategies in Plan Bay Area 2050 that could address equity. In the near-term, the working group supports a BAIFA-led pilot of means-based tolling on BAIFA's express lanes. At the same time, San Mateo and SFCTA are undertaking studies to better understand and advance equity. These studies may result in additional pilots that complement BAIFA's pilot.

Attachment 3 - Joint Letter of Project Performance
Commitments for the Regional Express Lanes Project

Plan Bay Area Concepts

In addition, the express lane partner agencies support high-performing policies and projects in the Plan Bay Area 2050 Draft Blueprint:

- Eventual transition to congestion pricing on all freeway lanes in corridors with robust transit options. Express lanes can be a stepping stone to more extensive congestion pricing strategies. Prior to such implementation, further investigation is needed to better understand how congestion pricing on freeways may be implemented and the potential impacts on express lane operations as well as local roadways and transit.
- Lowering the speed limit to 55 miles per hour on freeways to improve safety. During congested periods the general-purpose lanes typically flow well below that speed, and so the express lanes could still offer a travel time and reliability advantage.
- Expansion of local bus services and non-motorized modes that serve shorter trips of all types and thus complement express lanes and express bus service, which tend to serve longer, largely commute trips.
- Integrated transit fares and payment platforms, which can help implement affordability policies and provide incentives for using transit, ridesharing and first and last mile services.

As a region, we are committed to implementing an Express Lane Network that serves the community and the surrounding environment equitably, cost-effectively and sustainably in order to advance the goals of Plan Bay Area 2050. We look forward to hearing your thoughts and discussing this further. If you have any questions about this format, please contact Jim Macrae at jmacrae@bayareametro.gov.

Sincerely,

ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCE AUTHORITY

Tess Lengyel, Executive Director

Andrew B. Fremier, Deputy Executive Director,
Operations

Date:

Date:

Attachment 3 - Joint Letter of Project Performance
Commitments for the Regional Express Lanes Project

SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
AUTHORITY

SAN MATEO CITY/COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF
GOVERNMENTS (C/CAG)

Tilly Chang, Executive Director

Sandy Wong, Executive Director

Date:

Date:

SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
AUTHORITY

SAN MATEO COUNTY EXPRESS LANES JOINT
POWERS AUTHORITY (SMCEL-JPA)

Jim Hartnett, Executive Director

Jim Hartnett, Executive Council

Date:

Date:

SAN MATEO COUNTY EXPRESS LANES JOINT
POWERS AUTHORITY (SMCEL-JPA)

SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION
AUTHORITY (VTA)

Sandy Wong, Executive Council

Deborah Dagang, Director of Planning and
Programming

Date:

Date:



Memorandum

AGENDA ITEM 7

DATE: July 9, 2020
TO: Transportation Authority Board
FROM: Maria Lombardo - Chief Deputy Director
SUBJECT: July/14/2020 Board Meeting: Affirm the San Francisco County Transportation Authority's Commitment to Supporting Efforts to Improve Cost-Effectiveness and to Advance Equity in Project Development and Delivery for Certain San Francisco Projects Proposed for Inclusion in Plan Bay Area 2050

<p>RECOMMENDATION <input type="checkbox"/> Information <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Action</p> <p>Affirm the San Francisco County Transportation Authority's commitment to supporting efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and to advance equity through project development and delivery for certain San Francisco projects proposed for inclusion in Plan Bay Area (PBA) 2050.</p> <p>SUMMARY</p> <p>For the past two years, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission and the Association of Bay Area Governments (MTC/ABAG) have been undergoing a multi-step process to establish land use, transportation, economic, and environmental strategies and investments to meet ambitious greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction targets through the year 2050 as part of development of PBA 2050. As the Congestion Management Agency (CMA) for San Francisco, the Transportation Authority establishes San Francisco's transportation priorities for inclusion in PBA. In April, the Transportation Authority Board approved a draft fiscally constrained project list to submit to MTC for inclusion in PBA 2050. MTC staff conducted a project performance assessment on a subset of large, regionally transformative projects (e.g. greater than \$250 million). Based on its project performance assessment, MTC staff identified high-profile, regionally-significant projects that have potential cost-effectiveness and/or equity challenges including six San Francisco project priorities. As a prerequisite for these projects to seek regional discretionary funds, MTC has requested that each CMA affirm through a board action its commitment to supporting efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and to advance equity in project development and delivery of these projects. Attachments 2 and 3 to the resolution document existing and future efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and to advance equity for the relevant projects.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Fund Allocation <input type="checkbox"/> Fund Programming <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Policy/Legislation <input type="checkbox"/> Plan/Study <input type="checkbox"/> Capital Project Oversight/Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Budget/Finance <input type="checkbox"/> Contract/Agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____
---	--



BACKGROUND

Every four years, MTC/ABAG are required to develop and adopt a Regional Transportation Plan and Sustainable Communities Strategy, called Plan Bay Area or PBA, to guide the region's long-term transportation investments and establish land-use priorities across all nine counties. The regional agencies adopted the last update in 2017, called PBA 2040.

