



DRAFT MINUTES

VISION ZERO/PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

Thursday, March 14, 2019

1. Roll Call

Chair Yee called the meeting to order at 3:32 p.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Peskin, Stefani and Yee (3)

2. Approve the Minutes of the October 31, 2108 Meeting – ACTION

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Peskin moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Stefani.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Peskin, Stefani and Yee (3)

3. Vision Zero Legislative Update – ACTION

Michelle Beaulieu, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Chair Yee requested additional information regarding Senate Bill (SB) 59 (Allen).

Ms. Beaulieu said SB 59 would establish an autonomous vehicle working group at the state level to guide policy development for autonomous passenger vehicles. She said that at the February Board meeting, Chair Yee requested that Transportation Authority staff work with the author to add reference Vision Zero in the bill. She noted that staff was working with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) to submit specific language to incorporate Vision Zero goals explicitly into the legislation.

Chair Yee thanked the author for working with staff to include Vision Zero language in the bill. He then asked about the current status of automated speed enforcement legislation, which did not advance last year.

Ms. Beaulieu said that her understanding was that this year, the state had convened a Toward Zero Deaths task force. She said that colleagues at the SFMTA were working with that group as they developed recommendations and policy positions and that there were no automated speed enforcement related bills this year but that there may be in the future.

Chair Yee asked what it would take to reintroduce the bill this year.

Ms. Beaulieu said that the last day to introduce new bills was on February 22, 2019 but that there was a possibility to amend existing bills. Ms. Beaulieu said that she did not know of any conversations to amend an existing bill to add automated speed enforcement.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Stefani moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Peskin.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Peskin, Stefani and Yee (3)

4. **2018 Fatality Report – INFORMATION**

Shamsi Soltani, Vision Zero Epidemiologist at San Francisco Department of Public Health, presented the item.

During public comment Fran Taylor, Co-Chair of Si Se Puede, said she appreciated the report but thought it was too optimistic to state that 2018 was the second least deadly year because it had not been for pedestrians and cyclists. She asked why seniors and homeless people were not mentioned when discussing communities of concern.

Chair Yee acknowledged that Commissioner Fewer had joined the Vision Zero Committee for Item 4.

Kristen Leckie, Community Organizer at the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, reported that a woman riding an electric FordGo bike on Howard and Sixth Streets was hit and killed by a truck driver and was the latest victim over the past couple weeks. She said Howard Street was the location of several delayed street safety projects and one of San Francisco's most traveled bicycle corridors. She urged the SFMTA to implement safety projects not just on Howard Street but throughout the city.

Winston Parsons, staff member at the Richmond Senior Center, shared the story of a fatal collision that occurred on February 26th in the Richmond district involving a senior woman. He said that the Richmond Senior Center was near California Street, which had been identified as a high injury corridor but lacked a comprehensive plan for improvements. He requested that the city implement near term improvements and a comprehensive traffic project from 32nd Avenue to Arguello Boulevard within the next three years.

A member of the public [name not provided] stated that his neighbor was killed on 18th Avenue and California Street and that he, as an able-bodied person avoided crossing California Street. He said he feared for seniors trying to cross the street and spoke his support for the Central Richmond safety project draft proposal.

David Bach, member of the public, said that he was concerned that before his retirement that he would be killed on the streets of San Francisco. He requested that the SFMTA appoint a bike czar to be the point of contact for all requests and comments.

Cathy De Luca, Policy and Program Director at Walk San Francisco, reflected on the fatal collision that involved Ted Rothstein and said that the same level of outrage was needed every time someone died on city streets. She advocated for senior women of color who were also victims of fatal collisions and said the city was in a senior state of emergency.

After public comment Chair Yee thanked the public and said the Committee was listening to their comments and taking them very seriously. He noted a slide in the presentation that stated that 22% of the fatalities were homeless persons and asked what the city could do to protect this portion of the population.

Megan Wier, Director of Program on Health, Equity and Sustainability at San Francisco Department of Public Health, said homelessness was being more routinely tracked as a result of the city's work to better understand patterns of traffic deaths. She said the Health Department and other agencies within the city were engaging to better understand the ways in which homeless

people were disproportionately at risk for traffic deaths. She added that the report would help identify where homeless were concentrated in the city.

Chair Yee remarked that the report was revealing a better picture of the data on traffic fatalities. He asked if the report demonstrated any patterns for severe injuries.

Ms. Soltani said there was a portion of a later presentation that focused on severe injuries. She said the report tracked severe injuries and looked how to best reduce the risk of injury.

