



RESOLUTION APPROVING THE PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PROGRAM OF PROJECTS
IDENTIFIED THROUGH THE BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN
PROCESS

WHEREAS, The Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) established the Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP) to serve Communities of Concern, address gaps and barriers identified through a collaborative and inclusive planning process, and improve transportation choices for low-income persons; and

WHEREAS, Through Cycle 5 of its LTP MTC awarded \$600,000 to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) to implement recommendations from a participatory budgeting pilot program as part of its Bayview Community Based Transportation Plan (CBTP) process; and

WHEREAS, Participatory budgeting enables residents to nominate and vote on priority projects to be funded with an established budget; and

WHEREAS, The LTP has a 20% local match requirement for the final participatory budgeting pilot program of projects, amounting to \$150,000 to match MTC's \$600,000 grant for a total budget of \$750,000; and

WHEREAS, As San Francisco's Congestion Management Agency, the Transportation Authority is responsible for providing support, ensuring that SFMTA complies with MTC's requirements, and approving the final program of projects; and

WHEREAS, As required by MTC's guidelines, SFMTA staff worked with Bayview residents to establish a Community Steering Committee that adopted a Participatory Budgeting Rulebook to guide the process and community outreach strategy, developed project proposals in collaboration with SFMTA staff, selected which projects to place on the ballot, and concurred with the final program of projects; and

WHEREAS, The community nominated project ideas in coordination with the SFMTA's Bayview CBTP outreach process and, over a 7-week period beginning in July 2019, voted on projects to receive the \$750,000 in available Participatory Budgeting funding; and



WHEREAS, Attachment 1 shows the voting results, a ranked list of projects, and the SFMTA's funding recommendation, consistent with the Participatory Budgeting Rulebook which specified that 80% of the funding be used for operating projects and 20% for operating projects; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA identified an alternative source of funds to increase all-day service frequencies on the 44 O'Shaughnessy (the highest-ranked project), improving upon the participatory budgeting proposal which would have only improved frequencies during the morning commute, and freeing up \$600,000 in LTP operating funds for the next highest scoring project; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA developed its recommendation as detailed in Attachment 1 and summarized as a program of projects in Attachment 2 for the \$770,000 in total available participatory budgeting funds by assigning funding to the remaining projects in ranked order, bypassing the next-highest project when there was insufficient funding to fully cover its cost; and

WHEREAS, The recommended program of projects includes three new Transit Assistant positions that, over the next three years, will focus on aiding transit riders and acting as a safety presence on the 29 Sunset, 44 O'Shaughnessy, and T Third transit lines in the Bayview, as well as four crosswalk projects and two bus shelter projects, with the scope, schedule, and funding plan details shown in Attachment 3; and

WHEREAS, Projects that were not voted to receive LTP funds may be advanced as part of the larger Bayview CBTP investment plan; and

WHEREAS, At its November 20, 2019 meeting, the Citizens Advisory Committee was briefed on the subject request and unanimously approved a motion of support for the staff recommendation; now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Transportation Authority hereby approves the Participatory Budgeting Program of Projects Identified through the Bayview CBTP; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Executive Director is hereby authorized to communicate this information to MTC, other relevant agencies, and interested parties.



Attachments:

1. Staff Recommendation
2. Finalized Project List
3. Summaries of Projects Recommended for Funding



**San Francisco
County Transportation
Authority**

BD121019

RESOLUTION NO. 20-21

The foregoing Resolution was approved and adopted by the San Francisco County Transportation Authority at a regularly scheduled meeting thereof, this 17th day of December 2019, by the following votes:

Ayes: Commissioners Fewer, Mandelman, Mar, Preston, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Walton and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Haney (1)

 12-18-19

Aaron Peskin
Chair

Date

ATTEST:

