



# DRAFT MINUTES

## San Francisco County Transportation Authority

Tuesday, December 10, 2019

### 1. Roll Call

Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.

**Present at Roll Call:** Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Walton and Yee (7)

**Absent at Roll Call:** Commissioners Ronen (entered during Item 2), Stefani (entered during Item 2), Brown (entered during Item 5) and Safai (entered during Item 7) (4)

### 2. Citizens Advisory Committee Report - INFORMATION

In regard to Item 5 on the agenda, John Larson, Chair of the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), reported that the CAC's comments focused around stakeholder engagement and in particular business engagement. He said that San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) staff noted that the project had a community working group, which included business along Market Street and Muni's F-loop turnaround, and was coordinating with developers on large projects for Mid-Market. Mr. Larson said the CAC also reacted favorably to the elimination of private vehicle traffic on all of Market Street, in the project area below 10th street. He said the CAC saw it as an advantage to reducing congestion and moving transit through the crowded artery. The CAC recommended approval of the item.

In regard to Item 7 on the agenda, Mr. Larson reported that the CAC's comments centered around the Muni Transit Assistance Program (MTAP) and the Bayview community based transportation planning process. He said the CAC was supportive of the transit assistance and the MTAP, given the vital role the program played in de-escalation and providing a safe environment for riders. He added that funding associated with the item would go toward allowing MTAP to increase the transit assistance presence on Bayview lines during working hours.

Mr. Larson said the CAC was also presented the 2019 San Francisco Congestion Management Program (CMP) and reported that the data and metrics used to inform the CMP were of particular interest to the CAC. He the CAC were interested to know whether the data from the CMP could be used for other projects and evaluations. He said Transportation Authority staff noted that data had been used already to support the Freeway Corridor Management Study and most recently the San Francisco Downtown Congestion Study. Mr. Larson announced that he was representing the CAC on the newly formed San Francisco Downtown Congestion Policy Advisory Committee.

Mr. Larson said he was looking forward to having the CAC at full capacity with the appointment of two new members and reported that the CAC not only represented the city's geographic diversity, but also the diversity of the people who live in San



Francisco. On behalf of the CAC he thanked staff for their professionalism.

Chair Peskin said the Board would address some of the things brought up relative to the Better Market Street project during Item 5 of the agenda.

During public comment Francisco Da Costa said congestion was getting worse and recommended that the Board see the congestion issues in-person. He asked that the CAC have empathy and compassion for the city's population, in particular the elderly population that was suffering from the adverse congestion impacts.

### **Consent Agenda**

3. **Approve the Minutes of the November 19, 2019 Meeting - ACTION**
4. **[Final Approval] Appoint Stephanie Liu and Kevin Ortiz to the Citizens Advisory Committee - ACTION**

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Walton moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Yee.

The Consent Agenda was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Stefani, Walton and Yee (9)

Absent: Commissioners Brown and Safai (2)

### **End of Consent Agenda**

5. **Allocate \$3,330,000 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds, with Conditions, to San Francisco Public Works for Better Market Street 5<sup>th</sup> to 8<sup>th</sup> Street Design and Bikeway Pilot - ACTION**

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming, and Cristina Olea, Project Manager at San Francisco Department of Public Works (SFPW), presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Chair Peskin thanked Ms. Olea for her professionalism and acknowledged the complexities of the project. He said that this body and in their other incarnation as the Board of Supervisors wrestled with mega projects as it related to impacts to both small businesses as well as residents. Chair Peskin said there had been policy conversations, both at the Transportation Authority and the Board of Supervisors that resulted in modest monetary compensations to small businesses. He said it was imperative to have an outreach plan to ensure stakeholder engagement. He noted that the Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project was 567 days behind schedule and that SFMTA did not engage stakeholders along the Van Ness corridor early enough. He asked about plans in place to apply lessons learned from Van Ness BRT other large projects like the Central Subway.

Ms. Olea said SFPW had strategies to address impacts to businesses. She said the project would be designed and constructed in phases to minimize impacts, that there was community and stakeholder outreach, and that SFPW would work with the contractor so they were aware of the impacts to businesses. She said SFPW would assess where they could stage for construction that would not impact businesses. Ms.



