



DRAFT MINUTES

San Francisco County Transportation Authority

Tuesday, June 23, 2020

1. Roll Call

Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mandelman, Mar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Stefani, Walton, and Yee (10)

Absent at Roll Call: Safai (entered during Item 3) (1)

2. Chair's Report - INFORMATION

Chair Peskin reported that democratic leadership of the house transportation and infrastructure committee released a proposal to reauthorize the current federal transportation bill to expire in September, which proposed \$494 billion in transportation funding over the next five years - a 46% increase over current spending levels would deliver significant new revenues for many of the agency's priorities, including transit capital grants, active transportation, congestion management, and climate protection. He further discussed the first year would also provide much needed COVID-19 relief funds for transit agencies and local governments that have been suffering during the pandemic, building upon the federal Health and Economic Recovery Omnibus Emergency Solutions Act to preserve jobs while stimulating the economy; he thanked House Speaker Nancy Pelosi and House members for passing the bills, awaiting next steps on the senate side this summer.

Chair Peskin also reported on new grant funding received locally, thanking the California Department of Transportation for awarding planning grants to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) for a Visitacion Valley transportation plan, to the Transportation Authority to study school transportation access improvements - an initiative led by Commissioner Mar, and to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission to study rail program development and governance. Chair Peskin noted that the latter study will hopefully build upon the Transportation Authority's recent Downtown Extension work to identify collaborative models for program delivery.

Finally, the Chair thanked SFMTA Director Tumlin and his team for presenting on the SFMTA's Transportation Recovery Plan. He also announced that earlier in the month Director Tumlin and himself had convened the Transportation Working Group comprised of representatives from a broad cross section of city and regional agencies and that this group will be consulted as we re-open the economy during a time of limited Muni and other transit services, and as traffic is returning on local streets, regional bridges and highways.

There was no public comment.

3. Executive Director's Report - INFORMATION



Tilly Chang, Executive Director, presented the item.

There was no public comment.

Consent Agenda

4. **Approve the Minutes of the June 9, 2020 Meeting - ACTION***
5. **[Final Approval] Appoint Rachel Zack to the Citizens Advisory Committee - ACTION***
6. **[Final Approval] Revise the Amended Fiscal Year 2019/20 Budget to Decrease Revenues by \$33.4 Million and Decrease Expenditures by \$5.0 Million for a Total Net Decrease in Fund Balance of \$28.4 Million - ACTION***
7. **[Final Approval] Adopt the Proposed Provisional Three-Month Fiscal Year 2020/21 Budget and Work Program - ACTION***
8. **[Final Approval] Allocate \$566,800, With Conditions, and Appropriate \$100,000 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds for Three Requests - ACTION***
9. **[Final Approval] Amend the 2017 Prop AA Strategic Plan - ACTION***
10. **[Final Approval] Increase the Amount of the Professional Services Contract with Nelson\Nygaard Consulting Associates by 775,000, to a Total Amount Not to Exceed \$1,475,000, and Extend the Contract Term Through March 31, 2021, for Technical and Communications Services for the Downtown Congestion Pricing Study- ACTION***

There was no public comment on the minutes.

Commissioner Walton moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Mandelman.

The Consent Agenda was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mandelman, Mar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Walton, and Yee (11)

Absent: none

End of Consent Agenda

11. **Adopt the District 3 Pedestrian Safety Improvements Final Report [NTIP Planning] - ACTION***

Dustin White, Senior Transportation Planner at SFMTA, presented the item.

Chair Peskin thanked SFMTA, Transportation Authority, and Sunny Angulo on his staff for completing the NTIP project, and thanked Chinatown Transportation Research and Improvement Project, the Telegraph Hill Dwellers, and North Beach neighbors for their input on the five-way intersection at Stockton, Green, and Columbus streets. He expressed excitement about the implementation of the midpoint crosswalk as the right solution and immediately necessary, particularly around the 500 block of Green Street, which was helping to spark economic recovery in the North Beach neighborhood through reduced parking spaces and more parklets in front of businesses. Chair Peskin encouraged people to visit the area, noting Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation at SFMTA, and former Board Members Katy Tang and Jane



Kim also visited as well.

During public comment, Francisco Da Costa asked if transit operators and seniors were consulted on the project. Chair Peskin answered in the affirmative.

Aleta Dupree expressed support for the item and concern about Muni delays, suggesting that quick builds be employed to speed up project completion.

