



DRAFT MINUTES

SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

Tuesday, September 11, 2018

1. Roll Call

Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Kim, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen and Tang (7)

Absent at Roll Call: Commissioners Cohen (entered during Item 4), Safai (entered during Item 4), Stefani (entered during Item 4) and Yee (entered during Item 5) (4)

2. Citizens Advisory Committee Report – INFORMATION

John Larson, Chair of the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), reported that the CAC expressed surprise at both the July and September Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) Project progress reports stating that only 1% progress had been achieved in each month and were concerned about the length of time for the overall project to completion. Transportation Authority staff noted the slow pace was due to underground utility work and said that the work would not be completed until the end of 2019. The CAC asked if there had been any discussion of closing Van Ness Avenue entirely for a period of several weeks to get the project done all at once at an accelerated pace. Transportation Authority staff said a balance was needed to be struck between two years of inconvenience on Van Ness Avenue versus the impact on local businesses of a full closure. Mr. Larson said the CAC would continue to follow the project progress meeting to meeting.

Mr. Larson reported that the CAC recommended a support position for Assembly Bill (AB) 1184 and welcomed the potential ability to achieve revenue from Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) pending voter approval. He said the CAC also recommended approval for the allocation of approximately \$8 million in Prop K sales tax funds as presented in item six of the Board agenda. He said the CAC asked why the existing BART Powell Station ceiling lighting project was taking so long to complete. BART staff said authorization process delays in addition to fire sprinkler requirements had set the work back but hoped it would be completed by next spring.

Mr. Larson reported that the CAC had originally postponed the Pennsylvania Avenue Alignment to the Downtown Extension (DTX) at their June meeting. He said the CAC wanted to know the possible locations of any rail yards that potentially needed to be relocated based on the alignment before recommending approval. He also stated that there was renewed interest in learning why a 7th Street alignment of the DTX into the Salesforce Transit Center had been rejected years ago. He said the CAC received helpful information that explained the challenges of a downtown extension running mid-block between Howard and Folsom Streets and down 7th Street and why the routing had not been chosen. Mr. Larson reported that with regard to the railyard relocation issue, staff clarified that the future re-location of any railyard was an issue common to either the

Pennsylvania alignment or the Mission Bay alignment and was not as linked to the choice of alignment as it may have appeared from the materials presented at the June meeting. He said the CAC was further assuaged when it was acknowledged that the railyard would probably move from Fourth and King streets in the future and that community outreach had been and would continue to be conducted in potentially affected areas. He noted that the CAC asked whether an alternative could be costed out that would include all or part of the Fourth and King streets railyard remaining or undergrounding the facility at that location. Staff explained the answers were dependent on the still pending Caltrain and High-Speed Rail Authority blended service business plan. Mr. Larson reported that the CAC recommended adoption of the Pennsylvania Avenue Alignment.

There was no public comment.

3. Approve the Minutes of the July 24, 2018 Meeting – ACTION

Chair Peskin noted typos in the Board minutes that had been amended and posted on the Transportation Authority website.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Tang moved to approve the minutes, seconded by Commissioner Ronen.

The minutes were approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Fewer, Kim, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen and Tang (7)

Absent: Commissioners Cohen, Safai, Stefani and Yee (4)

4. Appoint Two Members to the Citizens Advisory Committee – ACTION

Mike Pickford, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Robert Gower spoke to his interest and qualification in being appointed to the CAC.

David Klein spoke to his interest and qualification in being appointed to the CAC.

Commissioner Fewer thanked former District 1 CAC representative Brian Larkin for his solid decade of service and said her office relied heavily on the questions and insights that the CAC brought on issues related to her neighborhood and city-wide transportation policies. She said she was excited to appoint David Klein to the District 1 CAC and stated that he had served on the Oversight Commission of the Our Children, Our Family Initiative in Oakland. She said Mr. Klein brought experience in engaging with communities to the policymaking process, which was essential. Commissioner Fewer said Mr. Klein was a resident raising his family in the Outer Richmond and brought a lens as a transit rider and passion for transportation through his work with Moovit. She said she was confident he would be a strong representative.

Commissioner Safai said Robert Gower took wonderful initiative engaging around some of the transit issues in District 11 and highlighted his work on the Muni J line intersection on Santa Rosa and San Jose avenues. He said Mr. Gower's initiative on the intersection led to restriping, moving signs to a better location and better visibility. Commissioner Safai spoke to Mr. Gower's overall engagement with his office and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and involvement with District 11 neighborhood associations. He said he was extremely happy to move Mr. Gower's nomination to the CAC forward.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Fewer moved to appoint David Klein to the CAC, seconded by Commissioner Safai.

Commissioner Safai moved to appoint Robert Gower to the CAC, seconded by Commissioner Fewer.

The motions to appoint David Klein and Robert Gower were approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani and Tang (10)

Absent: Commissioner Yee (1)

5. [Final Approval on First Appearance] State and Federal Legislation Update – ACTION

Mark Watts, State Legislative Advocate, presented the item.

