



DRAFT MINUTES

Citizens Advisory Committee

Wednesday, September 25, 2019

1. Committee Meeting Call to Order

Chair Larson called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.

CAC members present: Robert Gower, David Klein, John Larson, Jerry Levine, Peter Tannen, Sophia Tupuola and Rachel Zack (7)

CAC Members Absent: Myla Ablog (entered during Item 3), Kian Alavi (entered during Item 3) and Ranyee Chiang (3)

Transportation Authority staff members present were Priyoti Ahmed, Amber Crabbe, Anna LaForte, Maria Lombardo, Mike Pickford, Alberto Quintanilla, Steve Rehn, and Luis Zurinaga (consultant).

2. Chair's Report - INFORMATION

Chair Larson welcomed new Deputy Director of Planning, Hugh Louch and Assistant Deputy Director for Capital Projects, Yana Waldman to the Transportation Authority. He noted that Commissioner Haney nominated Danielle Thoe to the CAC to replace outgoing District 6 representative Becky Hogue at the September 24, 2019 Transportation Authority Board meeting and said representatives from the Downtown Rail Extension Peer Review Study panel would present the panel's final recommendations at the October 8, 2019 Transportation Authority Board meeting.

David Klein requested that next month's Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) update provide numerical and statistical details in terms of the effectiveness and impact of the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's (SFMTA) outreach efforts along the Van Ness corridor.

There was no public comment.

Consent Agenda

3. Approve the Minutes of the September 4, 2019 Meeting - ACTION

4. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Execution of Amendment No. 4 to the Memorandum of Agreement with the Treasure Island Development Authority for Yerba Buena Island Vista Point Operation Services to Increase the Amount by \$640,000, to a Total Amount Not to Exceed \$1,595,000, and Extend the Agreement through June 30, 2021 - ACTION

5. State and Federal Legislation Update - INFORMATION

6. Citizens Advisory Committee Appointment - INFORMATION

7. Muni Transit Performance Working Group Update - INFORMATION

In regard to Item 7 on the agenda, Jerry Levine asked if the structure and process to



select members for the Muni Transit Performance Working Group could be explained.

In regard to Item 4 on the agenda, Peter Tannen asked what the ridership had been on the weekend/holiday shuttle from Treasure Island to Vista Point.

Dale Dennis, consultant to the Transportation Authority, introduced Richard Rovetti, Deputy Director for the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA), and stated that Mr. Rovetti could provide information on the successes of the shuttle program.

Mr. Rovetti said usage of the weekend shuttle was around 100-150 passengers per day and noted that the last weekend of each month saw 200-300 passengers per day because of the Treasure Island flea market.

Peter Tannen asked how many visitors used bicycles when visiting Vista Point or the flea market.

Mr. Rovetti said he did not have that figure but stated that there were a lot of cyclists using the shuttle, as well as hiking groups and walkers.

Chair Larson announced that there was not a presentation ready for Item 7 but that a presentation could be agendaized at a future meeting and/or staff could send a follow up email to CAC members.

During public comment Edward Mason requested an increase in Treasure Island Muni service and reliability, saying the 20-minute headways were not being met and that the irregular service was an area of concern for Treasure Island residents. He gave an example

Peter Tannen moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Rachel Zack.

The Consent Agenda was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Ablog, Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine, Tannen, Tupuola and Zack (9)

Absent: CAC Member Chiang (1)

After the consent agenda Chair Larson announced that this would be Myla Ablog's last meeting and thanked her for 6 years of outstanding service as a member of the CAC.

Myla Ablog thanked the CAC, Transportation Authority staff, Supervisor Brown's office and said she was starting a master's program at the University of San Francisco.

End of Consent Agenda

8. Update on the Caltrain Modernization Program - INFORMATION

Casey Fromson, Director of Government and Community Affairs at Caltrain, presented the item.

Jerry Levine asked if Caltrain had plans to increase safety measures to prevent fatalities on rail tracks.

Ms. Fromson said Caltrain was providing educational outreach to inform customers about the dangers of being on the tracks and noted that Caltrain was partnering with MythBusters as part of September's rail safety month. She said that on the engineering side Caltrain was working to reduce access points and implementing grade separations. She added that there were currently 20 grade separation projects



in discussion but did note that the estimated cost was \$7 billion.

Chair Larson asked what Caltrain's plan was for train service past the Tamien station, given that the electrification project only extended to Tamien Station, requiring diesel trains to provide service to the south.