The next PBA, known as PBA 2050, must establish a strategy to meet the region's GHG emission reduction target and accommodate the region's projected household and employment growth through 2050. It includes a transportation strategy that must only include investments that fit within a reasonable fund estimate, among other requirements.

MTC/ABAG staff began the PBA update effort with Horizon in early 2018, which is a broadly scoped planning effort that explored how economic, environmental, technological, and political uncertainties may create new challenges for the Bay Area over the coming decade. This work is now being used to inform the transportation and land use decisions in PBA 2050 which was officially launched in September 2019.

On July 23, 2019, through Resolution 20-06, the Transportation Authority Board approved goals to guide our work on PBA 2050 shown in Attachment 1 to the draft resolution. Throughout the process, we have worked in close coordination with local transportation agencies and regional transit providers to develop San Francisco's input into PBA 2050.

In our role as the county Congestion Management Agency (CMA) for San Francisco, the Transportation Authority submitted a draft project and program list for MTC/ABAG's consideration to include in PBA 2050, as approved by the Transportation Authority Board on April 14, 2020. These projects are listed in memo Attachment 2.

Consistency with PBA. Consistency with PBA is important from a very practical project development perspective: it is a requirement to receive state and federal funds and certain federal approvals such as a Record of Decision for an environmental document. However, most transportation projects in San Francisco do not need to be listed as stand-alone projects in PBA, only those that significantly change capacity of the transportation system at a regional scale and trigger air quality conformity analysis. The vast majority of projects can be grouped into programmatic categories, which provides flexibility to accommodate new priorities that may arise between quadrennial PBA updates, as well as to deal with unexpected cost increases while keeping within San Francisco's fiscally constrained target. In short, San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained List of Projects and Programmatic Categories provided in Attachment 2 includes:

- Projects—ONLY projects that are required to be listed by MTC/ABAG to comply with air quality conformity analysis needs, and/or have high project costs (e.g. over \$250 million)
- Programmatic categories—the majority of projects are included in these groupings, such as bike and pedestrian infrastructure, safety and security improvements, and planning and engineering work for future transit or roadway projects.

For any new projects that would qualify as regionally significant under MTC/ABAG's definition but are not included on this list, planning and environmental design work could proceed



under one of the programmatic categories until the next PBA is adopted in 2025. For example, this applies to new transportation expansion priorities being identified through the ConnectSF process. Per MTC/ABAG guidance, projects completed by 2021 are not included in the project lists as they are considered part of the baseline.

DISCUSSION

MTC Project Performance Assessment. After collecting the nine Bay Area CMAAs' fiscally constrained project lists, MTC/ABAG staff have begun to develop recommendations for which projects to include in PBA, and for assigning discretionary regional funding (including regional, state, and federal funding not distributed to local jurisdictions via formula) to projects.

One input to this effort, is the project performance assessment MTC conducted on large, regionally transformative projects, defined as projects over \$250 million in capital costs and that increase capacity on the region's transportation systems. Among other aspects, the project performance assessment included a cost/benefit analysis and identification of equity challenges defined as projects for which MTC's model shows high- and moderate-income residents receiving more transportation benefits than low-income residents.

In general, most of the large projects across the region did not perform well due to high costs. For some projects, shortcomings in the way that the regional model and methodology captured benefits further impacted the performance results. Additionally, many projects were flagged for equity concerns because the model showed that high- and moderate-income residents would receive more transportation benefits than low-income residents. We are very supportive of the focus on equity and affordability, but note that the evaluation of San Francisco projects was particularly adversely impacted by factors such as not including Muni's existing means-based fare policies, which are the gold standard in the region, not taking into account San Francisco's higher rent burden in conjunction with higher average income, and not considering the benefits of improved transit reliability. Other limitations of the analysis methodology are noted below for each project.