Chair Peskin formally thanked Assemblymember Phil Ting for authoring AB 1184, which if passed as law would help the city go forward with a per ride tax on TNCs in the City and County of San Francisco in November 2019. He thanked Mayor Breed for contacting the Governor's office and urging him to sign the assembly bill.

Commissioner Fewer thanked Chair Peskin for the work he had done on AB 1184 and his efforts to provide TNC relief in San Francisco.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Ronen moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Yee.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Tang and Yee (11)

Absent: Commissioners (0)

6. Allocate \$8,062,238 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds for Six Requests, with Conditions – ACTION

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Commissioner Ronen encouraged the SFMTA to appoint a point person to the Safe Routes to School Program and said it was greatly needed. She said she had spoken to many principals in District 9 and heard that school pedestrian safety was a top priority. She thanked Commissioner Tang for her work on the issue and said the restructured program was a great outcome.

Commissioner Kim asked for a follow up on a request she had made almost a year ago regarding reinvesting in a yellow school bus program, which would help families and reduce vehicle miles traveled. She noted that she still had not been provided an estimate of what it would cost for the city and the school district to reinstate the program. She said she remembered having to cut the program when she sat on the Board of Education in order to protect classroom resources. She stated that if there were dedicated funds for the Safe Routes to School program, then the Board should consider whether the city's dollars would be better spent providing a program that families would actually utilize, since the current grant funding had not been producing great outcomes or changes in behavior.

Director Chang thanked Commissioner Kim for bringing up the request and said Transportation Authority staff would follow up with the San Francisco Unified School District (SFUSD). She

noted that when this issue was brought up last year, SFUSD was just embarking on a year-long assessment regarding school transportation so a Board update would be timely.

Commissioner Kim requested an update through the Chair.

Chair Peskin said he would work with Transportation Authority staff to schedule an update on a potential yellow school bus program.

Commissioner Cohen asked if SFMTA had finalized the list of Safe Routes to School sites.

Ms. LaForte said the SFMTA was still working with the Safe Routes to School Partnership and with district supervisors to look at high injury corridors and locations where vulnerable populations had been the subject of collisions.

Commissioner Cohen requested that Daniel Webster Elementary School be added to the list.

Commissioner Safai thanked Commissioner Kim for bringing back the school bus issue and noted the fear District 11 families expressed concern about travelling across multiple neighborhoods after the recent gun incident at Balboa High School. He said the faster the Board received a presentation, the better so they could make a more informed decision about the use of revenues. He noted there were some really strong arguments to reinstitute school bus options for families and children of San Francisco and asked how soon a presentation could be provided to the Board.

Director Chang said she would do her best to expedite a presentation with SFUSD staff.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Cohen moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Fewer.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Tang and Yee (11)

Absent: Commissioner(s) (0)

7. Adopt the Pennsylvania Alignment as the Preliminary Preferred Alternative for Achieving Grade Separations at the intersections of 16th Street/7th Street and Mission Bay Drive/7th Street on the Approach to the Downtown Rail Extension (DTX) Connecting the Caltrain Alignment to the Salesforce Transit Center – ACTION

Luis Zurinaga, Consultant, and Director John Rahaim, San Francisco Planning Department, presented the item.

Commissioner Fewer said she received correspondence from constituents in District 1 that said there had not been a significant outreach regarding the alignment and the conversation around it. She asked what community meetings had been held in District 1.

Director Rahaim said he was not aware of any outreach in District 1 and said outreach had been concentrated on the eastern side of the city, which would be most directly affected. He said staff would be happy to provide outreach to District 1.

Commissioner Fewer said a lot of transportation projects that were not necessarily in one particular district still affected all San Francisco residents. She said not all districts had been introduced to the project and had not been given an opportunity to weigh in. She said the transportation system would help serve all of San Francisco and it was wrong to think that her constituents were not interested, especially when they likely would be asked to help pay for any

future projects. She said she was interested to hear what plans would be made to inform District 1 about what was being proposed.

Director Rahaim said plans would be arranged to outreach to District 1 and that several citywide meetings had been previously held.

Commissioner Fewer requested that the Planning department work closely with her office and said they would be happy to help distribute meeting notices. She said many of her constituents were interested in transit and relied on public transit.

Commissioner Cohen asked what the larger strategy was to engage the city as a whole and what had been done in terms of communication with the southeastern neighborhoods. She said although the infrastructure changes were happening in the southeast sector, the project would have an impact on every corner of the city.

Director Rahaim referenced slide 6 in the presentation that listed the organizations that had been provided presentations and noted that most were on the southeast side of the city and primarily in Districts 6 and 10. He added that there had also been several public meetings and meetings at the Board and Planning Commission. He reminded the Board that this was a first step in what would be a much longer process. He said as the project moved forward into the environmental phase, there would be more strategy for public outreach as well as more detailed meetings.

Commissioner Cohen said that the project had received a mixed reception from the public and stressed the importance of educating people about the project and continuing to conduct outreach. Commissioner Cohen said the CAC would be instrumental in the success of the project, because they had their ears to the ground and were positioned to give their feedback to the Board and public.

Director Rahaim acknowledged that there was some skepticism about whether the project would be implemented given the size and the cost of this project, but reminded the Board that they were making a 100-year decision for the city and region.

