



DRAFT MINUTES

San Francisco County Transportation Authority

Tuesday, February 25, 2020

1. Roll Call

Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mandelman, Preston, Peskin, Walton and Yee (7)

Absent at Roll Call: Commissioners Stefani (entered during Item 2), Ronen (entered during Item 3), Safai (entered during Item 13) and Mar (4)

Commissioner Walton moved to excuse Commissioners Mar and Safai, seconded by Commissioner Preston. Commissioner Mar and Safai were excused without objection.

2. Chair's Report - INFORMATION

Chair Peskin reported that California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Commissioner Shiroma had proposed a ruling to reverse the CPUC's policy on the confidentiality of Transportation Network Company (TNC) data. In California, TNCs such as Lyft and Uber, are regulated by the CPUC and are required to submit annual reports to the CPUC. He said despite the city's advocacy, calling for making these data available, the CPUC's policy and practice on TNC data had been to presume filings from TNCs to be confidential. He said Commissioner Shiroma's proposed decision on data confidentiality now proposed to treat these data as public by default. Chair Peskin said he applauded and fully supported Commissioner Shiroma's proposal and validated the Board's views on how and why the California Public Records Act favors and even mandates disclosure, cautions companies against making over-broad claims of confidentiality, and opens the door to making past filings public.

Chair Peskin said the availability of TNC trip data was critical to the city's ability to understand where and when TNCs operate and how they affect congestion. Trip data can also shed light on whether TNCs are serving people equitably, and what safety impacts they may have. He said while this was a preliminary decision as of yet, he was glad to see this proposal from Commissioner Shiroma and urged the full Commission to adopt the new policy as soon as possible.

Chair Peskin reported that Mayor Breed announced her support for developing a congestion pricing program in San Francisco to address the negative effects of growing traffic congestion, particularly in Downtown and SoMa areas. She emphasized that the program must be based in fairness and equity by considering those who are least able to pay or have limited transportation options, and that revenue should be directed back towards building a world-class transportation system. He said he agreed and looked forward to partnering with Mayor Breed in supporting Transportation Authority staff as they continue the Downtown Congestion Pricing Study.



Chair Peskin said he wanted to underscore the importance of moving forward with the Downtown Rail Extension project, a lynchpin of the region's vision for a more seamless and connected Bay Area. He said Director Chang informed him that the partners had had fruitful discussions and that the Board can expect to see the 6-party memorandum of understanding for advancing that project agendized at the Transbay Joint Powers Authority very soon. He said getting it done timely was an essential step toward the city's ability to grow resources for rail in this region.

There was no public comment.

3. Executive Director's Report - INFORMATION

Tilly Chang, Executive Director, presented the Executive Director's Report.

During public comment Francisco Da Costa said the coronavirus should motivate the city to come up with models in place that could potentially affect public transportation. He suggested that the topic be part of a future agenda.

Consent Agenda

4. **Approve the Minutes of the February 11, 2020 Meeting - ACTION**
5. **[Final Approval] Appoint Peter Tannen to the Citizens Advisory Committee - ACTION**
6. **[Final Approval] State and Federal Legislation Update - ACTION**
7. **[Final Approval] Approve the 2020 State and Federal Legislative Program**
8. **[Final Approval] Allocate \$5,832,072, with Conditions, in Prop K Sales Tax Funds for Seven Requests - ACTION**
9. **[Final Approval] Adopt Fiscal Year 2020/21 Transportation Fund for Clean Air Local Expenditure Criteria**
10. **[Final Approval] Authorize the Executive Director to Execute Eight Project Delivery Agreements and Any Amendments Thereto with the California Department of Transportation for Receipt of State and Federal Funds for the Yerba Buena Island Westside Bridges Seismic Retrofit Project - ACTION**
11. **[Final Approval] Authorize the Executive Director to Execute Amendment No. 5 to the Memorandum of Agreement with the Treasure Island Development Authority for Yerba Buena Island Vista Point Operation Services to Increase the Amount by \$400,000, to a Total Amount Not to Exceed \$1,995,000, and Extend the Agreement Through June 30, 2022 for Operations and Maintenance Services for the New Vista Point at Pier E2 - ACTION**

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Stefani moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Preston.

The Consent Agenda was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mandelman, Preston, Peskin, Ronen, Stefani, Walton and Yee (9)

Absent: Commissioners Mar and Safai (2)



End of Consent Agenda

Chair Peskin called Item 12 and Item 13 together.

