



**TREASURE ISLAND
MOBILITY MANAGEMENT AGENCY**

1455 Market Street, 22ND Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103

415-522-4800

info@timma.org

www.timma.org

DRAFT MINUTES

TREASURE ISLAND MOBILITY MANAGEMENT AGENCY COMMITTEE

Tuesday, November 12, 2019

1. Roll Call

Chair Haney called the meeting to order at 10:32 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Haney, Mandelman and Walton (3)

Consent Agenda

- 2. Approve the Minutes of the July 16, 2019 Meeting - ACTION**
- 3. Recommend Approval of the Revised Procurement Policy - ACTION**
- 4. Internal Accounting Report for the Three Months Ending September 30, 2019 - INFORMATION**

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Walton moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Mandelman.

The Consent Agenda was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haney, Mandelman and Walton (3)

End of Consent Agenda

5. Recommend Approval of the Toll Exemption for Current Residents - ACTION

Rachel Hiatt, Assistant Deputy Director, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Chair Haney requested that public comment be taken before Commissioner comments and questions.

During public comment Steve Stallone, member of the Treasure Island Organizing Committee (TIOC), stated that Treasure Island residents were not given sufficient notice to attend the meeting. He said TIOC understood that the business issues were going to be addressed at a later meeting and were in favor of a proposed employee exemption. He added that the TIOC was still waiting for TIMMA to address how the toll policy would affect Treasure Island vendors and customers bringing business to the island.



Jim Mirowski, owner of Treasure Island Wines, stated that Treasure Island businesses and nonprofits were only given one day to read 100 pages of documentation, before the October 24, 2019 Treasure Island outreach workshop. He said he appreciated TIMMA's effort to accommodate exemptions for residents and employees, but noted the issue around congestion was further out than the developer's estimated date, given that the development build-out had been pushed out significantly. Mr. Mirowski asked when a financial model would be available for the public and questioned the transportation plan's reliance on limited bus service to and from Treasure Island to mitigate congestion. He asked why residents would need to pay for five to seven years for a limited bus system and ferry system that had not yet been fully defined.

Ben Seisdodos, Treasure Island resident, said residents were glad that they were being listened to and outreach towards the community was being conducted. He stated that he was concerned about the affect a potential toll policy would have on Treasure Island businesses and that a new toll could possibly deter people who did not live on the island from visiting. He suggested an ad campaign to encourage Treasure Island visitors to use public transportation as a way to combat congestion.

After public comment Chair Haney thanked the public for their comments and TIMMA staff for their outreach and for listening to the residents and Committee members. He stated that residents shared with him their concerns regarding the toll policy. He said it was important to make a commitment that current residents would not be paying the toll fee and that TIMMA's toll policy would be evaluated after a certain number of years to see how it was performing. Chair Haney said he did not believe that a toll fee for current residents currently made sense given that there was not a significant issue with congestion on the island. He added that many residents of the island were either low income or middle income and relied on cars because of gaps in access to public transportation on the island. He also noted that no other neighborhood in San Francisco had to pay a toll fee in order to go to and from work, nor had to shoulder the responsibility of funding their own transportation system.

Chair Haney said that as Treasure Island's population grows and public transportation becomes more accessible and reliable, the conversation around how people travel to and from the island would change. He requested an informed conversation in regard to what was being done for businesses, employees and current and future low-income residents. He said more exemptions would need to be offered in the future, but noted that the item being discussed was making a commitment to current residents and creating policy. He asked that TIMMA staff provide outreach and inform the public of meetings when the conversation turns to Treasure Island businesses and employees. Chair Haney announced that the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA) would have a meeting on November 13, 2019 and said it was another opportunity for the public to learn about potential policy changes and provide public comment.

Commissioner Walton said it was important that Treasure Island residents not be charged to get home and that he had major concerns about future low-income families that would have to move to the island as a result of affordable housing being built across the city. He said he appreciated TIMMA staff's work to mitigate fees for current residents and asked if the staff recommendation to revisit or sunset the current resident exemption program at the development project midpoint could be further explained.

Mrs. Hiatt said staff would need to look at the program performance relative to its goals and said that it had two specific goals from the development agreement; 50% mode share and a revenue goal to fund the transit service. She said other metrics would need to be added, like whether or not the program was meeting the transit service levels called for in the development agreement.

Commissioner Walton asked if the staff's development project midpoint revisit recommendation had to include the word sunset.

Mrs. Hiatt said that it could just say revisit, without the word sunset.

Chair Haney said he preferred that the word revisit be used, as opposed to any sort of automatic sunset. He asked who was defined as a current resident and if there was a cut-off date.