Ms. Fromson said that 19 electrified trains, that are expected to be in service in 2022, would not be a complete fleet and Caltrain would still have diesel trains that would be able to go all the way to Gilroy. She said the State of California was attempting to purchase Union Pacific rail past San Jose that would allow Caltrain to fully implement electrification to Gilroy at some point in the future.

During public comment Robin Kropp said Palo Alto residents protested on the train tracks to help prevent students from committing suicide. She asked if the interior and seating arrangement of the new trains could be described.

Casey Fromson referenced calmod.org as a way to view renderings of the interior of the trains and said the seats would face both forward and back with ADA areas in each car. She noted that Caltrain had collected over 10,000 comments from the public as part of their outreach.

After public comment, Jerry Levine said he rode the SMART train and noted the large windows and great visibility. He shared that the only problem he encountered was that the sun at certain times of the day hit people directly in the face and there was no shade to protect riders. He asked if that element had been addressed.

Casey Fromson said she would need to follow up with a response.

9. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Allocation of \$24,253,024, with Conditions, and Appropriate \$749,724 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds for 23 Requests - ACTION

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming, and Christopher Kidd, Senior Transportation Planner at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Myla Ablog stated that the Port of San Francisco CAC had discussed Muni's practice of turning back T-Third light rail trains before reaching the end of the route after San Francisco Giants games. With the opening of the Chase Center, Myla asked if SFMTA had thought of quick fixes to ensure riders needing to go South past Oracle Park and the Chase Center would be able to reach their final destinations after events.

Sophia Tupuola asked how the Safe Routes to School program served the needs of Communities of Concern (COC).

Ana Vasuedo, Safe Routes to School Coordinator at the SFMTA, said the program served 103 schools and had designated the subset of COC schools for deeper community engagement. She noted that outreach efforts included multilingual printed materials as well as multilingual outreach staff. She added that the SFMTA would be providing community safety training in COCs that consider the unique barriers COCs may face - like do you feel safe - to encourage mode shift. She said factors for consideration when identifying schools for Safe Routes to Schools projects included proximity to pedestrian-involved collisions and the percentage of students who received subsidized lunches.

David Klein asked for additional information about Caltrain's new passenger counter technology, specifically whether it would track passenger movements. He also asked if



any paratransit funding went to Transportation Network Companies (TNCs).

Ms. LaForte said that no paratransit program funds went to TNCs.

Peter Skinner, Manager of Grants and Fund Programming at Caltrain, said data from the automatic passenger counters would provide accurate passenger counts at the 4th and King station, and that it did not track passengers.

David Klein said TNCs had used similar data to target first and last mile services, and could be useful for planning bus services. He asked if the information was solely for Caltrain use or would be released to the public.

Mr. Skinner said the information was for use by Caltrain and specific to the 4th and King station.

Robert Gower asked how the allocation of the \$700,000 in Prop K funds for the Lombard Crooked Street Paid Reservation System could be used prior to Governor Newsom's signing of the enabling legislation allowing the program to go forward or if the legislation didn't become law.

Rachel Hiatt, Assistant Deputy Director, said if Governor Newsom vetoed the legislation, the Prop K funding request would not advance to the second reading by the Transportation Authority Board, or would be deobligated if the Board had already approved the allocation.

Ms. LaForte said that the final status of the legislation would be known no later than October 13, 2019, prior to the Board's second reading of the request on October 22.

Rachel Zack asked about the performance of the Van Gogh Shuttles and how riders booked the shuttles.

Jonathan Cheng, Paratransit Planner at the SFMTA, said organizations that assist individuals with disabilities or people who were 65 years or older would arrange pick-up and drop-off times for group trips with the Van Gough shuttle coordinators.

Peter Tannen asked if an update could be provided on the 15th and Dolores Streets signal upgrade, noting that the poles had been installed a while ago, but there were still no signal heads.

Geraldine De Leon, Signal Projects Manager at the SFMTA, said the signal under construction at 15th and Dolores was one of 9 signals in the New Traffic Signals Contract 64 project, and said the signal was awaiting activation pending necessary work by Pacific Gas and Electric.

Jerry Levine asked where operating funds for the Lombard Crooked Street Paid Reservation System would come from if it was not self-sustaining after the first year of service.