Chair Yee said patterns that were being identified needed to be incorporated into the educational component of the Vision Zero program. He added that the report needed to look at areas that required further education, like assisting monolingual residents.

Commissioner Fewer asked for the number of fatalities reported in 2019.

Captain Timothy Falvey at the San Francisco Police Department said there were eight fatalities to date.

Commissioner Fewer asked for the number of pedestrian fatalities in 2019 to date.

Captain Falvey responded that there were five pedestrian fatalities.

Commissioner Fewer asked how many 2019 fatalities were bicyclists.

Captain Falvey responded that one was a bicyclist and two were motor vehicle collisions.

Commissioner Fewer requested the numbers of fatalities reported in the severe traffic injury report of 2018.

Ms. Soltani said the 2018 data was a collaboration of Police Department data and San Francisco General Hospital's trauma data. She said that the data had been requested and the hospital had 60 days to close patient records. She said the data would be added to the trends report as soon as it was received.

Commissioner Fewer asked if the serious traffic injury reports included head injuries from scooters.

Ms. Soltani said Public Health was working with trauma staff at San Francisco General Hospital to better track severe and fatal injuries from scooters and hoverboards. She added that the data was currently not available.

Commissioner Fewer asked when the data would be available.

Ms. Soltani said Public Health anticipated a summary in the summer of 2019 and suggested having a hearing at that time when the data was released.

Commissioner Fewer stated that District 1 had two vehicle fatalities in one month and both involved senior Chinese women. She said District 1 needed repaving of uneven crosswalks with potholes and added that the intersection of 18th Avenue and California Street needed to be changed from a four-way stop to a signalized intersection. She shared that her husband was a San Francisco police officer for 35 years and spent his last nine years in the traffic unit riding a motorcycle and could give out tickets repeatedly because people did not stop properly. Commissioner Fewer said that she believed that the proposed traffic island at Park Presidio and 25th Avenue was not enough of a deterrent to slow down vehicles and said she was working with Chief Scott to have more motorcycle police on patrol. Commissioner Fewer requested that the SFMTA repaint faded crosswalks and improve street lighting in District 1 to better illuminate

crosswalks. Commissioner Fewer advocated for Police Department sponsored driver training courses and enforcement to ensure bicyclist adhered to stop signs in addition to motor vehicles.

5. San Francisco Police Department Report – INFORMATION

Captain Raj Vaswani and Captain Timothy Falvey at the San Francisco Police Department, presented the item.

Commissioner Stefani asked how many motorcycle officers were currently employed by the Police Department.

Captain Vaswani said there were 45 motorcycle officers that worked in the city and eight that worked at San Francisco International airport.

Commissioner Stefani asked if the officers were part of traffic enforcement.

Captain Vaswani said the officers were part of traffic enforcement and collision investigation units.

Commissioner Stefani asked what the highest number of motorcycle officers had been at the Police Department.

Captain Vaswani said he had heard of numbers as high as 80 and 90 but did not know what years those levels occurred.

Commissioner Stefani asked if it was correct to state the city was down half the traffic enforcement motorcycle officers compared to where it had been in previous years.

Captain Vaswani said it was a difficult question to answer and that the Police Department was currently conducting a study and analyzing data to determine how to best deploy officers including the ideal number of traffic enforcement motorcycle officers.

Commissioner Stefani said she was concerned that enforcement was not visible on streets and questioned if additional resources were needed to adequately enforce traffic laws. She said her last ride along with a police officer was mostly spent moving along Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) that were double parked or causing traffic issues. She echoed Commissioner Fewer's request for greater enforcement and said it could help change people's behavior if they thought there was a greater risk of getting a ticket.

Commissioner Peskin asked if there was a subset of data for scooter related citations.

Captain Vaswani replied that there was not a subset of data for scooter related citations.

Commissioner Peskin asked if his calculation of 15 enforcement motorcycle officers on the street at any one time was accurate.

Captain Vaswani said the number of enforcement motorcycle officers was less because they were divided up into shifts for days and nights. He said there was around one sergeant and approximately eight to ten officers depending on the squad.

Commissioner Peskin asked if those figures were for the entire city.

Captain Vaswani replied in the affirmative

Commissioner Peskin echoed the sentiments of Commissioners Fewer and Stefani requesting additional enforcement motorcycle officers and noted their effectiveness in slowing down traffic speed when stationed outside the Broadway tunnel. He asked if all other traffic violations came from officers in radio cars or officers walking the beat.