Olea said that the public would be able to walk up to businesses along Market street and that SFPW would provide as much access to buildings and properties as possible while providing for deliveries on side streets. She noted that the fact that there isn't any parking on Market Street makes it a bit easier.

Chair Peskin said the project team should be able to provide a comprehensive list of options to help businesses including technical assistance, financial assistance, and/or temporary relocation. Chair Peskin said that business mitigation should have been incorporated into other large projects from the get-go and that businesses had suffered due to project delays. He said he had asked the San Francisco Office of the Controller to analyze sales tax data on the Van Ness corridor and they found that sales taxes on Van Ness Avenue plummeted when construction began. He requested that Joaquin Torres from the Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD), incoming SFMTA Director of Transportation, Jeffrey Tumlin, Mohammed Nuru of SFPW, Board of Supervisors President, Norman Yee, agency-wide staff and himself all work together to proactively and effectively address business impacts and keep this topic front of mind.

Jonathan Rewers, Program Manager at the SFMTA, reminded the Board that the city had a construction mitigation program. He said that the project team could apply lessons learned in advance to Better Market Street. He said that the project team can work with OEWD to conduct a business survey along the corridor and can identify businesses that might be impacted directly by construction. Mr. Rewers stated that there was \$1 million set aside for a revolving loan for projects like Better Market Street, where the SFMTA had an applicable scope and was a project partner. He noted that SFMTA set up the revolving loan to help in advance of construction for businesses to access through OEWD if they had cash flow issues. He recommended setting up a business advisory committee to advise on impacts businesses would face during construction. He said that the city had the tools and protocols in place, and he committed on behalf of the SFMTA that they would work with both OEWD and SFPW to have a detailed plan in place that would be executed prior to construction beginning.

Chair Peskin said that he wanted to make sure that impacts to businesses were prioritized.

Ms. Olea reiterated that SFPW and SFMTA would develop a plan and that SFPW could have a draft at their next quarterly update.

Chair Peskin said he wanted staff to think about how to incorporate construction mitigation and impacts to businesses into project recommendations.

Commissioner Haney said businesses along Market Street had challenges, with vacant storefronts and public safety issues and he looked forward to reviewing specific plans for the first phase, as well as the entire corridor. He recommended that SFPW include the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) as part of the discussion given a number of foot beats in the area. He said this project was at the core of the city and that it was important to get it right.

During public comment Francisco Da Costa spoke to the departures of many San Francisco businesses as a result of large transportation projects. He recommended that the city agencies hire engineers who understood transportation and need assessments.



Janice Li, Advocacy Director at the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition (SFBC), said SFBC was in support of the project and asked the Board to hold the city accountable during each construction phase. She spoke to the importance of being part of the conversation during the planning phase.

Bob Feinbaum, President of Save Muni, asked that the Board recommend that a representative from the Transit Workers' Union be involved during the planning phase. He said it was important to include the drivers from the very beginning.

Jodie Medeiros, Executive Director at WalkSF, spoke in support of the project and offered the services of WalkSF for outreach to businesses. She noted that the project would result in more foot traffic and people on bikes.

After public comment, Chair Peskin requested that the Board hear policy recommendations from staff focused on mitigating impacts from the project at the December 17 Board meeting.

Commissioner Mandelman moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Yee.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Stefani, Walton and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Safai (1)

**6. Allocate \$1,519,125, with Conditions, and Appropriate \$110,875 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds for 3 Requests - ACTION**

Mike Pickford, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

During public comment Janice Li thanked Commissioner Ronen for the Alemany Realignment Study request and noted that it was a long-term plan.