We worked with project sponsors to support San Francisco's submissions to the project performance assessment process for large, regionally transformative projects. Several of the city's priorities did well in MTC's cost-effectiveness and equity assessments including Muni Forward, Southeast Waterfront Transportation Improvements (to support development in that part of the city), and BART's Core Capacity project. MTC staff recommends those projects be included in PBA and hasn't requested further action at this time. However, several San Francisco projects were flagged through this performance assessment process. These projects and the project performance issues MTC raised are summarized below:

- Downtown Congestion Pricing, Treasure Island Mobility Program, and Regional Express Lanes (including San Francisco's link) were all flagged for equity concerns, due to potential impact of tolling on low-income travelers. The MTC analysis of the Downtown Congestion Pricing project did not reflect the disproportionate impacts of congestion, which the project would help alleviate, on low-income, vulnerable groups in the downtown core including: a) bus rider delay, b) higher rates of severe and fatal traffic collisions, c) exposure to elevated vehicle emissions. The analysis of the



Treasure Island project did not reflect equitable pricing policies such as the existing resident exemption that the Transportation Authority acting in its capacity as the Treasure Island Mobility Management Authority adopted last December. Finally, for the Regional Express Lanes project, Commissioner Ronen has pressed for greater attention to equity impacts and mitigation policies in her capacity on the MTC, and MTC staff have strengthened equity in the project's goals framework, outreach approach and design (e.g. staff propose a means-based toll pilot program). *MTC staff is recommending these projects be included in the plan, given San Francisco's commitment to advancing equity through project design for all three.*

- Geary Bus Rapid Transit was flagged for equity, due to forecasted higher-income population in San Francisco (e.g. so more benefits accrued to higher income people across the region than lower income). *MTC staff is recommending this project be included in PBA, given the corridor's importance in the Muni Equity Strategy, and given Muni's existing means-based transit fare discount programs, which weren't incorporated into its model assumptions.*
- Downtown Caltrain Rail Extension (DTX) was flagged for cost-effectiveness, due to the high project cost, and for equity concerns, based on generally high-income ridership on Caltrain. MTC's analysis did not fully capture the benefits of inter-regional High Speed Rail (though a proxy Caltrain service was assumed), nor the full network benefits of DTX with *both* a New Transbay Rail Crossing and Caltrain/High Speed Rail Enhanced Growth (which we hope will be reflected in PBA. We agree the project cost is high and warrants review per our DTX Peer Review study findings last year. Six agencies including the Transportation Authority and MTC have signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) to work together to, among other objectives, improve the project's cost-effectiveness including considering cost reduction, phasing, and project delivery strategies and strengthening the funding plan. At the same time, Caltrain's board has committed to participating in the Regional Means-Based Transit Pilot Program, including funding a 50% fare discount for low income riders, and to increase midday frequencies supporting non-work travel, which help to address MTC's equity concerns. We have been supporting this at the staff level and Commissioner Walton, in his capacity as a Caltrain Director, has been a strong voice for increasing the affordability of Caltrain for those who need it. *MTC staff recommending including this project in PBA, specifically in Period 2 (2036-2050) of the plan. We are working with the Transbay Joint Powers Authority, Caltrain, other MOU partner agencies (including MTC) and MTC to address the concerns raised, while advocating for including the project in Period 1 (2021-2035) and for a re-affirmation of the project as a regional Federal funding (New Start) priority.*
- Better Market Street was initially selected for MTC's project performance assessment, but ultimately, MTC determined that the regional model was unable to demonstrate the project's benefits such as transit reliability and bike/pedestrian safety and therefore, did not fully evaluate the project. *MTC staff is recommending the project be included as a named project in PBA.*



Project Commitment Actions: Earlier this spring, MTC/ABAG asked CMAs to submit letters from staff outlining how local policies, additional project elements, and supportive regional strategies can help improve project performance for this subset of projects identified as having cost-effectiveness and/or equity challenges through MTC's project performance assessment, if agencies are seeking regional discretionary funding. We are highly supportive of efforts to improve cost effectiveness, advance equity and the other PBA goals. We also recognize that this is an ongoing effort that will advance through local planning and project development (and the community engagement that goes along with this) as well as through complementary regional initiatives (e.g. regional means-based fare, seamless transit initiatives).

Earlier this month, MTC/ABAG requested that the CMA boards across the region take action to affirm their agencies' commitments to efforts to improve cost-effectiveness and advance equity for the projects that were evaluated through the project performance assessment and that are seeking regional discretionary funds. Attachment 1 is a draft resolution for the Board's consideration, with a table outlining the efforts underway or already in place for each flagged project (listed above), to improve cost-effectiveness and/or advance equity as applicable. The table, developed in collaboration with project sponsors and other partner agencies, also outlines next steps for each project. The Transportation Authority is either a lead or partner agency in the ongoing planning processes for each of these projects and is committed to the ongoing work outlined with the community as well as our partner agencies.

