

# Acknowledgements

This study has been a truly collaborative effort. The Authority would like to thank:

## STUDY TEAM MEMBERS

### San Francisco Transportation Authority

#### Staff

Rachel Hiatt, Project Manager

Tilly Chang, Deputy Director for Planning

#### Interns

Dorina Pojani, Laura Stonehill, Paul Supawanich

### Revitalize and Energize the Northeast and Waterfront of San Francisco (RENEW SF)

Claudine Cheng

Rod Freebairn-Smith

Marvin Kasoff

Robert Mittelstadt

Wells Whitney

### Technical Consultants

Jeffrey Tumlin, Steve Boland, and Francesca Napolitan, **Nelson\Nygaard**

Chris Mitchell, Meghan Mitman, and Greg Riessen, **Fehr & Peers**

Thomas Kronmeyer and Amy Sommer, **Community Design + Architecture**

Robin Chiang and David Pham, **Robin Chiang and Company**

## TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEMBERS

### Port of San Francisco

Dan Hodapp and Wendy Proctor

### City of San Francisco, Mayor's Office on Disabilities

John Paul Scott

### California Department of Transportation

Anh Nguyen

### San Francisco Department of Parks and Recreation

Karen Mauney-Brodek and Daniel LaForte,

### San Francisco Department of Public Works

Kevin Jensen, Ramon Kong, Kris Opbroek, and Patrick Rivera

### San Francisco Public Utilities Commission

Rosey Jencks

### San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

John Funghi, Helen Kwan, Philip Louie, Mike Sallaberry, Peter Strauss, Manito Velasco

### San Francisco Planning Department

Neil Hrushowy, Andres Power, Adam Varat

### Special thanks also to the following City agency staff:

Kevin Jensen and Patrick Rivera, San Francisco Department of Public Works

John Paul Scott, City of San Francisco, Mayor's Office on Disability

Graphic design by **NaiadDesign.com**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Executive Summary

1	Study Overview	ES-1
2	Outreach Approach	ES-1
3	Transportation Conditions	ES-2
	COMMUNITY PRIORITIES	ES-2
	Parking Conditions & Recommendations	ES-2
4	Design Alternatives	ES-2
5	Design Recommendations & Implementation	ES-8

## Chapter 1 Study Overview

## Chapter 2 Transportation Conditions

2.1	Street Design	2-1
	Typical Sections	2-3
2.2	Traffic Conditions	2-4
2.3	Parking Conditions	2-7
2.4	Transit Conditions	2-7
	Transit Supply and Demand	2-7
	Transit Performance	2-7
2.5	Pedestrian Conditions	2-10
	Pedestrian Supply and Demand	2-10
	Pedestrian Performance	2-12
2.6	Bicycle Conditions	2-13
	Bicycle Supply and Demand	2-13
2.7	Transportation Supply vs. Demand	2-15

## Chapter 3 Parking Conditions & Recommendations

3.1	Background	3-1
	Parking Study Area	3-1
	Definitions	3-2
	Relevant Studies & Programs	3-3
3.2	Parking Supply: Inventory & Policies	3-3
	Methodology	3-3
	Findings	3-3
3.3	Parking Demand: Occupancy & Turnover Rates	3-7
	Methodology	3-7
	Findings	3-7
3.4	Summary	3-12
3.5	Recommendations	3-13
	Near-Term Recommendations	3-13
	Mid-Term Recommendations	3-15
	Long-Term Recommendations	3-15

## Chapter 4 Discussion & Evaluation of Design Alternatives

4.1	Design Objectives	4-1
	Community Priorities	4-1
	Technical Priorities	4-1
	Constraints	4-1
4.2	Summary of Design Concepts	4-2
	Design Alternatives	4-2
4.3	Elements & Evaluation	4-3
	Common Elements	4-3
4.4	Evaluation Criteria	4-7
4.5	Details of Each Alternative	4-7
	Alternative I: Four-Lane with “Flex Lane”	4-7
	Alternative II—Two-Lane with “Flex Lane”	4-10
	Alternative III—“Two-Lane with Flex Space”	4-16
4.6	Automobile, Transit, Pedestrian and Bicycle Levels of Service	4-21
4.7	Additional Analysis of “Flex Lane” and “Flex Space” Concepts	4-23
4.8	Summary Evaluation	4-24
	Key Findings	4-24

## Chapter 5 Community Involvement

5.1	Community-based Outreach Approach	5-1
5.2	Community Involvement in Needs Identification	5-2
	Public Workshops	5-2
	Shopper Survey	5-6
5.3	Community Input for Design Development	5-8
	Public Workshop	5-8
	Additional Outreach Programs	5-8