Commissioner Peskin moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Yee.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mandelman, Mar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Walton, and Yee (11)

Absent: none

12. Presentation on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Transportation Recovery Plan- INFORMATION

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation; Dan Howard, Manager of Transit, Program Delivery & Support, and Transit Technology; Joel Ramos, Local Government Affairs Manager; Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit; and Jamie Parks, Livable Streets Director at SFMTA, presented the item.

Commissioner Preston spoke in support of dedicated transit lanes for Muni and taxis, but expressed concern over opening the lanes to every private bus and shuttle company. He said he had talked to the City Attorney and understood that SFMTA had some discretion in this area and asked whether SFMTA would support a policy restricting those lanes to Muni, taxis, and hospital shuttles. Director Tumlin answered that the agency's policy is to move the most people by prioritizing the people that have the fewest travel choices and modes that best help to achieve equity objectives, that allowing hospital shuttles but not other private entities would complicate the decision-making process. He recommended continuing the conversation both within the City and County of San Francisco and with the California Public Utilities Commission at the state level.

Commissioner Preston responded that from his understanding from the City Attorney was that no state reform would be necessary if there was a legitimate government purpose for the policy to include a certain category of vehicles, especially on an emergency and temporary basis. He further commented that hospital shuttles and shuttling around health care workers during a pandemic were for the public good versus giving private companies whose entire business model was to try to seize the public right-of-way for private use. Director Tumlin acknowledged these concerns and stated it was a topic of extraordinary complexity, which was the enemy of speed. Commissioner Preston observed that it was easier to phase in dedicated usage for buses, taxis, and hospital shuttle on a limited basis and then have a policy discussion as to whether other private entities should have use of the dedicated lanes as well rather than the reverse approach.

Chair Peskin noted that one of the slides showed the initial locations for transit only lanes and asked Director Tumlin and Ms. Kirschbaum to elaborate on the larger list of locations that the SFMTA Board is being asked to legislate.

Director Tumlin explained that the conversation about engagement, which is hard to



do doing a pandemic, and evaluation was important to the agency. Thus, the agency's proposed approach is to test some locations and do public engagement through implementation, experimenting first on streets downtown and then going to other locations with input from Commissioners. Director Tumlin said they were using temporary materials like paint on curb lanes, which is fast to deploy. He further stated that the SFMTA was talking with Caltrans about the possibility of High Occupancy Vehicle lanes on state highways like 19th Avenue and Lombard in the City, and was engaging in substantive conversations with local businesses and community-based organizations and pedestrian safety improvements. He said the agency would start in the locations high congestion and likely to have more program success, learning and adapting for future locations.

Commissioner Walton expressed the need to have real data to inform measures to combat increasing congestion on roads and ensure safety on public transportation to support crisis mitigation. Director Tumlin responded that the next item about the Transportation Authority's COVID congestion tracking tool would provide more confidence that measures are rooted in real data. He added if actions taken were proved incorrect, the temporary changes could be reversed.

Commissioner Yee asked how Slow Streets were evaluated for usefulness and effectiveness. Director Tumlin answered that the original purpose of the Slow Streets program was two-fold: to allow people to exercise safely outdoors and to help people get safely to their destination on transit. He acknowledged that in some cases Slow Streets produced results there were not originally anticipated and said that SFMTA would be looking at several factors: community feedback, unintended negative consequences like overflow traffic to parallel streets, how people utilize slow streets, and commuting habits. Director Tumlin said that the agency is observing to gauge effectiveness in achieving goals and the amount of community support, while evaluating for safety at individual sites.

Commissioner Ronen appreciated the presentation and asked if there was data on how many jobs might permanently stay remote, since it was also a major factor in how bad congestion would be. Director Tumlin answered that the COVID pandemic had revealed the geography of the essential workers, with travel patterns oriented more around the neighborhood commercial districts and less around the financial district, with expectancy of conventional office jobs to come back eventually. He further said that SFMTA was continuing to partner with Transportation Authority's modeling staff on the data.

Commissioner Mandelman expressed gratitude for the Sanchez Slow Street. He strongly support the idea of quick, bold experimentation to address a potential congestion apocalypse and provide safer transportation modes for people to travel, while seeking feedback along the way, and that SFMTA needed be nimble in responding to changes on the streets.