Mrs. Hiatt said that the definition of who was a current resident still needed to be developed and would be created in the toll system business rules. She also noted that a cut-off date had not been set and that staff was still working to capture all residents that they were intending to include as part of the exemption. She said the definition and cut-off date would be brought to the TIMMA Committee and Board next year.

Chair Haney noted that the current resident exemption would affect the revenue stream to build out some of the transportation infrastructure and asked how staff planned to make up the lost revenue.

Mrs. Hiatt said the program could raise the revenues from the toll, from parking fees, transit fares, or mandatory transit pass purchases, which were also the TIMMA program revenues authorized to invest in the island,. She said the program could also look at nonprogram revenues which were not authorized to TIMMA and would require working with fund programmers and administrators. Other bridge toll or city revenues were also additional streams that could be dedicated to the program.

Chair Haney asked if staff could speak to the developer contribution for transportation and whether there was any possibility to increase the developer contribution.

Mrs. Hiatt said that in addition to the capital commitment to provide upfront infrastructure, the developer was required to provide \$35 million as part of the development agreement.



Bob Beck, Executive Director at TIDA, said the \$35 million subsidy that was agreed upon between the developer and TIDA could not be reopened, but did state that the developer was looking at potentially directly funding a private ferry service to provide some early ferry service before the program would be in a position to fund a full Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA) type of ferry service.

Chair Haney asked if the early ferry service would be available to anybody who paid for it.

Mr. Beck said the developers were still exploring it, but anticipated that it would be available to island residents.

Chair Haney reiterated the importance of fully including all impacted parties as part of the conversation and agreed with Commissioner Walton that the staff's development project midpoint recommendation should not say sunset but rather revisit. He said there would be further discussions centered around how to support current and future low-income residents, businesses and employees and how to build out the public transportation system.

Commissioner Walton cautioned staff to be thoughtful when defining what constituted a current resident and explained the difference between on-lease and off-lease residents. He said that although some residents were not on lease agreements, they were still very much residents of the communities. He said as someone who had lived in public housing and been an off-lease resident, it was important to understand that households were not necessarily just made up of on-lease individuals.

Chair Haney asked for clarification of when exactly the development project midpoint would be. He asked if it was a set time or depended on what the development timeline looked like.

Mrs. Hiatt said she recommend defining mid-point as a number of units so that if the actual year changed, the transit service levels would correspond with the number of units.

Chair Haney asked what the current midpoint was in terms of years.

Mrs. Hiatt said that the midpoint in terms of years would be 2029 in the financial modeling. She did add that there were different scenarios for how that build-out would look.

Chair Haney noted that there was some confusion among residents that the midpoint was six years as opposed ten years. He said it was important to communicate that information clearly with residents.

Mrs. Hiatt said she would recommend tying it to units [4,000 units] rather than number of years.



Commissioner Mandelman moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Walton.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haney, Mandelman and Walton (3)

6. Treasure Island Business and Employee Outreach Update - INFORMATION

Eric Young, Director of Communications, presented the item.

Chair Haney requested that public comment be taken before Commissioner comments and questions.

During public comment, Jim Mirowski stated he previously asked the Transportation Authority and Treasure Island Development Authority for an agenda on what was proposed for Treasure Island's new development, and the frustration at having received last minute materials just before the October 22nd Board Meeting. He commented that original proposal said no toll on off-peak hours or weekends but showed up in the recent materials, and businesses were again frustrated by the late notice of materials and were not able to go through the documents overnight to prepare for the meeting.

Steve Stallone commented that Treasure Island business upkeep required vendors and customers from off the island, and these facilities had also become places of gathering for the community and were important parts of the community.

After public comment, Chair Haney commented that the project had a ways to go in terms of developing the policy, working with businesses, and addressing some of the concerns, agreeing that it was desirable for more people to visit Treasure Island for business and something to be incentivizing, encouraging, and promoting more. He also expressed concerned about a toll creating barriers and challenges for the small businesses. Chair Haney expressed that he was generally supportive of congestion pricing and policies but that it did not apply the situation with regards to Treasure Island right now but perhaps in 10 to 15 years. He said the current concern was a lot of equity questions about how to support small businesses to thrive on the island, critical parts of the community with a lot of challenges to get people to come there, such as a lack of public transportation infrastructure.

7. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

8. Public Comment

During general public comment, Dennis Hayes asked if there was any thought to petitioning BART to build out a Treasure Island station as part of their second tube project.



Ben Seisdodos requested that the agency not use date and time approach on how current residents were defined, noting lease changes with both English- and non-English speaking communities with people not listed on leases. He expressed that the definition was important if equity was the goal, using the existing housing stock as the most fair and simplest way to move forward with the toll component.

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:21 a.m.