## Chapter 6 Design Recommendations & Implementation

6.1	Recommended Designs	6-1
6.2	Implementation Strategy	6-1
	Pre-Implementation Phase: Design Development and In-depth Evaluation	6-2
6.3	Issues Requiring Further Analysis	6-3
	Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Issues	6-3
	Street “Crowning” and Drainage Issues	6-5
	Fire Code Issues	6-5
6.4	Next Steps	6-5

## **Appendices**

**Appendix A, Plan Views, Alternatives I, I & III**

**Appendix B, Summary, June 2007 Stakeholder Workshop**

**Appendix C, Summary, September 20, 2007 Public Workshop**

**Appendix D, Summary, December 4, 2008 Public Workshop**

**Appendix E, Parking Survey Occupancy Rates**

**Appendix F, Pedestrian Survey**

## TABLE OF FIGURES

### Executive Summary

Figure ES-1	Typical Cross Section: Existing .....	ES-3
Figure ES-2	Different Sections along Columbus .....	ES-3
Figure ES-3	Existing Allocation of Street Space .....	ES-4
Figure ES-4	PM Peak Hour Person Volumes by Mode at Different Intersections.....	ES-4
Figure ES-5	Typical Cross Section: Proposed (Alternative I).....	ES-5
Figure ES-6	Typical Cross Section: Proposed (Alternative II).....	ES-6
Figure ES-7	Typical Cross Section: Proposed (Alternative III).....	ES-7
Figure ES-8	Rendering of Columbus, Green, and Stockton Intersection Existing Conditions .....	ES-8
Figure ES-9	Rendering of Columbus, Green, and Stockton Intersection with Crown Design from Alternative III .....	ES-8
Figure ES-10	Summary of Benefits and Impacts.....	ES-9

### Chapter 2 Transportation Conditions

Figure 2-1	Aerial View of Intersections along Columbus Avenue.....	2-2
Figure 2-2	Views along Columbus Avenue, south to north. Top, left to right: South of Vallejo, South of Green, North of Green. Left: South of Union. ....	2-2
Figure 2-3	Columbus & Broadway Intersection.....	2-2
Figure 2-4	Existing Conditions on Columbus Avenue.....	2-4
Figure 2-5	Typical Cross Sections .....	2-5
Figure 2-6	Photos of Columbus Avenue from Lower Columbus, Circa 1890 and 1929.....	2-6
Figures 2-7	Columbus Avenue Sidewalk — Typical Conditions .....	2-6
Figure 2-8	Vehicle Volumes (PM Peak Hour) .....	2-6
Figure 2-9	Vehicle Speed Limits and Observed 85 <sup>th</sup> Percentile Speeds.....	2-7
Figure 2-10	PM Peak Hour Intersection Levels of Service....	2-7
Figure 2-11	Muni Bus.....	2-8
Figure 2-12	Locations and Headways of Bus Routes Operating on or Across Columbus .....	2-8
Figure 2-13	Boardings & Alightings by Time Period & Location .....	2-9
Figure 2-14	AM & PM Peak Period Average Transit Speeds.....	2-10
Figure 2-15	Bus Reliability .....	2-10
Figure 2-18	PM Peak Hour Pedestrian Volumes & LOS.....	2-11

Figure 2-16	Crowded Conditions at Bus Stops in the Study Area .....	2-11
Figure 2-17	Diagram of Sidewalk “Zones” .....	2-11
Figure 2-19	Pedestrians.....	2-12
Figure 2-20	Pedestrian Action Preceding Collision on Columbus, 1998-2006.....	2-12
Figure 2-21	Vehicle Movement Preceding Collision on Columbus, 1998-2003.....	2-12
Figure 2-22	Collisions Involving Pedestrians, 1998-2006	2-13
Figure 2-23	Shared Route Markings on Columbus .....	2-13
Figure 2-25	Existing Allocation of Street Space.....	2-14
Figure 2-24	PM Peak Hour Bicycle Volumes & LOS .....	2-14
Figure 2-26	PM Peak Hour Person Volumes by Mode at Different Intersections.....	2-15

### Chapter 3 Parking Conditions & Recommendations

Figure 3-1	Parking Study Area Map .....	3-2
Figure 3-2	Yellow Curb.....	3-4
Figure 3-3	Motorcycle Parking.....	3-4
Figure 3-4	Hours & Rates on Fridays & Saturdays of Off-Street Sites .....	3-5
Figure 3-5	Non-Monthly/Non-Reserved Parking Spaces by Category & Quadrant .....	3-6
Figure 3-6	Capacity of Off-Street Sites .....	3-6
Figure 3-7	Occupancy Rates by Category, Sub-Area, & Time of Day.....	3-8
Figure 3-8	Average Parking Space Occupancy Rates by Category, Day, & Time of Stay.....	3-9
Figure 3-10	Motorcycle Parked Illegally .....	3-10
Figure 3-9	Turnover Rates by Category & Sub-Area.....	3-11
Figure 3-11	“Observed” Illegal Parking Totals by Subarea & Time of Day.....	3-11
Figure 3-12	Comparison of On-Street and Off-Street Parking Costs.....	3-13
Figure 3-13	Columbus/Grant Sign for Garage Parking.....	3-14
Figure 3-14	Example of Parking Garage Sign at St. Mary’s Garage.....	3-14
Figure 3-15	Multispace Parking Meter.....	3-16
Figure 3-16	Universal Valet Concept.....	3-17

