



# Memorandum

## AGENDA ITEM 6

**DATE:** April 17, 2024  
**TO:** Transportation Authority Board  
**FROM:** Anna LaForte - Deputy Director for Policy and Programming  
**SUBJECT:** 5/14/2024 Board Meeting: Approve Programming Priorities for Up to \$5,342,905 in San Francisco’s Estimated Fiscal Year 2024/25 State Transit Assistance County Block Grant Funds

<p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b>   <input type="checkbox"/> Information   <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Action</p> <p>Approve programming priorities for up to \$5,342,905 in San Francisco’s Estimated Fiscal Year (FY) 2024/25 State Transit Assistance (STA) County Block Grant funds in the following priority order:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. \$3,300,000 for the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency’s (SFMTA) Paratransit program</li> <li>2. Up to \$356,901 for the BART’s Elevator Attendant Program through the San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4</li> <li>3. Up to \$1,686,004 for the San Francisco Bay Area Water Emergency Transportation Authority’s (WETA) Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service through the SF LTP Cycle 4</li> </ol> <p><b>SUMMARY</b></p> <p>The Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) estimates that San Francisco will receive up to \$5,342,905 in STA County Block Grant funds that can be invested in paratransit and other transit operating and capital needs, including providing lifeline transit services. The Transportation Authority programs these funds in our capacity as the Congestion Management Agency (CMA). MTC has advised us to program 95% of expected revenues, with consideration for programming up to 100% should revenues meet full projections given volatility of this revenue source. Consistent with past programming cycles, we recommend as first priority programming \$3,300,000 to SFMTA’s Paratransit program to complement Prop L funds and support this critical program for</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Fund Allocation</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Fund Programming</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Policy/ Legislation</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Plan/Study</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Capital Project Oversight/ Delivery</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Budget/ Finance</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Contract/ Agreement</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____</li> </ul>
--	--



<p>seniors and persons with disabilities.</p> <p>We prioritized the remaining STA funds through the SF LTP, which supports projects that improve mobility for low-income residents by addressing transportation gaps or barriers identified through equity assessments and collaborative and inclusive community-based planning processes. We recommend up to \$356,901 for BART’s Elevator Attendant Program in FYs 2023/24 and 2024/25. BART and SFMTA equally share the program cost. BART has requested funds to help cover a 7.8% (\$526,086) cost increase due to higher than anticipated personnel and non-personnel expenditures. FY 2023/24 STA revenues are coming in above projected 95% levels, which has already helped reduce the FY 2024/25 STA funds needed to cover the cost increase. We also recommend programming up to \$1,686,004 (at 100% of revenue projection) as ‘seed funding’ toward the first year of operations for WETA’s Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service. This project will benefit the Equity Priority Community of Treasure Island, reducing point source emissions in the area and providing another mobility option. We are working with the WETA and the Treasure Island Development Authority to identify funding for the \$1.8 million gap after accounting for estimated fare revenue. Attachment 1 summarizes the staff recommendation.</p>	
---	--

**BACKGROUND**

STA revenues come from the state sales tax on diesel fuel. It is a flexible transit funding program that can be used for a wide range of capital and operating purposes. It is also a volatile source of funding given the fluctuations in the price of diesel fuel. In FY 2018/19, MTC began distributing a majority of the region’s STA population-based funds to CMAs through a transit-focused STA County Block Grant program. The program allows each county to determine how best to invest in paratransit and other transit operating and capital needs, including providing lifeline transit services. Funds are distributed among the nine Bay Area counties based on the percentage that each county would have received in FY 2018/19 under the former regional programs. MTC requires that by May 15 of each year, CMAs submit the proposed programming for STA population-based funds.

In addition to supporting SFMTA’s Paratransit program through the half-cent transportation sales tax, since FY 2018/19 we have been programming STA funds to SFMTA for Paratransit in line with the amount that SFMTA would have received under the prior regional program. For the remaining STA funds available to San Francisco



an on annual basis, the Board has approved an SF LTP program of projects that address transportation needs of low-income populations. Table 1 shows projects previously funded through the STA County Block Grant Program.