Rachel Hiatt said the projected cost for the first year of service was \$2 million and that the projected fee revenue was slightly more than that. She said the program was intended to be self-sufficient but not intended to raise revenues in excess of what was needed for the program. She said if the service was not self-sufficient or if the revenues were excessive, the governing board would need to work with the vendor to adjust costs or prices or, if there was a large gap, change the approach of the program. She added that the state legislation allowed up to a 7-year pilot period, which was intended to give the administering agency a chance to ensure that cost and demand had stabilized.



Jerry Levine asked if the Transportation Authority would be asked to subsidize operations if revenues were insufficient to sustain the program.

Rachel Hiatt answered that the Transportation Authority would not be asked to subsidize operations.

Kian Alavi said he was concerned that Bike to Work Day 2020 was too heavily dependent on the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition (SFBC). He said in previous years neighborhoods in Districts 10 and 11 had been overlooked as locations for event activities. He asked what steps were being taken by the SFMTA to ensure that energizer stations were equitably stationed in the Bayview and Excelsior neighborhoods.

Crysta Highfield, Transportation Planner at the SFMTA, said the event was an SFBC event and the SFMTA sponsored it but did not set many requirements. She said the SFMTA could follow up with the Bicycle Coalition on their intentions for the 2020 Bike to Work Day event.

Kian Alavi asked what SFMTA did require as the lead sponsor.

Ms. Highfield said that the SFMTA set reporting requirements for the event and SFBC determined the locations.

Kian Alavi said that if \$40,000 was to be allocated, the SFMTA needed to ensure an equitable distribution of energizer stations throughout the city.

Sophia Tupuola expressed her support for amending the item to condition the Bike to Work Day 2020 allocation on an equitable distribution of event activities.

Robert Gower also spoke in favor of the proposed amendment.

Chair Larson asked what motivated the request for the Octavia Boulevard Circulation and Accessibility Study Update.

Priyoti Ahmed, Transportation Planner, said congestion on Octavia Boulevard to and from the freeway led to the study, as well as trip patterns on the street and surrounding areas. She added that the study would update the Transportation Authority's 2012 study on Octavia Boulevard's circulation.

With respect to the Bayview Community Based Transportation Plan, Sophia Tupuola asked how the SFMTA was going to address the high priority community issues that did not meet the participatory budgeting rulebook criteria. She also asked why the 44 O'Shaughnessy bus route was receiving additional investment while the T-Third service continued to be ignored.

Mr. Kidd said all of the proposals needed to have a willing sponsor from the SFMTA, which was the only eligible recipient of Lifeline Transportation Program funding within San Francisco and needed to fit within the budget constraints. He said the \$600,000 budget was not sufficient funding to provide a noticeable service increase on the T-Third line and therefore, the focus was on bus lines where there had been a demand for a service increase that could be met using the allotted \$600,000 budget.

Sophia Tupuola asked what additional steps could be taken to address the service needs on the T-Third line.

Mr. Kidd said the SFMTA was intending to include a policy recommendation section in the plan that would give voice to the concerns and needs expressed by the



community that could not be addressed through the participatory budgeting process. He added that he would continue to engage with Supervisor Walton's office and other divisions within the SFMTA to discuss what could be done to improve service within the community. Mr. Kidd said that the Southeast Muni Expansion project would provide increased transit service on new and modified bus lines within the Bayview.

Rachel Zack asked if the engagement process was viewed as successful and asked what generally happened to a policy recommendation at the SFMTA after a study was completed.

Mr. Kidd said participatory budgeting presented challenges given the funding constraints and needing to work across divisions, agencies and community groups. He said the effort was worthwhile to dedicate funds to the underinvested community and that there was a broad range of opinions from the community on the success of the planning process. He said he could not say precisely what would happen to the policy recommendation section after it was published but hoped it could become a tool for advocacy in the community.

Kian Alavi asked who served on the steering committee for the Bayview Study and whether they set the rulebook criteria for project selection.

Mr. Kidd said the steering committee members were listed on the project website and noted that they all either lived or worked in the Bayview. Mr. Kidd also confirmed that the steering committee established how the participatory budgeting process would work and at the end of the process, reviewed and approved the ballot format, ballot box locations and all the proposals eligible to be on the ballot.

Kian Alavi asked for an additional explanation of the SFMTA sponsorship requirement in order for a project to move forward.

Mr. Kidd said SFMTA divisions sponsored projects based on the type of projects that matched their line of work. An SFMTA division would need to be willing to implement a proposal to meet the rulebook criteria.

