



DRAFT MINUTES

San Francisco County Transportation Authority

Tuesday, September 24, 2019

1. Roll Call

Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Haney, Mar, Peskin, Stefani and Walton (7)

Absent at Roll Call: Commissioners Mandelman (entered during Item 2), Ronen (entered during Item 2), Yee (entered during Item 2) and Safai entered during Item 6) (3)

2. Chair's Report - INFORMATION

Chair Peskin reported on regional transportation and the future of Caltrain, and thanked Caltrain's General Manager and CEO Jim Hartnett and his staff for presenting an update to the Board and for working with the City of San Francisco and its staff on the Caltrain Business Plan. He discussed setting up Caltrain for success in funding and organizational processes, for the benefit of both the City and the region as a whole.

Chair Peskin also thanked Commissioner Walton for serving as the Board of Supervisors representative to the Peninsula Corridor Joint Powers Board (PCJPB), working collaboratively with regional partners and raising concerns about improvement on organizational structure and governance options. He expressed the City's commitment to continue working with the PCJPB and other colleagues to support a stronger Caltrain for the future.

There was no public comment.

3. Executive Director's Report - INFORMATION

Tilly Chang, Executive Director, presented the Executive Director's Report.

During public comment, Bob Feinbaum, President of Save Muni, requested that the Downtown Rail Extension Peer Review report for the October 8 meeting be fully available to the public on the agency's website, along with any supporting documents, at least a week in advance.

Consent Agenda

4. Approve the Minutes of the September 10, 2019 Meeting - ACTION

5. [Final Approval] Allocate \$26,147,587 and Appropriate \$100,000 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds for Twelve Requests, with Conditions - INFORMATION

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Ronen moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Stefani.



The Consent Agenda was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Walton (1)

End of Consent Agenda

Chair Peskin called Item 6 after Item 2.

6. Update on the Caltrain Modernization Program and Business Plan - INFORMATION

Jim Hartnett, General Manager and CEO of the San Mateo County Transit District, John Funghi, Chief Officer - Caltrain Modernization Program, Michelle Bouchard, Chief Operating Officer - Rail, and Sebastian Petty, Caltrain Senior Advisor, presented the item.

Chair Peskin asked if the \$7 billion baseline cost on slide 17 was for all 42 grade separations.

Mr. Petty answered that the \$7 billion baseline cost was only for the grade separations being actively planned by cities. He added that the definition of active planning was that the city council had issued a contract for anything between a project study all the way up to environmental clearance or advanced design.

Chair Peskin asked if Mr. Hartnett had any closing remarks.

Mr. Hartnett thanked the Board and Transportation Authority staff for their support of the project.

Commissioner Walton thanked Caltrain staff for their presentation and commented on the ambitious vision of bringing more trains to the corridor and being a premier means of transportation between San Francisco and the South Bay. He reported an update from Peninsula Corridor Joint Powers Board (PCJPB) status of the board's decision and his request of resolution for procurement of independent general counsel and legal advisory services of Caltrain. Commissioner Walton also asked Mr. Funghi about the status of the budget for electrification.

Mr. Funghi answered both elements of the electrification project were on schedule and on budget. He stated that the forecasted completion date for electrification of the corridor was in December of 2021 and that Caltrain was working closely with Stadler USA on the Electric Multiple Unit (EMU) train production.

Commissioner Walton asked if Mr. Funghi could ensure that the current contractors would be able to deliver.

Mr. Funghi answered that like on any large, complex project, issues arise daily but are being addressed appropriately. He stated as an example that Caltrain was assisting Balfour Beatty in identifying older infrastructure in the ground and working with them to redesign components of the Overhead Contact System, as needed. He also commented that Caltrain was working closely with suppliers on EMU production to ensure reliable train components.

Commissioner Walton thanked Caltrain staff again and commented that it would take



the efforts of all parties working together to make the rail system one of the most vibrant in the State of California and that San Francisco would continue to work hard with Caltrain to realize the vision responsibly.

Commissioner Yee asked about the cost-benefit ratio on both the moderate growth and high growth scenarios, asking if it was correct that moderate growth had more benefit relative to the cost of the project. He also asked why the high growth scenario was not selected, since the percentage of operation recovery seemed better for high growth.

Mr. Petty replied that Caltrain wanted to be conservative in its numbers and look at economic benefits specifically to Caltrain riders and costs that were contained within the regional system, as opposed to the extremely expensive route of high growth scenario, for which cost would have to be shared among multiple systems. He further answered that capital costs were much greater than operating costs for high growth.