Commissioner Preston echoed the comments on being both flexible and bold at the same time. He asked if SFMTA had a system for keeping up with Slow Streets signage and if improvements could be made to signage, so that vehicles don't accidentally turn onto one of those streets, which could lead to a potentially fatal incident. Director Tumlin and Jamie Parks responded that staff was spending a lot of time moving signs and barricades around to different locations, and the agency did not want to use staff time long term on this task. He said was looking into longer term semi-permanent



infrastructure that is more difficult to move but could still be easily removed later by crews if proven unsuccessful, as well as saving costs during shelter-in-place at locations requiring frequent maintenance by installing plastic posts. Commissioner Preston noted that members of the public would likely be willing to serve as eyes on the streets and he encouraged regular check-in with community members to eliminate gaps in signage.

Commissioner Yee expressed concern and asked about the inequitable methods of providing programs to those who most need services and have little resources. He cited a lack of public transportation particularly on the west side for workers to commute or for seniors or others who need to head downtown for a medical appointment where one taxi ride to the doctor could use up the essential trip card allotment for the month.

Director Tumlin answered that the economic and direct health devastation of the COVID pandemic has resulted in 30% city-wide cuts in transportation services, and due to social distancing requirements, resources are directed to the lines that have the highest ridership and neighborhoods where people have the fewest choices, concentrating service in equity neighborhoods, leaving areas like the west side behind. He further commented that this issue was part of the reason why the agency was trying to develop a multimodal transportation system, providing more opportunities to access transit through bikes, scooters, a subsidized taxi program, and the essential trip card, to allow people transfer to a Muni line to get to their destination rather than take a taxi for the entire trip. Director Tumlin said the agency was trying serve all San Franciscans with significantly reduced resources while also making sure that resources are shifting toward ways that are socially equitable, which unfortunately meant tradeoffs in terms of geographic equity.

Commissioner Yee responded that though there were limited resources, he was trying to address the needs of his district by pointing out the lack of services on the westside and that there needed to be better solutions than cutting 60% of the lines, many of which are in his district.

Chair Peskin echoed Commissioner Yee's concerns and asked what steps are being undertaken to educate the users and modify behaviors on proper parking when access ramps and other areas are blocked by Bay Wheels and other micromobility devices.

Mr. Parks answered that the biggest thing would be to restart enforcement efforts over the summer, including fines for misparked bicycles and scooters, which was paused during shelter-in-place. He further commented that through directly ticketing the micromobility operators, that created a mechanism by which the operator could find out about specific misparked vehicles and use their own fine structures to pass fines and educational information directly to their users.

Chair Peskin asked if Mr. Parks thought that those fines were robust enough to change behavior, both by the companies and the individual users of those devices. Mr. Parks answered in the affirmative noting that micromobility companies seemed affected by the fines based on the amount of complaints received about how substantial fines the fines were, with issuances of over \$15,000 in fines in a single month. He further commented the agency was hopeful in seeing improved behavior, citing that he had received a lot of the same emails that were received by the Chair and how it was



disturbing to see the behavior currently exhibited on the streets.

Commissioner Haney asked about timelines for completion of construction of larger transit infrastructure projects like Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit and Central Subway. Director Tumlin answered that both Van Ness and Geary Bus Rapid Transit projects were given the green light to proceed through shelter-in-place, with most of the disruptive underground work on Van Ness mostly done and starting to transition to the street work. He also discussed Central Subway construction projected to be done at the end of the calendar year, followed by a year of testing and opening up for revenue service at the end of 2021. Joel Ramos commented that staff was re-evaluating the timeframe for Central Subway based in part on delays they were experiencing with Public Works. Director Tumlin commented that many smaller projects were not allowed to proceed during shelter-in-place to date as they were deemed non-essential.

Commissioner Safai asked about what adjustments and commitments SFMTA would make with the additional funding aid like the federal Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act (CARES Act), specifically regarding workplace injury prevention programs, social distancing with rear boarding of buses, ensuring the safety of bus operators, protection and the conditions of the workforce, and increasing ridership and service. He further commented that he was working aggressively with Public Works and other agencies to get traffic calming measures put in place.

Director Tumlin answered that the funding from the federal stimulus package was already distributed to the regions, which allows SFMTA to close out the fiscal year without layoffs and make it through the next fiscal year. He explained that for services like traffic calming, Public Works crews were starting to become available but were still limited due to adjustments for emergency duties related to COVID pandemic response, projecting possibly the end of the summer for the situation to stabilize and projects to proceed.