The proposed resolution also includes as an attachment, a joint letter from eight agencies collaborating on the Regional Express Lane Network with commitments in response to the project's performance shortcomings around cost-effectiveness, equity, and greenhouse gas emissions reductions. Through this letter, which will be approved by the governing boards of each signatory, the partners commit to focusing on lane conversion projects over projects that construct new lanes (which is already the case for the San Francisco link), and to prioritizing segments that accommodate express bus services. The partners will also make a commitment to supporting means-based tolling as a possible way to address equity concerns, and to supporting a near-term means-based tolling pilot.

Transportation Strategies for PBA 2050. MTC/ABAG have focused PBA 2050 discussions on a series of strategies across four topic areas: Transportation, Housing, Economy, and Environment. Strategies are packages of projects, policies, and programmatic investments that are intended to work together to help PBA 2050 achieve its goals. MTC/ABAG staff are currently studying how these strategies perform in relation to the PBA 2050 guiding principles of Affordable, Connected, Diverse, Healthy, and Vibrant as well as the cross-cutting issues of Equity and Resilience. This includes an analysis of how far these strategies get us toward meeting the region's state GHG reduction goals. Attachment 2 lists the San Francisco projects and programmatic categories submitted to MTC in April along with the transportation strategy or strategies each supports. The strategies were developed through the 2018-19 Horizon scenario planning process, which studied a wider range of strategies in three disparate futures. The strategies that performed well, by reducing GHG emissions or improving travel options for Bay Area residents, were recommended for inclusion in PBA 2050. Thus far, MTC/ABAG staff have focused their commission discussions on these strategies, rather than on individual projects or policies, and it is important to demonstrate



how our project priorities are consistent with those strategies to support the city's requests for regional discretionary funding.

Next Steps. As they continue to refine the PBA 2050 project list, MTC/ABAG staff are working with the counties and project sponsors to update project information, revenue projections, and needs assessments (for state of good repair investments on local streets and roads, highways and bridges, transit, and ongoing transit operations). We expect to come back to the CAC and the Transportation Authority Board with a revised list of San Francisco's fiscally constrained projects and programs in the fall. At that time, we will have the benefit of a more complete picture of the draft PBA investment strategy including all of the proposed regional strategies, state of good repair needs and funding, discretionary funding recommendations, other county level projects, and regional programs (e.g. regional means-based fare program) being proposed for PBA 2050.

MTC/ABAG anticipates approving the financially constrained transportation investment strategy by the end of 2020, and then beginning work on an implementation plan. After the environmental review process, the final PBA 2050 will be approved in September 2021. Throughout the remainder of the PBA 2050 process, we will continue to work with the Transportation Authority Board, CAC, our MTC/ABAG representatives, project sponsors, and leaders at the local and regional levels to advocate for inclusion of San Francisco's priorities.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no impacts on the proposed provisional three-month Fiscal Year 2020/21 budget associated with the recommended action.

CAC POSITION

The CAC will consider this item at its July 22, 2020 meeting. The CAC continued the item from the June 24, 2020 meeting due to time constraints.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIALS

- Attachment 1 - Proposed Resolution affirming the Transportation Authority's commitment to support efforts to improve project cost-effectiveness and advance equity
- Attachment 2 - Transportation Authority Approved Draft Project and Program List for PBA 2050

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
Regional Transit Priorities															
1	Caltrain Downtown Extension, part of the Caltrain Business Plan ⁴	TJPA							X	X	X				X
2	Caltrain Enhanced Service Growth ⁴	Caltrain					X		X						X
3	BART Core Capacity ⁵	BART							X						X
4	Expand SFMTA Transit Fleet - LRV (Core Capacity Program)	SFMTA							X						X
5	Muni Train Control Upgrade (Core Capacity Program)	SFMTA	X						X						X
6	Muni Forward: Core Capacity Rail (Core Capacity Program)	SFMTA							X						X
7	Mission Bay Ferry Landing	Port of SF						X							X
8	Geary Boulevard Improvement Project	SFMTA		X	X			X							X

