1. Welcome + Logistics
2. Introductions
3. Scenarios + Input
4. Outreach Updates
5. Next Steps
6. Public Comment
Meeting facilitation (Colin)
Zoom process + Tech
Questions (Abe and Paige)
Meeting materials available at sfcta.org/PAC5
Using Zoom

View participants + chat screen
Using Zoom

Mute/Unmute your microphone
(*6 on phone)

Start/Stop your camera
Using Zoom

Raise your hand
(*9 on phone)
Using Zoom: PAC Members

- Update your name and organization in Zoom
2 public comment opportunities during meeting (1 min/person)

- Verbal public comment: raise your hand (*9 on phone)
- Submit comments via chat to Paige
Having trouble?

- Tell Abe/Paige in the chat (if you can)

- Text 415-930-3132
Introductions

Transportation Authority Staff

PAC Members - introduce yourself and your organization via chat

Text 415-930-3132 if having trouble with Zoom
Scenario Analysis
Screening process

ROUND 1: Basic Design

ROUND 2: Investments

ROUND 3: Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration
The target

Reduce peak car trips downtown by at least 15% from 2019 levels

The fee amount for each of the following scenarios is the lowest charge that results in a 15% decrease in peak car trips.
Round 1
Basic Design
Configurations

**Peak Direction**
Only trips in the peak direction pay the fee.

**Inbound**
Only trips going into downtown pay the fee.

**Bidirectional**
All trips that cross the congestion zone boundary pay the fee.

**Area**
All trips that touch the congestion zone pay the fee.

**Vehicle Miles Traveled**
A fee is paid for every mile that any trip takes within the congestion zone.

A fee is paid for every mile that any trip takes within the congestion zone.
Cost per peak-period round trip

- **Peak Direction**: $7.50
- **Inbound**: $8.50
- **Bidirectional**: $12.00
- **Area**: $9.00+

PER MILE

- $4.00
- $4.00
- $4.50
- $4.50
- $4.00
Cost per peak-period round trip

- Peak Direction: $7.50
- Inbound: $8.50
- Bidirectional: $6.00
- Area: $4.50 PER TRIP
- VMT: $4.00 PER MILE
Peak direction pricing flaw

8:30 a.m. $0
$0 total
5:30 p.m. $0

8:30 a.m. $7.50
$15 total
5:30 p.m. $7.50
DRAFT
Revenue and Costs

*Revenue and costs are estimates based on preliminary analysis, and are subject to change.

Low program costs
High program costs
Available revenue

$770K COLLECTED
19%
$350K AVAILABLE REVENUE
PEAK DIRECTION

$660K COLLECTED
16%
$300K AVAILABLE REVENUE
INBOUND

$910K COLLECTED
18%
$410K AVAILABLE REVENUE
BIDIRECTIONAL

$850K COLLECTED
27%
$380K AVAILABLE REVENUE
AREA
DRAFT
Revenue and Costs

*Revenue and costs are estimates based on preliminary analysis, and are subject to change
Change in Cost per Person, Daily

Results are without any driving discounts. Costs are out-of-pocket expenses including auto operating and maintenance costs, bridge tolls, taxi and tnc fares, transit fares. Costs exclude parking and vehicle purchase.
Change in Vehicle Trips, Combined Peak Periods

Results are without any driving discounts.
Key Findings: Round 1

Inbound cordon is best performer
- Meets 15% vehicle trip reduction target with lowest daily traveler costs
- Requires $8.50 fee per transaction
- Has lowest capital and operating costs

Without driving discounts, all scenarios disproportionately reduce driving trips among lower-income people
Screening process

ROUND 1: Basic Design
ROUND 2: Investments
ROUND 3: Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration
Screening process

ROUND 1  ROUND 2  ROUND 3

Basic Design → Investments → Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration

PEAK DIRECTION

INBOUND

BIDIRECTIONAL

AREA

VMT
Round 2
Investments
Transit service increase of at least 23% would alleviate crowding

- Inbound cordon revenue sufficient to fund this increase
- More transit service does not further reduce driving
- Additional revenue could be used to fund more service or other priorities
Screening process

ROUND 1
Basic Design

ROUND 2
Investments

ROUND 3
Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration

PEAK DIRECTION
INBOUND
BIDIRECTIONAL
AREA
VMT

None
15%
23%
29%
37%
Screening process

ROUND 1
Basic Design

ROUND 2
Investments

ROUND 3
Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration

PEAK DIRECTION
- INBOUND: 15%
- BIDIRECTIONAL: 23%
- AREA: 29%
- VMT: 37%
Round 3
Discounts and Exemptions
Low Income Driver Discount Packages

**No Discounts**
- $8.50 fee
- No driving discounts
- 23% transit service investment

**Moderate Discounts**
- $10.00 fee
- 50% low-income driver discount
- 50% very-low-income driver discount
- 23% transit service investment

**More Discounts**
- $12.00 fee
- 50% low-income driver discount
- 100% very-low-income driver discount
- 23% transit service investment
## Vehicle Trip Reduction

### NO DISCOUNTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Level</th>
<th>Discount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Low (&lt; $65,100)</td>
<td>-17.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low ($65,100 – $94,700)</td>
<td>-17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate ($94,700 – $142,100)</td>
<td>-15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle ($142,100 – $165,500)</td>
<td>-16.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High (&gt; $165,500)</td>
<td>-13.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Vehicle Trip Reduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Level</th>
<th>Discount (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Low (&lt; $65,100)</td>
<td>-6.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low ($65,100 - $94,700)</td>
<td>-13.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate ($94,700 - $142,100)</td>
<td>-18.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle ($142,100 - $165,500)</td>
<td>-18.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High (&gt; $165,500)</td>
<td>-16.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Vehicle Trip Reduction