Captain Vaswani said most tickets came from officers in radio cars and noted there were overlaps in shifts when two sergeants and 17 to 20 motorcycles were patrolling city streets. He said enforcement, education and engineering were important but noted the challenges of having TNC drivers commuting from other areas and not being familiar with San Francisco streets. The education premise was important for corridors where people were commuting because it was usually the same drivers. Captain Vaswani said the Police Department needed help from TNCs to educate their drivers.

During public comment Richard Rothman, member of the Park, Recreation and Open Space Advisory Committee, said his goal was to make Fulton Street safer. He echoed the Committee's request for additional motorcycle officers.

David Bach said he frequently biked along Market Street and rarely saw motorcycle officers. He asked that officers not block bike lanes when ticketing vehicles to avoid safety hazards.

After public comment Chair Yee requested that the Police Department provide a report at every Vision Zero Committee meeting showing the number of tickets given to vehicles, pedestrians and cyclists. He said previous written reports to the Vision Zero Committee showed a comparison of tickets given over time and would help support the department's deployment study. He asked what the policy was around hit-and-runs and said people should be cited regardless if an individual was injured or killed.

Captain Vaswani said hit-and-run incidents were not sent to investigation unless there was an injury or fatality. If somebody were to get hit and injured, the case would be assigned to the Traffic Collision Investigations Unit (TCIU). He added that the initial traffic officer had the burden of working up the case before sending it to TCIU.

Chair Yee asked for confirmation that once the hit-and-run perpetrator was caught, regardless of the severity of the incident, legal action was taken.

Captain Vaswani replied in the affirmative and said the perpetrator should be cited or booked if they are located on the day the report was taken.

Chair Yee asked if the police interviewed witnesses or sought footage from stores with cameras along 18th Avenue and California Street when the collision occurred.

Captain Falvey said that following the collision, four officers went to the neighborhood, canvassed a four block stretch of roadway, spoke to witnesses and checked with stores to see if there was video surveillance that would help the case. He added that the Police Department had several officers trained as video retrieval officers.

Chair Yee thanked Captain Falvey for the clarification and asked what forms of outreach and education were being conducted to reach monolingual residents. He suggested a social media campaign to reach a larger and multilingual audience.

Captain Vaswani said the SFMTA had a Vision Zero group dedicated to outreach and education and had numerous videos on pedestrian, senior and bicycle safety, as well as working closely with advocates like WalkSF. He added that there was a social media segment to the outreach as well as police captains providing traffic safety trainings at smaller community meetings.

Chair Peskin asked to what extent there was a citywide practice to have sting operations.

Captain Raj Vaswani said pedestrian decoy sting operations were common practice and were conducted at the discretion of each station captain.

Chair Yee encouraged additional pedestrian sting operations and stated that he visited intersections in District 7 that had been reported as dangerous by his constituents, to be able to give firsthand accounts to the SFMTA.

Captain Vaswani asked Chair Yee to send him a list of problem areas in District 7 to enable further investigation.

6. 2019 Progress Update – INFORMATION

Tom Maguire, Director of Sustainable Streets, and Chava Kronenberg, Vision Zero Task Force Co-Chair and Pedestrian Program Manager at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), presented the item.

During public comment Richard Rothman said many residents of the Richmond did not feel safe crossing Fulton Street.

After public comment Chair Yee requested a presentation at the next Vision Zero Committee meeting that discussed pedestrian intervals and progress to date with implementing these intervals throughout the city. He noted that seniors needed to have sufficient time to cross intersections.

7. 2019 Vision Zero Action Strategy Update – INFORMATION

Chava Kronenberg, Vision Zero Task Force Co-Chair and Pedestrian Program Manager at the SFMTA and John Scarpulla, Policy & Government Affairs Manager at San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), presented the item.

Chair Yee requested severe injury metrics.

Megan Wier, Vision Zero Task Force Co-Chair and Director of Program on Health, Equity and Sustainability at San Francisco Department of Public Health, said severe injuries were monitored, with a commitment to issue an annual report to the Committee.

Chair Yee said a report was good but what he was requesting were metrics on severe injuries and the steps being taken to reduce them. He also requested that the report provide a summary detailing the results of the previous Vision Zero Action Strategy.

Ms. Kronenberg stated that the findings of the Vision Zero Action Strategy were tracked and shared at previous Vision Zero workshops. She said the findings would be uploaded to the Vision Zero website.