12. Update on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Siemens Light-Rail Vehicle Procurement - INFORMATION

13. Independent Management and Oversight Report on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Siemens Light-Rail Vehicle Procurement - INFORMATION

Eric Cordoba, Deputy Director for Capital Projects, introduced the items.

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), and Bob Sergeant, Director of Rail and Transit, West, at T.Y. Lin International presented the items.

Chair Peskin asked if the improvement in the performance of the Phase 1 Siemens Light Rail Vehicles (LRVs) with regard to Median Distance Between Failures (MDBF) included vehicles removed from service for flat wheels.

Ms. Kirschbaum responded that it did not include service calls due to flat wheels. She clarified that for the Siemens LRVs the MDBF measure was evaluated based exclusively on failures due to mechanical problems resulting from problems that were the contractual responsibility of the manufacturer. She said flat wheels, which resulted from the SFMTA's policy that operators use the alternate emergency braking system, were outside of Siemens' range of responsibility. Similarly, something like a control board locking up the vehicle's traction power due to operator error was not Siemens' responsibility and the lost service time was not included when calculating the vehicle's contribution to the fleet's MDBF.

Chair Peskin asked if borrowing parts from Vehicle 2033 was necessitated by problems with Siemens' ability to obtain replacement parts when needed.

Ms. Kirschbaum answered that Siemens did not know where defects would materialize until the vehicles had some experience operating in San Francisco, so Siemens could not initially have replacement parts at the ready.

Chair Peskin asked if the SFMTA had already purchased Vehicle 2033, since it was not operational.

Ms. Kirschbaum answered that the SFMTA had not purchased Vehicle 2033, that Siemens owned it and was using it for parts. She said the SFMTA would only pay for it after it had been fully restored and gone through the SFMTA's full acceptance testing program.

Chair Peskin asked if the six LRVs out of service while awaiting new wheels would be outfitted with track brakes prior to being placed in service.

Ms. Kirschbaum answered in the affirmative, and said the SFMTA wanted to make sure the new wheels would be protected from further damage.

Chair Peskin invited Roger Marengo, President of Transit Workers Union Local 250A, to share his experience with the Siemens LRVs and whether the modifications were beneficial.

Mr. Marengo stated that the mechanical and performance issues covered in Ms. Kirschbaum's update were being resolved satisfactorily. He advocated that in future



vehicle procurements the SFMTA's policy should be to include the union from the beginning of the project rather than at the end. He suggested that the experience of the men and women who operated the vehicles on the actual streets of San Francisco was at least as important as conclusions drawn from simulators.

Gary Coward, Muni Operator, said the working relationship with the SFMTA's engineering staff was much improved, and echoed Mr. Marengo's opinion that it was critical to utilize operator experience early in the procurement process.

Telesia Telsee, Muni Operator, said she was one of the original operators of the SFMTA's Siemens LRVs, and expressed strong approval for the upgrades that had been implemented. She also said operators differed in their opinions, but believed that once they became familiar with the new vehicles they would find them to be far superior.

Chair Peskin thanked the operators for their public comment and said the approval of the people who operated the vehicles day in, and day out was an excellent sign of progress.

Commissioner Fewer asked for confirmation that Siemens was replacing the coupler shear pins on the in-service Phase 1 LRVs every ninety days.

Ms. Kirschbaum confirmed.

Commissioner Fewer said it was not sustainable to replace the shear pins at that rate.

Ms. Kirschbaum clarified that Siemens is responsible for covering the cost of the shear pins, which are expensive.

Commissioner Fewer asked how long the process to replace the shear pins required, and whether it required a vehicle to be removed from revenue service.

Ms. Kirschbaum said the SFMTA staff would follow up with the Board to provide details on the shear pin replacement process and time required. She said the LRVs were not removed from service to replace the shear pins, and said the process was included with the preventative maintenance schedule for each vehicle. Ms. Kirschbaum did not anticipate that the replacement regimen would continue for multiple cycles because Siemens now had defined the problem and would likely produce a design solution without delay. But she said that until a solution had been successfully tested with the same instrumentation that was used to diagnose the problem, SFMTA would hold Siemens to its commitment to replace the pins on a 90-day cycle.

Chair Peskin said before the Board approved funding for the next phase of the contract it would need assurances that the shear pin problem would be fixed.

Commissioner Preston asked if the SFMTA planned changes to its policies to ensure that operators were involved earlier in a procurement process for new vehicles.