Commissioner Safai also asked about enforcement of issues like parking during street cleaning. Director Tumlin answered that SFMTA sent out warnings for street sweeping enforcement on June 13, with actual ticketing starting in late June; parking meter enforcement in coming weeks, and Muni fare enforcement projected with the re-start of rail around the second week in August.

Chair Peskin thanked Director Tumlin and staff for their presentation, and for engaging the Board in a meaningful and real way.

Commissioner Yee asked about the restrictions on the Shared Spaces program, specifically alleyways that involved residents, when the space seemed wide enough for residents to get in and out of their garages. Dan Howard answered that street closure applications needed to be supported by all affected in the community, by supervisory offices, and including a site plan showing a clear path of travel so that staff could work together with the supervisory office to find a solution that would work.

During public comment, Brian Hobson, Walk SF Vision Zero organizer, thanked SFMTA for their efforts and spoke in support of the transportation recovery plan, particularly the transit-only lanes and Slow Streets program, requesting a focus on safety improvements on the high injury network.



Aleta Dupree expressed concern about pass-ups at bus stops and suggested an all-electric fleet of micro mobility devices for those with disabilities to complement transit.

Stanley Chin, resident of District 7 and member of SF Transit Riders, supported the transportation recovery plan but expressed concern about the decrease of bus service and of commuters traveling on buses due to the pandemic and that transit-only lanes were key to bringing back ridership.

Zack Deutsch-Gross, member of SF Transit Riders, reiterated support for transit-only lanes in providing safer and more efficient travel for bus riders, especially for communities that do not have other options.

Sihan Amaganali, resident of District 8, requested the permanent expansion of transit-only lanes and Slow Streets program, and also commented that transit-only lanes should be used by public transportation vehicles only.

John Winston, resident of District 7 and Chair of Balboa Reservoir Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), supported the Shared Spaces program particularly on Ocean Avenue and requested quick build of transit-only lanes on Geneva, Ocean, and Frida Kahlo avenues around City College area, and making these changes permanent.

Milo Trauss, member of SF Transit Riders, supported the recovery plan, especially the quick build transit-only lane and requested Sage and Sanchez streets remain permanent. He also supported e-bike expansion throughout the City.

Christopher Peterson, resident of District 7 and member of SF Transit Riders, supported the emergency transit-only lanes but said the plan doesn't expand far enough and requested support for Muni to do more quick build and creative improvements throughout the City.

Peter Strauss, member of SF Transit Riders, commended SFMTA for proposals to apply quick build transit-only lanes and requested quick build improvements for the T-Third line, especially at the shared lanes in Bayview and approach from the south at the 4th Street bridge.

Mishon Peterpol, resident of District 9 and member of SF Transit Riders and San Francisco Bicycle Coalition (SFBC), echoed comments about improving the T-Third line and requested Slow Streets in the Tenderloin and Marina areas, as well making permanent Slow Streets program and transit-only lanes expansion particularly in the Glen Park area of Mission Street. He also supported the bike share expansion program.

Dan Catterman, resident of District 5 and member of SF Transit Riders, supported transit-only lanes throughout the City and requested making them permanent after the COVID pandemic has receded.

Wesley Smith, member of SF Transit Riders, supported transit-only lanes expansion particularly the protected bike lanes. He also requested increase in bus frequency and bike safety including fully connected system of bike lanes and he supported the Slow Streets program expansion.

Ilias Zamoria, resident of District 5 and member of SF Transit Riders and SFBC, supported transit-only lanes expansion and requested that 7th and 8th streets on which the 19 bus line runs, be included in the plan. He also requested that Slow Streets be



made permanent and asked why the Scott slow street was reversed.

Amy O'Hare, member of Balboa Reservoir CAC, requested transit-only lanes for Frida Kahlo Way adjacent to the Balboa Reservoir and for the 43 Masonic line and other lines that feed into the Balboa BART station.

Shahin Saneinejad, resident of District 7, requested support for transit-only lanes, especially shortening time of bus travel for essential workers' health and safety.

Olivia Gamboa, resident of District 1 and a physician, supported transit-only lanes, especially for the health and safety of vulnerable populations and essential workers. She also supported Slow Streets and shared outdoor spaces, and requested they be made permanent.

13. COVID-Era Congestion Tracker - INFORMATION*

The item was continued due to time constraints.

There was no public comment on this item.

Other Items

14. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

15. Public Comment

There was no general public comment.

16. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:32 p.m.