Commissioner Walton moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Ronen.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Stefani, Walton and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Safai (1)

**7. Approve the Participatory Budgeting Program of Projects Identified Through the Bayview Community Based Transportation Plan Process - ACTION**

Commissioner Walton provided opening remarks and stated that San Francisco had recently participated in a regional participatory budgeting pilot which began prior to his election to the Board. He thanked the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) for awarding \$600,000 in Lifeline Transportation Program funds to implement priorities from the Bayview Community-Based Transportation Plan participatory budgeting process and also thanked everyone that advanced this effort, including the SFMTA, the steering committee, the technical advisory committee, B-magic, the Transportation Authority, MTC and the Bayview residents that were engaged in the



process. He noted that through this process, SFMTA was able to fund the top scoring project, increased service on the 44 O'Shaughnessy, with other funds, which allowed the Lifeline Transportation Program funds to be used to improve transit safety and accessibility in the Bayview. Commissioner Walton stated that the projects would benefit transportation in the Bayview, and that he was happy to support the recommendation. He noted that there were efforts to increase equity in transportation in the Bayview, which included a 15 Third study to provide better transit down the corridor, signal priority for the T Third, increased access to transportation hubs, downtown commercial corridors and rail stations, and ending switchbacks.

Aprile Smith, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

During public comment Janice Li encouraged the Board to approve the recommendation.

Francisco Da Costa said programs like the MTAP should serve those who have been traumatized on buses. He recommended that the Board speak to Muni drivers to get a real understanding of what occurs on buses.

Bob Feinbaum said Save Muni was in support of projects that would improve the 15 Muni bus, and said the portion of the route serving Telegraph Hill should be restored, as well.

Commissioner Walton moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Ronen.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Walton and Yee (11)

**Commissioner Safai moved to excuse Commissioners Fewer, seconded by Commissioner Ronen. Commissioner Fewer was excused without objection.**

**8. Approve the 2019 San Francisco Congestion Management Program - ACTION**

Bhargava Sana, Senior Modeler, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Commissioner Yee asked if the Congestion Management Program (CMP) compared the difference in bus speeds before and after the red transit-only lanes were installed.

Mr. Sana said the previous cycle looked at how the red lanes impacted transit speeds, especially on Mission Street. He said the review showed an improvement in bus speeds, but noted that the CMP process only monitors speeds every two years. He noted that other factors such as changes in land use and population also needed to be taken into account.

Commissioner Yee asked if the percentage improvement for red transit-only lanes was any different from other lanes that did not have the red transit-only lanes.

Commissioner Yee also said it would be good to know if the red lanes were showing an improvement in average bus speed, given that the city was making an investment in those lanes.

Mr. Sana said the CMP had the data and ability to look at transit speeds during specific periods to understand the impact of transit-only lanes better but that would



require a more focused analysis.

Director Chang added that the SFMTA had documented the benefits of the red lanes and Muni Forward program and could provide an information update at a future meeting. She mentioned that Muni bus speeds had been basically flat over the past several cycles from 2011 to 2019 despite auto traffic speeds declining, and that could be attributed to the Muni Forward program and the transit priority treatments.

Director Chang said transit priority treatments like the red transit-only lanes enabled Muni bus speeds to maintain an average city wide flat speed - and this was a win in the face of population and job growth that was affecting car speeds.

Commissioner Yee said it was important to inform the public why investments in transit priority treatments were necessary.

Commissioner Haney asked if it was accurate to say the biggest driver of congestion over the past 8-9 years was Transportation Network Companies (TNCs). He also asked if there was an update to the TNCs and Congestion Study report. He said it seemed that there was more TNC growth and congestion on the roads from 2016 through the end of 2019.

Mr. Sana said the TNCs and Congestion Study report showed that TNCs had contributed about 50% of the increase in congestion, with population and job growth making up the other 50%.

Director Chang said the data gathered for the TNCs and Congestion Study report in 2016 was collected independently from TNCs. She said subsequent to the report, TNCs reported their trip data for the more recent two years. Director Chang said TNCs were estimating 13.2% of vehicle miles traveled in the city, which was a higher percentage than what the Transportation Authority estimated in 2016. She noted that TNCs reported data included regional trips, whereas the Transportation Authority's study only studied trips that happened within San Francisco.

Commissioner Haney asked if there was a plan to do a further in-depth analysis. He said it seemed like there had been a lot more growth and a deeper impact on congestion.