 12/18/19

Tilly Chang
Executive Director

Date

**Attachment 1
Bayview CBTP Participatory Budgeting
Detailed Funding Recommendation**

Rank Based on Votes	Votes	Project	Participatory Budgeting Funds		Notes
			Requested	Recommended	
Operating Projects					
1	577	44 O'Shaughnessy - Increase morning commute frequency from 10 minutes to 9 minutes.	\$370,000	\$0	LTP funds are no longer needed. SFMTA identified alternate funding for an increase service on the 44 O'Shaughnessy throughout the day (not only during the morning commute) which will include this scope of work.
2	489	Transit Assistant Program - two Transit Assistants for three years	\$405,000	\$620,000	Recommendation combines projects 2 and 3.F18 With the available funding, SFMTA is able to fund a third Transit Assistant position for three years.
3	424	Transit Assistant Program - two Transit Assistants for two years	\$275,000		

Funds Available for Operating Projects¹ \$620,000

Funds Recommended¹ \$620,000

Attachment 1
Bayview CBTP Participatory Budgeting
Detailed Funding Recommendation

			Participatory Budgeting Funds		
Rank Based on Votes	Votes	Project	Requested	Recommended	Notes
Capital					
1	432	Silver Avenue at Bayshore Boulevard - Crosswalk improvement	\$10,000	\$10,000	Fully funded.
2	415	Williams Avenue at Apollo Street - Crosswalk improvement	\$75,000	\$75,000	Fully funded.
3	413	Lane Street at 3rd Street - New crosswalk, curb ramps, and curb extensions	\$100,000	\$0	Insufficient funding for project after funding higher community priorities. Project will be considered for inclusion in the Community Based Transportation Plan (CBTP) implementation plan.
4	353	Newhall Street at 3rd Street - New crosswalk, curb ramps, and curb extensions	\$125,000	\$0	Insufficient funding for project after funding higher community priorities. Project will be considered for inclusion in the CBTP implementation plan.
5	340	Donner Avenue at Bayshore Boulevard - New crosswalk	\$25,000	\$25,000	Fully funded.
6	305	Van Dyke Avenue at 3rd Street - Crosswalk improvement	\$25,000	\$25,000	Fully funded.
7	301	Oakdale Avenue at Phelps Street - One new bus shelter	\$7,500	\$75,000	Fully funded.
8	264	Oakdale Avenue at Keith Street - Two new bus shelters	\$20,000	\$0	Insufficient funding for project after funding higher community priorities. Project will be considered for inclusion in the CBTP implementation plan.
9	258	Hudson Avenue at Ingalls Street - One new bus shelter	\$7,500	\$75,000	Fully funded.
10	253	Oakdale Avenue at Baldwin Court - One new bus shelter	\$10,000	\$0	Insufficient funding for project after funding higher community priorities. Project will be considered for inclusion in the CBTP implementation plan.
11	251	Ingalls Street at Harbor Road - Two new bus shelters	\$20,000	\$0	Insufficient funding for project after funding higher community priorities. Project will be considered for inclusion in the CBTP implementation plan.

Funds Available for Capital Projects \$150,000
Funds Recommended \$150,000

¹ Per the Rulebook policy adopted by the Steering Committee, 80% of funding (\$600,000) is available for operating projects and 20% (\$150,000) is available for capital projects. After the participatory budgeting process was complete, the SFMTA identified an additional \$20,000 to fully fund the Bayview Transit Assistants project.

**Attachment 2
Bayview CBTP Participatory Budgeting
Program of Projects**

Rank Based on Votes	Project Sponsor ¹	Project Name	District(s)	Total Project Cost	Participatory Budgeting Funds	
					LTP Cycle 5 Funds Recommended	Matching Funds ²
Operating Projects						
2 and 3	SFMTA	Bayview Transit Assistants	6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	\$620,000	\$600,000	\$20,000
Capital Projects						
1	SFMTA	Silver Ave at Bayshore Boulevard Intersection Improvement	10	\$10,000		\$10,000
2	SFMTA	Williams Ave at Apollo Street Intersection Improvement	10	\$75,000		\$75,000
5	SFMTA	Donner Avenue at Bayshore Boulevard Intersection Improvement	10	\$25,000		\$25,000
6	SFMTA	3rd Street at Van Dyke Avenue Intersection Improvement	10	\$25,000		\$25,000
7	SFMTA	Oakdale Avenue at Phelps Street New Bus Shelter	10	\$7,500		\$7,500
9	SFMTA	Hudson Avenue at Ingalls Street New Bus Shelter	10	\$7,500		\$7,500
Total:				\$770,000	\$600,000	\$170,000

Funding Share (20% required local match)

78%

22%

¹ Sponsor acronym: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA).