V. LOW  LOW  MOD. MIDDLE  HIGH

V. LOW  LOW  MOD. MIDDLE  HIGH

V. LOW  LOW  MOD. MIDDLE  HIGH

15%  15%  15%
Cost as % of income for all travelers

Very Low: 12.4%
Low: 3.4%
Moderate: 2.4%
Middle: 2%
High: 1.3%
Costs are out-of-pocket expenses including auto operating and maintenance costs, bridge tolls, taxi and tnc fares, transit fares. Costs exclude parking and vehicle purchase.
Change in cost as % of income – drivers

Costs are out-of-pocket expenses including auto operating and maintenance costs, bridge tolls, taxi and tnc fares, transit fares. Costs exclude parking and vehicle purchase.
Driving discounts reduce or maintain low-income traveler costs

- Income-based driving discounts increase the base price to $10 – 12
- Inbound cordon revenue can fund driving discounts and transit service increase
- Higher discount levels result in a more equitable distribution of changes in driving
Screening process

ROUND 1: Basic Design
ROUND 2: Investments
ROUND 3: Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration

PEAK DIRECTION:
INBOUND: None, 15%, 23%, 29%, 37%
BIDIRECTIONAL:
AREA:
VMT:
Screening process

ROUND 1: Basic Design
ROUND 2: Investments
ROUND 3: Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration

PEAK DIRECTION

INBOUND

BIDIRECTIONAL

AREA

VMT

None

15%

23%

29%

37%
Screening process

ROUND 1
Basic Design

ROUND 2
Investments

ROUND 3
Discounts and Exemptions

High performing scenarios identified for further consideration

PEAK DIRECTION
INBOUND
BIDIRECTIONAL
AREA
VMT

None
15%
23%
29%
37%
Other discounts & subsidies

Some discounts can be easily accommodated, while others may come with trade-offs

- A maximum daily charge cap can be added with minimal effect on the program
- Zone resident discounts will increase cost to others, while likely reducing revenue available for other subsidies
- A $1 bridge toll rebate likely benefits higher income drivers
- Narrow transit discounts may work, but bigger discounts for more people exceed estimated available revenue under options analyzed
- Discounts for drivers with disabilities are appropriate and require additional analysis
Feedback from the Community
Co-Creation
Co-Creation

**Subsidy**

- **Low-income driver discounts**
  
  Provide discounts to the congestion fee based on income.

  Example low-income definition based on household size: 1 person < 65k annually, 2 people < 75K, 3 people < 85k, 4 people < $95k

**Investment**

- **Transit improvements**
  
  Provide more frequent buses on 10 congested or underserved routes.

**Fee**

- **$5 peak period fee**
  
  Charge $5 to drive into or out of downtown during morning or evening rush hours.
Takeaways from co-creation to date

- Average preferred fee selected to cover desired investments/discounts: $5 – $5.50 (bidirectional)
- Investments: transit improvements, safety upgrades
- Discounts/Exemptions: Low-income transit, driver discounts
- Common themes: Transparency, fairness

Conclusions should be considered preliminary as these only represent takeaways from Bayview, Tenderloin, and Excelsior workshops.
Community Presentations

- Desire for increased transit service
- Desire for exemptions/discounts for zone residents
- Interest in improving air quality
- Surprise that majority of traffic downtown comes from within SF
- Concern about boundaries dividing neighborhoods

Potrero Boosters, Urban Environmentalists, SBRMBNA, Dogpatch Merchants Association, Union Square BID
Where do we go from here?

- 50/100 best advances our goals
- Co-creation to date has indicated interest in more transit discounts
- Your feedback today will help us determine what to incorporate in the next stage of analysis
Now: Questions about the analysis

Breakout sessions: Feedback + discussion

Group reconvenes: Share-outs + PAC discussion

Public comment
Breakout Sessions

PAC members are currently in breakout sessions and will return shortly. Members of the public are encouraged to provide feedback via google form at sfcta.org/pac5.
Discussion Questions:

- What are your initial reactions?
- Do the options with discounts advance equity? Would you make changes? Eg. Increase base fee to provide more discounts or subsidies
- What do you think about moving ahead with inbound only?
- What do you want to know from community members to help make decisions about these trade offs?
Share outs + Discussion
Public Comment
Outreach adjustments for Shelter-in-Place
Our Challenge

- Can we replicate co-creation digitally?
- How can we reach populations of low-income individuals, people of color, seniors, and people with low-digital access?
Remote Outreach

Engagement Tools

- Remote co-creation
- SMS texting conversations
- Digital/telephone town hall
- Virtual meetings with interested stakeholder groups
Remote Co-Creation Approach

- With CBO Partner: Community members sign up for a session time
- Receive physical kits in mail or play the game online
- Join a call or webinar with SFCTA
- Collaboration with household members, friends encouraged
Remote Outreach

Engagement Tools

- Remote co-creation
- Phone, SMS texting conversations
- Digital/telephone town hall
- Virtual meetings with interested stakeholder groups
Remote Outreach

Publicity Tactics

- Low/no-contact distribution of flyers + door hangers
- In-language advertising (news/radio)
- Engaging senior-serving orgs, nonprofits in CoCs
Next Steps
Schedule subject to change

2019
JUL - SEP

2020
OCT - DEC

2020
JAN - APR

2020
MAY - SEP

2021
OCT - FEB

2021
SPRING 2021

STEP 1
Prepare

STEP 2
Listen

STEP 3
Develop

STEP 4
Define

STEP 5
Analyze

STEP 6
Recommend
Public Comment
Submit via chat or raise hand to give a verbal comment (1 minute).

San Francisco
County Transportation Authority
Thank You

sfcta.org/downtown
congestion-pricing@sfcta.org