<b>Table 1. San Francisco STA County Block Grant Program Fiscal Years 2018/19 - FY 2023/24</b>		
<b>Fiscal Year(s)</b>	<b>Project (Sponsor)</b>	<b>Total Amount (Actuals)</b>
FYs 2018/19 and 2019/20	Elevator Attendant Program (BART)	\$2,600,000
	San Francisco Community Health Mobility Navigation Project: Removing Health Care Transportation Barriers for Low Access Neighborhoods (SFMTA)	\$396,300
	Continuing Late Night Transit Service to Communities in Need (SFMTA)	\$1,609,700
	Paratransit (SFMTA)	\$3,141,610
FY 2020/21	Paratransit (SFMTA)	\$3,157,152
FY 2021/22 <sup>1</sup>	Paratransit (SFMTA)	\$3,012,914
	Elevator Attendant Program (BART)	\$1,035,626
FY 2023/24	Paratransit (SFMTA)	\$3,300,000
	Elevator Attendant Program (BART)	\$2,227,224 thru April 2024 <i>(Approved up to \$2,340,041)<sup>2</sup></i>
	<b>Total</b>	<b>\$20,480,526</b>

<sup>1</sup> MTC redirected STA County Block Grant funds in FY 2022/23 to other priorities related to assisting transit operators with recovery from the COVID pandemic (MTC Resolution 4481, October 2021).

<sup>2</sup>In May 2023, the Board programmed up to \$2,340,041 (at 100% of revenue projected) in SF LTP funds for BART’s Elevator Attendant Program to cover two years of program costs over FYs 2023/24 and 2024/25. As of April 2024, BART has received \$2,227,224.



## **DISCUSSION**

**Funds Available.** Each year, MTC provides us with a projection of San Francisco's share of STA County Block Grant program revenues for the next funding cycle as well as an updated estimate for the current fiscal year, which may be higher or lower when confirmed at the end of each fiscal year following the State's reconciliation of revenues generated.

In FY 2024/25, MTC estimates that San Francisco will receive \$5,342,905 in STA revenues, which is about 5% lower than the previous fiscal year's estimate.

**Recommendation.** Attachment 1 summarizes our staff recommendation for programming FY 2024/25 STA block grant funds. The sections below describe each of the recommended projects.

**SFMTA's Paratransit Program (\$3,300,000).** As detailed in Attachment 2, the recommended STA funds would support SFMTA's Paratransit program, which provides transit services for seniors and persons with disabilities and includes the Essential Trip Card, a program that launched at the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic to help older adults and people with disabilities pay for essential trips in taxis. The recommended funding amount is equal to the amount provided in the previous programming cycle. The SFMTA provides paratransit services to persons with disabilities, in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. These programs are critically important to persons with disabilities and the elderly who are unable to fully utilize other forms of public transportation.

**BART's Elevator Attendant Program (up to \$356,901).** This program provides elevator attendants from the non-profit Urban Alchemy to monitor each elevator at the four downtown BART and SFMTA shared stations: Civic Center/UN Plaza, Powell Street, Montgomery Street, and Embarcadero. The attendants help to improve safety, mobility, and accessibility for customers who rely on elevators to access the transit systems, and discourage undesirable behaviors, improve elevator cleanliness and performance, decrease fare evasion, and reduce maintenance costs. The program also supports economic recovery for downtown San Francisco and encourages people to take transit. BART and SFMTA contribute equally to the cost of the program. We have funded this program with SF LTP since 2019.

In May 2023, the Board approved programming of up to \$2,340,041 in SF LTP Cycle 3 funds to BART for two years of Elevator Attendant Program costs in FYs 2023/24 and 2024/25. Through April 2024, MTC has allocated \$2,227,224 to BART or



\$169,185 over the 95% of projected STA revenues in SF LTP Cycle 3 funds. The elevator attendant program has a 7.8% cost increase of \$526,086. Since FY 23/24 STA revenues have come in over the 95% level, BART has already applied those funds toward the cost increase and is requesting \$356,901 in FY 2024/25 funds to close the gap. BART attributes the cost increase to higher than anticipated costs for elevator attendant salaries, fringe benefits, program administration, and non-personnel items such as uniforms. BART has put in place additional project control measures (described in a letter from BART appended to Attachment 3) to more closely monitor contract expenditures and will provide more detailed expenditure information to the Transportation Authority on a quarterly basis.