Chair Yee requested an update on the previous Vision Zero action strategy.

Ms. Kronenberg said the SFMTA would be happy to share the findings.

Chair Yee referenced the SFMTA's 20 miles per hour strategy and asked if the city had the authority to lower the speeds in certain areas to 15 miles per hour.

Tom Maguire, Director of Sustainable Streets at the SFMTA, said there were limited circumstances under which cities could set speed limits under 25 miles per hour or use methods that did not simply set the speed at the prevailing speed of traffic. He said the question asked by Chair Yee was one of the circumstances in which the SFMTA was asking the state for guidance. Mr. Maguire said that just because the statewide baseline speed was 25 miles per hour did not mean it was safe for many streets in the city. He added that San Francisco was working in conjunction with seven other California cities to pass Assembly Bill 2363 that would require the Transportation Secretary to establish and convene a Zero Traffic Fatalities Task Force. The cities

want traffic engineers who are familiar with the local issues to be able to make speed limit recommendations.

During public comment Kristen Leckie, member of the Vision Zero Coalition, stated that the city was not on track to reach its Vision Zero goal of 2024. She viewed the Action Strategy as a list of actions not a road map and said the Vision Zero Coalition had drafted a letter outlining how the city could address the concerns to achieve its 2024 goal.

Garret Mitcham requested that safety measures be taken to protect cyclists who used Folsom and Howard Streets and stated that he was in favor of Vision Zero having more of a transit focus.

Kelly [last name not given], Chinatown Community Development Center (CCDC) Campaign Academy youth member, said CCDC was working with Vision Zero staff to improve pedestrian safety for seniors. She said the pedestrian scramble signals in Chinatown were effective to protect senior pedestrians and urged the city to do research to identify streets that could benefit from a scramble system. She added that educating people and releasing useful information about how to best prevent fatalities were essential to achieve Vision Zero by 2024.

Cathy De Luca said the Vision Zero Coalition was comprised of more than 35 community-based organizations and helped advance Vision Zero in the city. She stated that the coalition had submitted an 8 page letter to the Vision Zero Committee that listed steps the city was taking or needed to take at the state level. She added that communities that used transit were much safer and asked what the city's plans and strategies were to get to Vision Zero.

Jodie Medeiros, Executive Director of WalkSF, thanked the Vision Zero Committee and city agencies for their work on the Action Strategy and for working towards long-term changes. She requested that the city speed up the pace to get safety improvements installed throughout the entire network by 2020. She also asked for a cost assessment for Vision Zero and transparency to track the progress on the high injury network. She asked how many projects were completed and how many more streets on the high injury network needed improvements.

Alice Rogers, member of the Vision Zero Coalition echoed the sentiments of the previous speakers and thanked the SFMTA for their outreach to communities. She asked that transit become more central to Vision Zero.

After public comment Chair Yee stated that the letter sent by the Vision Zero Coalition provided helpful action steps and that the city needed to step up its efforts to get to its goal of Vision Zero.

8. **Vision Zero Communications and Education Program Update – INFORMATION**

Uyen Ngo, Vision Zero Education and Outreach Coordinator at the SFMTA, presented the item.

Chair Yee asked for the status of the city's efforts to display ghost bikes.

Mr. Maguire said he was unaware of city efforts to display ghost bikes but noted that the SFMTA worked with the Department of Public Works to confirm the policy of not removing ghost bikes for those memorializing cyclist fatalities. He said he confirm the status of the program and get back to Chair Yee.

Chair Yee asked the SFMTA for data regarding educational outreach provided to elementary students. He asked how many students were served over the past year.

Commissioner Stefani asked what type of outreach and communications were provided to residents when roadway changes were going to be made like the Euclid traffic circles. She reported that drivers did not always know how to effectively navigate such changes and that she saw a need

for driver safety courses. She added that educational outreach was also important for cyclists and pedestrians to keep everyone safe.

Mr. Maguire said the presentation about driving in today's San Francisco was one of the campaigns that would be launched next year, specifically aimed at those issues. He said the city was on the cutting edge of traffic practices and that these changes would only work if drivers knew how to navigate city streets. He said that would be the subject of their campaign.

There was no public comment.

9. Introduction of New Items – INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

10. Public Comment

During public comment Jay Bayne spoke in favor of the city's educational outreach. He said he would like to see more bike share in the outer Richmond and west side of San Francisco and believed it was a great solution with technology and services. He added that having more cyclists and people using multi-modal options would help reduce traffic.

11. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:44 p.m.