Commissioner Fewer asked if Caltrain was taking into account the housing and development plans along the corridor, if they had a contingency plan for possible economic recession, and whether Caltrain was working with all the local jurisdictions to ensure Caltrain is accessible to all their residents.

Mr. Petty replied that the land-use forecast was based on Plan Bay Area , as well as actions and plans of individual jurisdictions, anticipating trends for the long term and allowing flexibility in terms of project progression. He answered that Caltrain did not want to triple ridership and triple parking garages and recognized the importance of working on Caltrain access issues with jurisdictions, as well as keeping in mind the equity implications of the growing system.

Commissioner Fewer further asked about the electrification budget and why there was a discrepancy in the contractor's completion timeline compared to Caltrain's, as well as a discrepancy on the method of securing a labor force to build the trains.

Mr. Funghi answered that Balfour Beatty's timeline was delayed due to challenges with permitting by other entities, but that Caltrain was working to keep the project timeline on track by assisting the vendor in getting approvals quicker and would enforce the terms of the contract with Balfour Beatty. He further clarified his earlier comments about the labor force,, stating that there were two different issues at hand: that Stadler USA was the manufacturer contracting with Seisenbacher, which was struggling to meet the supply demands to complete production. He said Stadler USA may need to seek an alternative parts supplier if production cannot be met. Mr. Funghi said the other labor issue he has referred to was Stadler needing to bring in labor from overseas to help train U.S. labor (both train the trainer, and train folks with no experience in the sector), noting given the strong labor market, it was difficult to find labor.

Chair Peskin commented that honesty and transparency with the public and decision makers about the project status was more acceptable than finding out about issues when it was too late. He commended Caltrain staff on the Caltrain Business Plan 2040 and long-range service vision and assessment. Chair Peskin noted that addressing the issues around organizational structure and dynamics was necessary in order to represent the entire region's viewpoint and bring in more federal dollars to projects.

During public, comment Bob Feinbaum, President of Save Muni, addressed the



Board, stating his support for the high growth scenario.

Christopher Peterson commented that he also supported the high growth scenario and that building development around Caltrain stations all along the corridor needed to be considered when moving forward with the project.

7. Appoint One Member to the Citizens Advisory Committee - ACTION

Aprile Smith, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Chair Peskin requested that Transportation Authority present to Commissioners only the list of Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) applicants for currently vacant seats rather than the entire list of applicants for CAC.

Bozhao Yu spoke to his interest and qualifications in being appointed to the CAC.

Danielle Thoe spoke to her interest and qualifications in being appointed to the CAC.

Commissioner Haney nominated Danielle Thoe to fill the vacant CAC seat based on her strong desire in advocating for traffic calming, Transportation Network Company (TNC) regulation, red light cameras, and transportation equity, as well as her background in transportation planning. He also thanked former CAC Member Becky Hogue, a Treasure Island resident, for her leadership and service to the CAC, who unfortunately had to step down.

Commissioner Haney moved to appoint Danielle Thoe to the CAC, seconded by Commissioner Ronen.

The motion to appoint Danielle Thoe was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Haney, Mar, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani and Yee (10)

Absent: Commissioner Walton (1)

8. Update on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Siemens Light-Rail Vehicle Procurement - INFORMATION

Julie Kirshbaum, Director of Transit at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, presented the item.

Commissioner Mar asked whether the reliability target for June 2020 was realistic and how the project aligned with the workforce issues.

Ms. Kirshbaum answered that both SFMTA and Siemens staff were continuing to learn and were making adjustments as needed to reach the reliability goal, discussing mechanical issues in the subsystems that affected the breakdowns and delays of the light rail vehicles (LRVs), and said it was too soon to know whether Siemens' target timeline would have to be adjusted. She said operator staffing had been an issue for Phase 1, which expanded the light rail fleet, but would not be an issue for Phase 2, which would replace existing vehicles and therefore would not require additional personnel.

Chair Peskin invited representatives of the unions representing Muni workers to speak to the Board about their perspectives on fleet procurement and operations.



Roger Marengo, President of the Transport Workers Union, Local 250-A, concurred with Ms. Kirschbaum that the news was good regarding Muni's workforce issues. He said the union and management were working together to resolve issues concerning installation of track brakes and mirrors on the new vehicles.