Ms. Kirschbaum thanked Commissioner Preston and said the SFMTA would operationalize his feedback. She clarified that there had been operator input upfront, including part of the design phase and all of the testing, though not a deep dive such as the one to which the operators had recently been contributing.

During public comment Eileen Boken stated that while buses had a lifespan of 12 to 14 years, LRV lifespans were double those of buses. She suggested new LRVs



undergo a more rigorous review process than that used for new buses. She said Calgary, Canada's rollout of very similar LRVs had gone much more smoothly, and suggested that SFMTA look to Calgary process as an example.

Francisco Da Costa said the oversight consultant contracted by the Transportation Authority hadn't provided the real information about the Siemens LRVs. He said the Board had only received reports on the real situation from the operators, and said the presentations that the SFMTA Director of Transit provided to the Transportation Authority differed from those she presented to the SFMTA Board.

14. San Francisco Muni Reliability Working Group Update - INFORMATION

Chair Peskin commented that the Mayor, Supervisors Mandelman, Safai and himself had joined with the Controller's Office, SFMTA staff, and experts from other transit agencies conduct an evaluation into muni reliability, which he noted was really helpful and informative, as they tackles issues ranging from the operator shortage to transit capacity under market street to automated train control systems.

Peg Stevenson, Director at City of San Francisco Controller's Office, presented the item.

Chair Peskin said the exercise was done with hopes of having the attendance of the new SFMTA Director, but Director Jeffrey Tumlin was not officially serving his new role at that time.

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit at the SFMTA, presented the item.

Commissioner Safai commented that he appreciated the hard work the working group undertook. He called out the findings on operator shortage and vehicle maintenance issues, and requested Director Tumlin's presence at a future board meeting to discuss his plan to address these issues.

Ms. Stevenson noted that Julie Kirschbaum's portion of the presentation would help answer Commissioner Safai's questions.

Commissioner Fewer suggested that SFMTA look into how work commutes affect transit operators daily and how it may contribute the operator shortage the agency was currently experiencing. She asked if any surveys had been conducted around workforce and workforce housing. Commissioner Fewer also noted that the lack of experienced drivers could be decreased by incentivizing operators to stay with the agency longer, looking into issues like housing, retirement benefits, subsidies for housing, paid internships, and increased opportunities for city employment that are imperative to City operations. She also inquired of the status of the recently hired Human Resources personnel to recruit for the agency. Commissioner Fewer offered to work with SFMTA staff on the hiring practices to secure more experienced candidates into the Muni family with a pipeline development, informed by thinking outside of the box.

Ms. Kirschbaum answered that in District 1, there was opportunity to possibly fill more maintenance positions through Washington High School's summer intern program, in which candidates got real hands-on experience in a field of which the students may not have previously considered, and it created a pipeline into apprenticeship into the agency. She also stated that the agency was excited to be a part of the pipeline, seeing that there will always be a need for that type of highly skilled and paid



workforce; and that further workforce investment will be needed into the future.

Commissioner Mandelman echoed the appreciation for the working group, noting that the 18 to 24 month timeframe for recommendations purposely didn't deeply address budget concerns with the group acknowledging that large amounts of funding, including local contribution, were expected for the necessary solutions to be implemented over the next decades. He also commented that the group could redouble its efforts to address the SFMTA operator shortage by taking advantage of local opportunities to increase resources.

Ms. Kirschbaum concurred with Commissioners Fewer and Mandelman and highlighted the challenge of needing more resources to deliver the SFMTA's goal of excellent transit service, but also noted that the structural deficit was increasing faster than revenues controlled by SFMTA.

Commissioner Walton commented that the city needed to be aggressive in its outreach recruitment strategies to increase operators, apprenticeships, and pathway programs by working with City College (of San Francisco) and city workforce providers. He also expressed that a recruitment plan should be documented so that the Board could know how exactly to support and help the SFMTA in its employment efforts.

Ms. Kirschbaum agreed.

Commissioner Preston expressed his appreciation for the city's transit riders and operators who experience the frustration of street congestion, echoed Commissioner Safai's request for Direct Tumlin to attend a future board meeting, and asked if there was a commitment in the budget process to reflect fully funding all hiring shortfalls needed to be addressed by summer of 2021.

Ms. Kirschbaum stated that the SFMTA board was deeply committed and focused on operator hiring and had strongly endorsed their staff's recruitment efforts to fill vacancies, bringing the agency on track to address the operator shortage. She also noted that the SFMTA board was currently reviewing the hiring and budgeting proposals presented by staff, that they received the same presentation the Transportation Authority Board had received, and most likely would support implementing the recommendations of the working group.