Director Chang said the 2016 report recommended a TNC per-trip fee, similar to Proposition D, and looking at congestion pricing and curb management. She said the SFMTA was taking a lead on curb management, in addition to dedicating more street space to efficient modes. Director Chang said staff could come back with more proposals for how to study TNC issues in particular.

Mr. Sana noted that the Transportation Authority collaborated recently with the MTC to field a household travel survey and over sampled for TNC users. He said that a report out could be provided once the data was analyzed.

Commissioner Haney said TNC growth was the number one driver of congestion, particularly in Districts 3 and 6, and was a key issue that needed to be monitored.

During public comment, Bob Feinbaum stated that one way to mitigate congestion was to get more people on to public transit. He said Save Muni favored a regional bus system, similar to what the MTC was proposing. He also suggested that the city work with AC Transit to provide additional regional bus routes.

Francisco Da Costa said that the CMP report failed to highlight the role of



construction on many of the thoroughfares. He asked what the Board was doing to make it easier for seniors to take public transportation.

Commissioner Yee moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Mandelman.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Stefani, Safai, Walton and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Fewer (1)

**Chair Peskin called Items 9 and 10 together.**

**9. Accept the Audit Report for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2019 - ACTION**

**10. Approve the Revised Debt Policy and Ratifying the Investment Policy - ACTION**

Cynthia Fong, Deputy Director for Finance and Administration, and Ahmed Gharaibeh, Vavrinek, Eide Bailly LLP, presented the items per the staff memorandums.

Chair Peskin thanked Ms. Fong for the briefings provided to him in his capacity as Chair and for keeping the agency's financial house in the best of order.

During public comment Francisco Da Costa said Ms. Chang was very astute in her role and tanked her on behalf of all of the citizens of San Francisco.

Commissioner Mar moved to approve the items, seconded by Commissioner Brown.

The items were approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Stefani, Safai, Walton and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Fewer (1)

### **Other Items**

**11. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION**

Commissioner Mar requested that the Transportation Authority draft and present to the Board a resolution on the transit impacts of Senate Bill 50, with mitigation options to expand transit service in conjunction with new developments through incentives and creative multi-source funding strategies. He said he wanted to ensure that the Board take stock of the transit side of the SB50 conversation and look at the potential negative impact of SB50 on transit services. He noted that last March the San Francisco Planning Department issued a memorandum on SB50 that raised the concern that by tying zoning standards to transit service and infrastructure, it could create an incentive for jurisdictions throughout the state to suspend transit service enhancements or avoid planning for increased transit service all together. He further noted that the SFMTA and Transportation Authority raised a concern that many of the transit lines and stations targeted by SB50 in San Francisco were already overcrowded or deficient in their state of repair. Commissioner Mar said up-zoning would create more demand or impact on the city's inadequate transit services and infrastructure. He said on order for housing density to be a step forward, the city needed to invest in transit service improvements alongside new housing development. Commissioner



Mar said transportation authorities needed to have a say on real estate development bills impacting and tied directly to their work.

Chair Peskin said he would be adjourning the meeting by commending outgoing Commissioner, Vallie Brown.

Director Chang thanked Commissioner Brown and expressed her and the staff's sincere appreciation for her leadership on transportation. She said Commissioner Brown's work over the past year had been reflective of her commitment to sustainable transportation and safe streets. Director Chang also expressed her appreciation to the hard work of Commissioner Brown and her staff to improve transportation in the city.

Commissioner Brown thanked Transportation Authority staff for their diligent work and ability to get Board requests done on time.

**12. Public Comment**

During public comment Francisco Da Costa said there was a traffic light on San Bruno Avenue that was causing congestion during peak commute hours. He asked why the city decided to remove parking along San Bruno Avenue with out properly outreaching to the public.

Bob Feinbaum, member of the Transbay Joint Power Authority CAC, asked when there would be an allocation request for phase 2 of the Downtown Rail Extension project and an update on the SFMTA's Siemens Light-Rail Vehicle procurement.

**13. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:34 a.m.