² Per MTC guidance, the program of projects is required to have a local match of at least 20%. Prop K or other local funds will serve as the local match for the capital projects. After the participatory budgeting process was complete, the SFMTA identified an additional \$20,000 to fully fund the Bayview Transit Assistants project. SFMTA consulted with the Steering Committee which concurred with this recommendation.

Attachment 3
Bayview CBTP Participatory Budgeting Pilot
Summaries of Projects Recommended for Funding

Participatory Budgeting – Bayview Transit Assistants

Sponsor: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

Recommended Cycle 5 LTP (PB Pilot) Funds: \$620,000

Recommended Phase: Operations

Districts: 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11

Scope:

The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) will fund three new Transit Assistant positions through the Muni Transit Assistance Program (MTAP). Transit Assistants (TAs) aid transit riders, answer questions about transit service, deter vandalism, act as an unarmed safety presence on transit lines, and de-escalate conflicts between riders (often youth). TAs work in teams of two and their hours of operation are 10AM to 6PM. The three TA positions will be hired on a 3-year contract and will ride on the 29 Sunset, the 44 O’Shaughnessy, and the T-Third lines.

The area of operation for these new TA staff will focus on the Bayview and segments of the transit system Bayview residents ride on most frequently.

- **29 Sunset** – TA staff will ride on the 29 Sunset from City College of San Francisco in the west to 3rd Street at Fitzgerald Avenue in the east. TA staff will only ride east of 3rd Street on the 29 Sunset if shadowed by SFPD due to past instances of violence against TA staff.
- **44 O’Shaughnessy** – TA staff will ride on the 44 O’Shaughnessy from the Juvenile Justice Center on Portola Drive in the west to 3rd Street at Palou Avenue in the east. TA staff will only ride east of 3rd Street on the 44 O’Shaughnessy if shadowed by SFPD due to past instances of violence against TA staff.
- **T-Third** – TA staff will ride on the T-Third from the Bayshore/Arleta station in the south to the 4th & King station in the north.

The TAs funded through this project will be hired from the Bayview.

Schedule:

TA positions are funded on 3-year contracts. Hiring and training will take place in the spring of 2020, with the three new TAs deployed on the 29 Sunset, 44 O’Shaughnessy, and T-Third from July 2020 through June 2023.

Cost:

Bayview Transit Assistants	\$620,000
Total Cost	\$620,000

Funding Plan:

Source	Status	Funding	% of Cost by Fund Source
LTP Cycle 5 – PB Pilot ¹	Planned	\$600,000	97%
Local funds ²	Planned	\$20,000	3%
Total Funding		\$620,000	

¹The entirety of the Lifeline grant is being allocated to this single project because of fund source eligibility requirements. The 20% local match requirement for the Lifeline grant is being fulfilled through local funding of the approved capital projects.

²The additional \$20,000 necessary to fund these three TA positions must come from operations-eligible funding sources. Eligible local funds could include SFMTA Operating Funds or future cycles of San Francisco’s Lifeline Transportation Program.

Project Location:



Figure 1: Bayview Transit Assistants

Participatory Budgeting – Transit Access Capital Improvements

Sponsor: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

Recommended Cycle 5 LTP (PB Pilot) Funds: \$150,000

Recommended Phase: Construction

District: 10

Scope:

The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) will implement a series of capital improvements across the Bayview for the purpose of improving access to transit and rider comfort/safety while waiting for transit.

This scope is for construction costs only; design costs are being absorbed into the larger Bayview CBTP 5-Year Investment Plan. Design for these projects will commence following the delivery of in-progress Quick Build projects in the Bayview, anticipated for full completion by June 2020.

Crosswalk safety and access improvements:

Silver Avenue at Bayshore Boulevard

Signal retiming to increase crossing times for pedestrians and introduce a leading pedestrian indicator. This project will improve safety and access to the 44 O'Shaughnessy, 8 Bayshore, and 9 San Bruno.