## Chapter 4 Discussion & Evaluation of Design Alternatives

Figure 4-1	Design Charrette Notes .....	4-2
Figure 4-2	Design Process.....	4-2
Figure 4-3	Design Elements Proposed in Each Alternative	4-3
Figure 4-4	Café Seating in Mountain View .....	4-4
Figure 4-5	Café Seating in the Parking Lane on Columbus .....	4-4
Figure 4-6	Trees in the Parking Lane.....	4-5
Figure 4-7	Existing View of Columbus Sidewalk North of Green Street (Left), and Transformation with Seating & Trees in the Parking Lane (Right).....	4-5
Figure 4-8	Example of Shared Street: Hotaling Place .....	4-6
Figure 4-9	Bus Stop Sidewalk Bulb-Out .....	4-6
Figure 4-10	Typical Cross Section—Alternative I .....	4-8
Figure 4-13	Projected PM Peak Hour Automobile Levels of Service—Alternative I .....	4-9
Figure 4-14	Projected Pedestrian Levels of Service—Alternative I.....	4-9
Figure 4-11	Flexible Parking Area.....	4-9
Figure 4-12	Café Seating with raised platform & trench drains .....	4-9
Figure 4-15	Projected Bicycle Levels of Service—Alternative I.....	4-10
Figure 4-16	Summary of Benefits and Impacts — Alternative I.....	4-11
Figure 4-17	Typical Cross Section—Alternative II .....	4-12
Figure 4-19	Projected PM Peak Hour Automobile Levels of Service—Alternative II.....	4-13
Figure 4-18	Rendering of Columbus, Green, and Stockton Intersection Existing Conditions (top) and with Diagonal Crosswalks (Bottom).....	4-13
Figure 4-22	“Sharrow” markings delineate and protect space for cyclists on a shared roadway. ....	4-14
Figure 4-20	Projected Pedestrian Levels of Service—Alternative II.....	4-14
Figure 4-21	Projected Bicycle Levels of Service—Alternative II.....	4-14
Figure 4-23	Summary of Benefits and Impacts — Alternative II.....	4-15
Figure 4-24	View of Sidewalk North of Green with 22-Foot Sidewalk including “Flex Space” .....	4-17
Figure 4-25	Green/Stockton Plaza: Conceptual Sketch, Plan View, and Rendering.....	4-17
Figure 4-26	Green/Stockton Plaza: Before & After, Showing Views to the South.....	4-18
Figure 4-27	Typical Cross Section—Alternative III.....	4-19

Figure 4-28	Summary of Benefits and Impacts — Alternative III .....	4-20
Figure 4-29	Projected PM Peak Hour Automobile Levels of Service—Alternative II.....	4-21
Figure 4-30	Projected Pedestrian Levels of Service—Alternative III .....	4-21
Figure 4-31	Projected Bicycle Levels of Service—Alternative III .....	4-21
Figure 4-32	Relative Benefits and Impacts of Flex Lane and Flex Space Alternatives .....	4-22
Figure 4-33	Summary of Benefits and Impacts.....	4-23
Figure 4-34	Existing and Projected Levels of Service by Mode .....	4-24
Figure 4-35	Allocation of Street Space Under Each Alternative .....	4-25
Figure 4-36	Summary of Benefits and Impacts for Each Alternative .....	4-26

## Chapter 5 Community Involvement

Figure 5-1	Community Meeting .....	5-2
Figure 5-2	Trade-off boards.....	5-3
Figure 5-3	Mapping Exercise Boards.....	5-4
Figure 5-4	Shopper Survey: Mode Share .....	5-7
Figure 5-5	Shopper Survey: Proportion of Travelers by Mode & Place of Residence -- All Respondents.....	5-7
Figure 5-6	Shopper Survey: Frequency of Recreational Trips & Spending by Mode of Access -- All Respondents (Weekday & Weekend).....	5-7

## Chapter 6 Design Recommendations & Implementation

Figure 6-1	Narrow Sidewalks.....	6-2
Figure 6-2	_____ .....	6-4
Figure 6-3	Next Steps in Implementation: Costs, Funding, Responsibilities .....	6-6