Commissioner Preston commented that funding should start with these types of recommendations and the city should be aggressively pursuing the revenue needed to implement the goals, and expressed concerns about encouraging reduction of ridership. He asked for clarification on the SFMTA's position on incentivizing ridership or increased demand.

Ms. Kirschbaum explained that generating ridership through excellent service was the agency's goal and delivery, but also did not want to increase the operator shortage until the problem was solved. She noted that the agency is de facto experiencing a 2-3% service cut due to missed runs due to the operator shortage.

Commissioner Preston expressed appreciation for the clarification and shared the SFMTA's goals of increasing ridership, noting that this aspect was an integral part of city's work. He commented on fare increases resulted in suppressed ridership and raised concerns about relying on this method to raise operating revenues. Commissioner Preston asked if the agency was looking at the demand and needs of



the system in its determination to increase fares.

Ms. Kirschbaum challenged the assumption, stating her observation that Muni riders are much more sensitive to reliable and frequent service when making a travel decision than on fares, noting that Muni has discounted fares for those who need them and depend on transit to get around. Ms. Kirschbaum continued noting that fare indexing is currently part of SFMTA's fare policy and that the working group scope didn't address this topic as it was focused on excellent service. She that the SFMTA Board is reviewing feedback from the public and will discuss the fares as part of the budget process.

Commissioner Preston agreed that service was the biggest driver of ridership, but aggressively seeking funding was better than trying to have riders pay more and that fare income should not be a tradeoff with decreasing service.

Commissioner Safai commented on the staffing portion, noting that SFMTA's human resources was not yet fully staffed and that it was important to include the union on hiring discussions for operators and a crucial aspect of coming up with a successful hiring plan, as well as helping to avoid many of the problems the agency experienced with the purchase of vehicles. He asked that when Director Tumlin comes to a future meeting, he reports on the specifics of the SFMTA's hiring plan.

Ms. Kirschbaum acknowledged the comments and also stated that all the hiring information was available on the City Controller's website. She noted that the operators were the best ambassadors for the work and could also help with some of the partnerships that Commissioner Walton discussed in promoting the field as a career path.

Commissioner Yee suggested that the SFMTA look for and contract with recruiting organizations that could walk candidates through the process of becoming operators, noting that young people get stuck after the internship, without connections to employment as an operator and the agency has to look at how to close the gap. He asked the SFMTA to let the Transportation Authority Board know how they could help in the process.

Ms. Kirschbaum agreed that a continuous pipeline was critical in closing those hiring gaps. She also clarified that the SFMTA's human resources department was very focused on the operator hiring, having doubled the staff in 2019, and implementing resources like City Drive, which helps drivers obtain a commercial permit. She commented the other vacancy challenges were what the working group helped the agency to articulate.

Commissioner Safai asked for Director Tumlin to report back to the Board on the average hiring process time and if it's being accelerated to fill the vacancies.

Chair Peskin expressed that the Board would continue to work with the SFMTA for years to come on the issues. He also noted that, having helped the SFMTA develop its legislative authority in 2007, the entire city was invested in helping the SFMTA and in improving Muni's reliability, and that the SFMTA should seek more counsel within City Hall and from other city agencies.

During public comment, Roger Marengo, President of Transit Operators Union, commented that the recent round of negotiations last year helped with the operator shortage, in terms of wages and wage progression. He also noted the amount of



assaults had not decreased and wanted to highlight these issues to the Board.

Francisco Da Costa asked if the Board provided the Muni Reliability Working Group feedback throughout the process. He spoke to his dissatisfaction with Muni service and its lack of cleanliness.

Eileen Boken stated that she attended regional sub-committee meetings and that the final report excluded many recommendations that were highlighted at those meetings. She spoke against the SFMTA's current culture.

Christopher Peterson commented that Muni reliability also depended on cooperation with partner agencies throughout the region, noting the lack of transit-first policies throughout the region and urgency to address climate crisis matters. He asked that the Board use both its formal and informal authority to ensure all agencies respect transit-first mandates, especially tackling transit improvement controversies with genuine advocacy rather than more process and delays, to keep up with climate crisis needs.

15. Information on Findings of the Clean Miles Standard - INFORMATION

Chair Peskin continued the item without objection.

There was no public comment.

Other Items

16. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

17. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

18. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:19 p.m.