Ramon Galdamez, LRV mechanic, emphasized the importance of a track brake system in addition to brakes in the wheels, as they functioned as a fail-safe to give operators more control over the braking distances during emergency situations. Mr. Galdamez further commented that the additional track brakes would reduce the incidence of wheel-flattening, which caused long out-of-service periods for some LRVs. He also commended Siemens for its willingness to retrofit the entire fleet of new LRVs and understanding that the City's hilly and multi-modal operating environment required unique solutions.

During public comment, Bob Feinbaum, President of Save Muni, stated that the number of new LRVs out of service at any one time was excessive, and requested that SFMTA increase the minimum number LRVs in service to 50 vehicles at any given time. He suggested the Board ask Ms. Kirschbaum to present a comparison of maintenance statistics for the old Breda LRVs versus those for the new Siemens vehicles. He also asked Ms. Kirschbaum to address the status of the couplers on the Siemens LRVs.

Edward Mason requested an informational workshop on the procurement process for the new LRVs, along with diagrams and specifications comparing the current and planned seating configurations for the Siemens LRVs.

Eileen Boken commented that LRVs manufactured by Bombardier and Alstom, used in Canada, as well as Siemens LRVs deployed in San Diego, were significantly better in quality of materials, and workmanship than Siemens LRVs procured for San Francisco. She asked the Board to review the specifications of the different manufacturers and consider a consortium between Siemens and another manufacturer to improve the quality of San Francisco's LRVs.

Robin Kropp, of Save Muni, requested that a diagram of all rail car seating arrangements be made available. She also asked that more transverse (front- or rear-facing) seats be made available on the trains, as opposed to lateral-facing seats.

Ivette Fernandez requested that more front-facing seats be made available on the trains.

Francisco Da Costa chided the Board about lack of due diligence on transportation services for the public.

After public comment, Chair Peskin complimented SFMTA for their progress with improving the LRVs performance within the last 90 days. He asked Ms. Kirschbaum to elaborate on the proposed modifications to the internal design of the Siemens LRVs.

Ms. Kirshbaum stated that SFMTA was committed to retrofitting the LRVs procured in Phase 1 with enhanced seating, and would do their best to maximize forward-facing seats as requested by members of the public. She said she would report to the Board on these efforts at a later date.

Chair Peskin asked how the outreach was conducted prior to the procurement on the 68 vehicles.

Ms. Kirshbaum answered that prior outreach included an opt-in survey as well as focus



groups in Chinese and English, which were heavily represented by people with disabilities. She said an additional survey was conducted after the new LRVs were placed in service, the results of which showed over half the riders were satisfied with the new trains.

Chair Peskin encouraged SFMTA staff to involve more community stakeholders in the redesign process.

9. Muni Transit Performance Working Group Update - INFORMATION

Peg Stevenson, City Performance Director at the Controller's Office, and Julie Kirshbaum, SFMTA Director of Transit, presented the item.

Chair Peskin reported that Commissioner Safai expressed his interest in joining the working group. He further invited the public to come to the meeting to listen in on the conversation.

During public comment Robin Kropp requested that transverse seats be made available in the boarding areas of the buses.

Bob Feinbaum, President of Save Muni, expressed a dissatisfaction of Save Muni not being invited to participate in the working group and requested that the organization be allowed to have a voice in the group.

Francisco Da Costa commented the light rail lines were being placed in the wrong areas and certain areas were suffering from the lack of access to transit.

Commissioner Mandelman expressed appreciation for Director Tilly Chang and City Controller Ben Rosenfield, as well as Mayor's Office staff, for their work to pull the group together. He reported that the first and only meeting had gone well, giving him hope about the path moving forward.

Other Items

10. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION

Commissioner Walton asked Transportation Authority staff to conduct a study on bringing back bus service to Third Street, including the 15 line and extension to Excelsior district and BART station access.

There was no public comment.

11. Public Comment

During public comment, Francisco Da Costa expressed great disappointment over the failure of the city to repaint a crosswalk at San Bruno and Burrows over three months after finishing street work that covered up the crosswalk, putting at risk safety, especially for the neighborhood children. He further stated that he would paint the crosswalk himself if nothing was done in a timely manner.

Edward Mason reported on the corporate commuter buses that travel through and within city limits. He commented on the overcrowding of corporate buses still prevalent in the Mission and Castro neighborhoods, which decreases traffic calming in these areas.

12. Adjournment



The meeting was adjourned at 12:10 p.m.