Kian Alavi asked how community-requested projects that did not receive internal sponsorship from the SFMTA would ever get completed.

Mr. Kidd said one lesson learned from the participatory budgeting pilot would be to include more SFMTA division representation from the beginning of the process.

Chair Larson recommended that the CAC review the project website to learn more about the participatory budget process.

During public comment Robin Kropp asked if there could be an update on the SFMTA's paratransit program, she noted with the decline in ramp taxis, folks were stranded at home waiting since there was no service. She asked how the ramp taxi incentives worked.

Leora Wineglass spoke about her experience with Muni buses and operators as a wheelchair user. She suggested that operators be provided Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) sensitivity training. She described the challenges of negotiating narrow ramps with a large wheelchair and getting on/off buses, especially if they are crowded, and the lack of space set aside for wheelchair users.

Evie Pozmentier thanked Kian Alavi for discussing bicycle equity and education. She asked if the SFMTA provided pedestrian and bicycle education trainings at schools.



Mr. Cheng said the ramp study incentives were meant to support the ramp taxi program and required taxi drivers who used the incentives to provide at least 20 monthly paratransit trips.

Chair Larson moved to approve the item with the following amendment: adding a condition to the SFMTA's Bike to Work Day 2020 request that requires energizer stations to be equitably distributed across the city as part of Bike to Work Day 2020. The amendment was seconded by Sophia Tupuola.

The amendment was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Ablog, Alavi, Chiang, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine, Tannen, Tupuola and Zack (9)

Absent: CAC Member Chiang (1)

David Klein moved to approve the item as amended, seconded by Kian Alavi.

The item was approved as amended by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Ablog, Alavi, Chiang, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine, Tannen, Tupuola and Zack (9)

Absent: CAC Member Chiang (1)

Chair Larson called Item 10 after Item 11.

10. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Adoption of the SoMa Youth and Family Special Use District Community Engagement Final Report - ACTION

Mike Pickford, Senior Transportation Planner, and Nick Carr, Transportation Planner at the SFMTA, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Myla Ablog gave the SFMTA kudos for the project and said she believed the South of Market Community Action Network (SOMCAN) had been advocating for pedestrian safety measures before the creation of Vision Zero.

There was no public comment.

Myla Ablog moved to approve the item, seconded by Sophia Tupuola.

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Ablog, Alavi, Chiang, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine, Tannen, Tupuola and Zack (9)

Absent: CAC Member Chiang (1)

Chair Larson called Item 11 before Item 10.

11. Adopt a Motion of Support to Approve San Francisco's Program of Projects for the 2020 Regional Transportation Improvement Program - ACTION

Amber Crabbe, Public Policy Manager, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

David Klein asked if the definition of an axle counter could be provided.

Alexandra Hallowell, Transit Capital Planning Manager at the SFMTA, said axle counters were a piece of technology used to track train movement and location through train-controlled areas. She said that the SFMTA was working with Transportation Authority staff on a proposal to shift the axle counter funding to a new



project aiming to perform the same functional tasks using new technology rather than the outdated axle counter technology.

Ms. Crabbe said the Transportation Authority was still determining if the new project (advanced train control system) met the California Transportation Commission's eligibility requirements and noted that there would be an update next month.

Chair Larson asked if staff could clarify what the recommendation action was and when the funds would be available.

Ms. Crabbe said there was about \$7.5 million available but most of it could not be allocated until Fiscal Year 2024/25 as shown in Attachment 3 to the memo. She said that the Transportation Authority worked with the SFMTA on identifying a project that met the eligibility requirements and determined that the recommended New Flyer Midlife Overhaul project was a good fit with the guidelines and the timing of when the funds are available.

During public comment Edward Mason asked what was meant by upgrading battery systems and whether it's because the current ones aren't working well and asked how the changes to bus seating configuration would affect the retrofitted New Flyer buses.

Ms. Hallowell said in regard to the battery systems upgrade, the lifespan of batteries was less than the lifespan of the vehicles. She said that SFMTA was introducing new technology that would allow buses to run further off-wire. With respect to the seats, Ms. Hallowell said the first batch of New Flyer buses had seats that needed to be retrofitted in response to feedback from the disability community and the SFMTA Mobility and Accessibility Advisory Committee (MAAC). She said she would share a seating diagram with the CAC.