Williams Avenue at Apollo Street

Crosswalk enhancements including a pedestrian median island, advance signage, and crosswalk markings. Project details for Williams at Apollo are contingent upon the implementation and evaluation of a quick build at this location, scheduled for construction in January 2020. Based on evaluation of the effectiveness of the quick build treatments, this project will fund installation of permanent concrete elements, either bulb-outs or a pedestrian refuge island.

This project location is an uncontrolled crosswalk across the 66'-wide Williams Avenue, providing access to the only supermarket in the Bayview: Foods Co. This project also provides access to the 54 Felton bus stop located on Phelps Street.

Donner Avenue at Bayshore Boulevard

New crosswalk across the eastern leg of the intersection, including a paint-and-post median island to shorten pedestrian crossing distances and exposure to vehicles. Donner Avenue meets Bayshore Blvd at an oblique angle, with a 160' wide intersection opening. There is no crosswalk at this location, creating a barrier for pedestrians traveling north/south. The project will provide access to the 54 Felton.

Van Dyke Avenue at 3rd Street

Crosswalk enhancements at the intersection of Williams Avenue, 3rd Street, Van Dyke Avenue, and Lane Street, including upgrade to an existing painted safety zone in the southwest corner and potential additional safety zones around the Lane Street intersection with Van Dyke Avenue.

This complex 5-way intersection has 7 marked crosswalks. Residents expressed a desire to improve pedestrian safety and access to the T-Third platform and slow down the speeds of turning vehicles. This project improves access to the T-Third and 54 Felton.

Bus Shelter Installation:

Oakdale Avenue at Phelps Street

Install a new bus shelter for the 23 Monterey in the northeast corner of the intersection, adjacent to the Southeast Community Facility. Project will require relocation of existing bike racks.

Hudson Avenue at Ingalls Street

Install a new bus shelter for the 44 O’Shaughnessy and 54 Felton in the southwest corner of the intersection. Installation of the shelter on the brick sidewalk may require additional concrete footings.

This project improves transit access and comfort for the low-income residents of affordable housing on the Hunters View hilltop.

Schedule:

		Phase	Start	End
Crosswalk Projects	Silver Ave at Bayshore Blvd	Design	Q1 – FY 20/21	Q3 – FY 20/21
		Construction	Q4 – FY 20/21	Q2 – FY 21/22
	Williams Ave at Apollo St	Design	Q4 – FY 20/21	Q2 – FY 21/22
		Construction	Q3 – FY 21/22	Q1 – FY 22/23
	Donner Ave at Bayshore Blvd	Design	Q1 – FY 20/21	Q3 – FY 20/21
		Construction	Q4 – FY 20/21	Q2 – FY 21/22
	Van Dyke Ave at 3 rd St	Design	Q1 – FY 20/21	Q3 – FY 20/21
		Construction	Q4 – FY 20/21	Q2 – FY 21/22
Bus Shelter Projects	Oakdale Ave at Phelps St	Design	Q1 – FY 20/21	Q3 – FY 20/21
		Construction	Q4 – FY 20/21	Q2 – FY 21/22
	Hudson Ave at Ingalls St	Design	Q1 – FY 20/21	Q3 – FY 20/21
		Construction	Q4 – FY 20/21	Q2 – FY 21/22

Cost:

		Construction
Crosswalk Projects	Silver Ave at Bayshore Blvd	\$10,000
	Williams Ave at Apollo St	\$75,000
	Donner Ave at Bayshore Blvd	\$25,000
	Van Dyke Ave at 3 rd St	\$25,000
Bus Shelter Projects ¹	Oakdale Ave at Phelps St	\$7,500
	Hudson Ave at Ingalls St	\$7,500
Total Cost		\$150,000

¹ Project cost includes additional conduit required to provide power to these bus shelter locations beyond the standard length Clear Channel contractually provides. Costs are estimates based on previous contracts executed with SFPW to provide additional conduit.

Funding Plan:

Source	Status	Funding	% of Cost by Fund Source
Local funds (e.g. Prop K)	Programmed	150,000	100%
Total Funding		\$150,000	

Project Location:



Figure 2: Bayview Transit Access Capital Improvement Locations