Commissioner Cohen said she imagined that there was similar skepticism around BART and the Golden Gate Bridge before those projects were realized and said that those same levels of fear and anxiety currently existed when talking about high-speed rail. She said she appreciated staff's forward thinking and continued optimism.

During public comment Roland Lebrun informed the Board that they were being asked to approve not just the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment but also the rail alignment that would go all the way up to the Salesforce Transit Center. He said it was unclear how the cost of the 16th Street grade separation ballooned from \$200 million to \$1 billion over the last seven years. He said there had been no improvement to the DTX alignment, as well as no potential for a connection to the East Bay. He said that the Salesforce Transit Center platforms were too short to eliminate a requirement for train storage outside the already constructed train box. Mr. Lebrun said the Board had the choice of either starting noninvasive urban surgery on Potrero Hill, with expansion to the transit center, or condemning the South of Market to open-heart surgery for the next half decade.

Peter Straus, San Francisco Transit Riders Board member, strongly urged the Board to adopt the resolution and added that San Francisco Transit Riders had been working to keep the project moving ahead. He said DTX was the highest transit priority after the Central Subway. Mr. Strauss said the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment was the most cost-effective and had the shortest timeline for implementation and urged the Board to follow the CAC's recommendation and adopt the resolution to support the Pennsylvania alignment.

Bruce Agid, Chair of the TJPA CAC, spoke in support of the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment as a preferred alignment for the downtown extension and thanked the CAC and Board for their careful review of the recommendation. He said that as a member of the RAB Working Group he reviewed the materials along with many city leaders and quickly came to agreement that although the rail alignment originally approved in 2004 worked from a rail operations perspective, it was not the optimal approach to meet the city's future needs. He said after a comprehensive review of costs, constructability, ridership numbers, potential opportunities for future land use, opportunities to connect the mission bay community and services together with the rest of the city and overall community quality of life, the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment was clearly the optimal choice. Mr. Agid added that moving the recommendation forward in a timely manner was critical for cost and to keep up with growth, noting that the station and neighborhood would not be able to handle the anticipated volumes of passengers without major infrastructure and station improvements.

Bob Feinbaum, Chair of Save Muni, urged the Board to look carefully at the resolution and stated that the resolution in its current form was unclear. He notified the Board that he had emailed them a suggested revision of the resolution and requested that it be introduced as a subject of discussion. He said the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment added \$2.2 billion to the cost of the project, which would have to be paid by the city. He requested that his printed-out email be distributed to the Board.

Jim Patrick, Owner of Patrick & Company, said the project needed to be divided in terms of funding sources and environmental sources. He said issues would arise if both sources were packaged together. He said there had not been discussion regarding the location of the Fourth and King Streets station and felt it would better appeal to passengers if the station was moved to 7th Street. He urged the Board to think long and hard on the decision to approve the resolution.

Gerald Cauthen, Chairperson of the Bay Area Transportation Working Group, spoke in support of Pennsylvania Avenue alignment and believed the heavy lifting of the transportation part of the study was yet to come because Caltrain was currently doing an extensive operational and maintenance study. He said things like the relationship between that yard and the Pennsylvania Alignment did not need to be decided immediately.

Eileen Bokin concurred with the public commenters who spoke against the resolution and reiterated Commissioner Fewer's concern for more outreach to the western neighborhoods of the city.

At the conclusion of public comment Chair Peskin asked the presenters if they would like to respond to the public comments that had been heard. To Mr. Lebrun's comments about construction impacts, the Chair said he shared those concerns, and noted that recent work on the project had identified the means to eliminate cut and cover work at all but the throat (entrance) to the transit center.

Director Rahaim said one of the reasons for doing the study was to look at tunnel boring technology that would prevent and negate the need for a disruption of all the mentioned streets. He said most the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment, as currently understood, could be bored like the central subway was bored. He said the only cut and cover would occur at the terminal because of the width of the opening. Director Rahaim said the previous proposal would have caused years of disruption to Townsend and Second Streets.

Chair Peskin asked if the presenters had had a chance to look at the language suggested by some of the public commenters and if they had comments.

Director Rahaim said one of the reasons for choosing the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment was that it allowed DTX to forward with the next phase of engineering. He said the ultimate goal was to choose an alignment that was basically underground for a farther distance, which was the Pennsylvania Avenue alignment.

Mr. Zurinaga said staff would take a look at the language carefully and would respond to the Board prior to the next meeting, when the item would come for final approval.

Commissioner Kim moved to approve the item, seconded by Commissioner Yee.

The item was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Brown, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Mandelman, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, Tang and Yee (11)

Absent: Commissioners (0)

8. 2019 Prop K Strategic Plan 5-Year Prioritization Program Update – INFORMATION

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

There was no public comment.

Other Items

9. Introduction of New Items – INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

10. Public Comment

During public comment Roland Lebrun said it was important to be aware of the economic cycle before awarding multibillion-dollar contracts.

Jim Patrick spoke about the success of the Salesforce Transit Center and encouraged the Board to tour the transit center. He said there was a tremendous void that was not being discussed in regard to expansion across the bay and region.

11. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:29 a.m.