Chair Larson asked how members of the public could provide input to the SFMTA MAAC.

Ms. Hallowell said the SFMTA MAAC was an advisory committee of community members and noted that the Mayor's Office on Disability also sat on the committee. She said the SFMTA MAAC met regularly about mobility and accessibility and she would provide that information to the Transportation Authority to distribute to the CAC.

Robin Kropp said she could not access half of the buses because of lack of transverse seats and requested that all buses have transverse seats.

Evie Pozmentier asked if the seating configuration diagrams for Muni buses would include the number of blue seats.

Robert Gower suggested that a portable microphone be made available during public comment.

Jerry Levine moved to approve the item, seconded by Peter Tannen.

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Ablog, Alavi, Chiang, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine, Tannen, Tupuola and Zack (9)

Absent: CAC Member Chiang (1)

Chair Larson announced that Items 12 and Items 13 would be continued to next month's meeting given time constraints.



Robert Gower asked if District 11 items like the Geneva/San Jose Intersection Study could be prioritized on the agenda for future meetings given that many District 11 issues were not well vetted or addressed.

Chair Larson stated that the Geneva/San Jose Intersection Study would be the first item on next month's agenda.

12. Update on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Siemens Light-Rail Vehicle Procurement - INFORMATION

Chair Larson continued Item 12 to next month's meeting.

There was no public comment.

13. Update on the Geneva/San Jose Intersection Study - INFORMATION

Chair Larson continued Item 13 to next month's meeting.

There was no public comment.

14. Introduction of New Business - INFORMATION

Sophia Tupuola asked how SFMTA was handling the new density at Chase Center and said she had read that Muni buses were being re-routed during Chase Center events. She requested an accountability and equity report from the SFMTA that demonstrated how SFMTA was ensuring all riders were being served as events start at Chase Center.

Chair Larson seconded Sophia Tupuola's request and said he took the 79X Muni line to a Chase Center event and did not have any issues.

Robert Gower thanked Myla Ablog for her 6 years of service and said the issue she raised regarding the Muni T-Third line being re-routed was also occurring on other Muni lines as they reached Districts 10 and 11. He shared his recent experience taking the Muni J Church line and said there were times when the train would need to switchback at the Glen Park, due to the train needing to re-enter more core urban areas. He said the switchbacks at Glen Park were leaving District 11 riders underserved and noted that the Glen Park station did not have a wheel-chair ramp for riders who had to disembark because of a switchback. He requested a report from SFMTA on switchback policies and procedures. He said his calls to 311 had not yielded any clarification as to why the switchbacks were occurring.

Chair Larson seconded Robert Gower's request.

Kian Alavi requested an SFMTA presentation on ADA compliance and accessibility for disabled riders. He asked that the report show how Muni was measuring and implementing ADA requirements and their top 3 measurements of effectiveness. He said he would like to work with the clerk to get the word out about this item when it is agendaized.

Chair Larson requested an SFMTA presentation on Muni driver sensitivity training. He apologized to staff for his earlier frustration.

Jerry Levine said the Market Street and Van Ness Avenue cross was one of the most congested transit thoroughfares in the city and noted that there were 3 major construction developments planned that would lead to rezoning and lifting height limits on 18 properties. He said the new rezoning would allow for 9,710 housing units in the area. He requested a Muni presentation detailing how they would address the new congestion as a result of increased development in the area and the need for



more transit capacity.

Chair Larson seconded Jerry Levine's request.

During public comment Edward Mason said the Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) was reevaluating the structure of their Board of Directors and was trying to determine if land use and planning experience should be a criterion for potential board members. He said that criteria might be pertinent when discussing congestion issues such as just described by Mr. Levine.

15. Public Comment

Evie Pozmentier said she researched that Muni only met the minimum ADA compliance of two blue seats on their light-rail vehicles. She asked the CAC to look into the issue.

Leora Wineglass asked if someone could provide an update on what the city was doing to prevent unmarked commuter buses from idling and interrupting Muni bus service.

Ed Mason provided an update on idling commuter shuttle buses, buses with no license plates or no permits and additional violations.

Jackie Sachs said Muni needed to take into consideration the proximity of University of California San Francisco (UCSF) hospital to Chase Center when scheduling bus routes.

Robin Kropp requested that a diagram of all LRV seating arrangements be made available. She also asked that more transverse seats be made available on the trains, as opposed to longitudinal seats.

16. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m.