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
9	Van Ness Avenue Bus Rapid Transit	SFMTA		X	X			X							X
10	Transit Corridors Long-Range Planning	SF							X	X	X				X
11	Transit Operations	SF	X												X
12	Transit Preservation and Rehabilitation	SF	X												X
Local Transit Priorities															
13	Muni Forward + Frequency Increase (other)	SFMTA		X	X			X							X
14	Expand SFMTA Transit Fleet - Buses	SFMTA	X					X							X
15	Expand SFMTA Transit Fleet - Facilities	SFMTA	X					X							X
16	San Francisco Late Night Transportation Improvements	SFCTA						X							X
17	Geneva-Harney Bus Rapid Transit	SFMTA		X	X			X							X

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
18	Historic Streetcar Extension - Fort Mason to 4th & King	SFMTA						X							X
19	Minor Transit Improvements	SF			X			X							X
20	Transit Operations	SF	X												X
21	Transit Preservation and Rehabilitation	SF	X												X

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
Highway Safety and Efficiency Projects															
22	Alemany Roadway Redesign and Ramp Reconfiguration	SFCTA		X	X									X	X
23	Balboa Park Station Area - Closure of Northbound I-280 On-Ramp from Geneva Avenue	SFCTA												X	X
24	Balboa Park Station Area - Southbound I-280 Off-Ramp Realignment at Ocean Avenue	SFCTA			X									X	X
25	Yerba Buena Island (YBI) I-80 Interchange Improvement	SFCTA												X	X
26	Minor Highway Improvements	SF												X	X

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
Pricing and Community Re-Investment Programs															
27	Treasure Island Congestion Pricing	SFCTA		X	X	X	X	X				X	X		X
28	Downtown SF Congestion Pricing	SFCTA		X	X	X		X							X
29A	US-101/I-280 Express Lanes	SFCTA				X						X	X		X
29B	US-101/I-280 Regional/Local Express Bus to Support Express Lanes in SF	SFCTA						X				X	X		X
Vision Zero and Complete Streets															
30	Better Market Street Transportation Enhancements	SFPW / SFMTA		X	X										X
31	Bicycle and Pedestrian Program	SF		X	X										X
32	Intersection Improvements	SF		X	X										X

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
33	Local Road Preservation and Rehabilitation	SF	X												X
34	Management Systems	SF		X	X										X
35	Minor Roadway Expansions	SF		X	X										X
36	Multimodal Streetscape Improvements	SF		X	X										X
Transportation Investments Supporting Redevelopment and Affordable Housing															
37	Parkmerced Transportation Improvements	SFMTA		X	X			X							X
38	Hunters Pt Shipyard and Candlestick Pt Local Roads	SFPW / OCII		X	X			X							X
39	Southeast Waterfront Transportation Improvements - Phase 1	SFPW / OCII		X	X			X							X

Attachment 2 - San Francisco's Draft Fiscally Constrained PBA 2050 Project and Program List with PBA Strategies

	Column A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L	M	N	O
	PBA 2050 Projects and Programs	Project Sponsor ¹	Operations and Maintenance of the Existing System	Build a Complete Streets Network	Advance Regional Vision Zero Policy through Street Design and Reduced Speeds	Enable Seamless Mobility with Unified Trip Planning and Fare Payments	Reform Regional Transit Fare Policy	Advance Low-Cost Transit Projects	Increase Existing Rail Capacity and Frequency by Modernizing the Network	Extend the Regional Rail Network	Build a New Transbay Rail Crossing	Build an Integrated Regional Express Lane and Express Bus Network	Implement Per-Mile Tolling on Congested Freeways with Transit Alternatives	Improve Interchanges and Address Highway Bottlenecks	Advance Other Regional Programs and Local Priorities
Programs Supporting Multiple Priorities															
40	Planning and Research	SF		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
41	Routine Operations & Maintenance	SF	X												X
42	Safety and Security	SF		X				X						X	X
43	Travel Demand Management and Climate Program	SF			X	X		X					X		X
44	Financing Costs	SF	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

1 Project sponsor agencies: SFCTA: San Francisco County Transportation Authority; SFMTA: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency; SFPW: San Francisco Public Works; OCII: Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure; TJPA: Transbay Joint Powers Authority; Port of SF: Port of San Francisco; BART: Bay Area Rapid Transit

2 Project costs are displayed in millions of year-of-expenditure dollars.

3 O+M stands for Operations and Maintenance.

4 We are working with Caltrain to seek packaging of the Caltrain Enhanced Service Growth and Downtown Extension projects as part of a complimentary package of projects supporting the Caltrain Business Plan Service Vision.

5 Full BART Core Capacity project cost not included in SF Projects Total; assumes \$50M SF contribution.

PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES

PROJECTS named for air quality conformity purposes