It's possible that additional Cycle 3 funds will become available to the project (i.e. up to 100% of revenue estimate), which would reduce the need for Cycle 4 funds by a dollar-for-dollar amount (up to \$112,817). We will not know the final amount of FY 2023/24 STA revenues until fall 2024 which is why we are recommending 'up to \$356,901'.

**WETA's Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service (\$1,418,859 - up to \$1,686,004).**

As detailed in Attachment 4, the recommended STA funds would contribute to the first 12 months of operations of electrified ferry service on the route between Treasure Island and the Ferry Building. WETA would operate the service using one electric vessel (149 passenger capacity), replacing the current diesel-powered service operated by the private developer. We are recommending \$1,418,859, up to \$1,686,004 if STA revenues come in high enough, as 'seed' money toward public ferry operations since fully electric service will benefit the Equity Priority Community of Treasure Island by reducing point source emissions in the area. Ferry service to Treasure Island also will support the expected increase in population from 2,000 residents to more than 20,000 new residents in 8,000 new homes, 27% of which will be affordable, by 2042. The service will also connect people to existing and planned open space, hotels, restaurants, shops, and entertainment venues.

The recommended STA funds represent about half of the 12-month operating budget of \$3,775,833. WETA estimates fares will generate \$521,850, leaving a gap of \$1,835,125. In our role as TIMMA, we are working to support WETA's efforts to identify and secure potential funding sources to close the gap. Electrified ferry service is expected to begin in 2026 to meet a California Air Resources Board (CARB) requirement that ferry routes under three nautical miles be zero-emission. Future years of ferry service are planned to be funded by a combination of fare revenues, an Operating Subsidy funded by the Treasure Island private developer,



federal/state/regional funding, and revenues from the congestion management system once the program is adopted.

Ferry service has been a central component of improved transit access to the island since the 2011 Treasure Island Transportation Implementation Plan, which included extensive outreach.

**Next Steps.** Following Board approval of this item, we will provide the Board resolution to MTC. We anticipate returning to the Board in Spring 2025 to program the FY 2025/26 STA revenues.

### **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

There are no impacts to the Transportation Authority's budget associated with the recommended action.

### **CAC POSITION**

The CAC considered this item at its April 24, 2024, meeting and unanimously adopted a motion of support for the staff recommendation.

### **SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIALS**

- Attachment 1: Recommended Fiscal Year 2024/25 STA Block Grant Programming
- Attachment 2: SFMTA's Paratransit Program
- Attachment 3: BART's Elevator Attendant Program
- Attachment 4: WETA's Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service
- Attachment 5: Resolution

**Attachment 1.**

<b>Recommended Fiscal Year 2024/25 STA Block Grant Programming<sup>1</sup></b>	
<b>Listed in Priority Order (Sponsor)</b>	
1. Paratransit Program (SFMTA)	\$3,300,000
2. Elevator Attendant Program (BART)	Up \$356,901 <sup>2</sup>
3. Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service (WETA)	\$1,418,859 up to \$1,686,004 <sup>3</sup>
Total	\$5,075,760 up to \$5,342,905
<b>Programming at 95% of estimate</b>	<b>\$ 5,075,760</b>
<b>Total funds at 100% estimate</b>	<b>\$5,342,905</b>

<sup>1</sup>Given the uncertainty of forecasting STA revenues, MTC recommends that CMAs prioritize programming 95% of their county's estimated STA amount and may identify programming for up to 100% should revenues reach that level.

<sup>2</sup>In May 2023, the Transportation Authority Board programmed up to \$2,340,041 in SF LTP Cycle 3 funds for BART's Elevator Attendant Program. As of April 2024, MTC has allocated \$2,227,224 to the project. If additional Cycle 3 funds become available, this would reduce the need for Cycle 4 funds by a dollar-for-dollar amount.

<sup>3</sup>The amount available for this project depends on the actual STA revenues received and whether the BART project receives additional FY 23/24 STA revenues. See footnote 2.



**Attachment 2.  
Fiscal Year 2024/25 State Transit Assistance County Block Grant Program  
Programming Recommendation**

## **Paratransit**

**Sponsor:** San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)

**Recommended State Transit Assistance County Block Grant Programming:** \$3,300,000

**Recommended Phase:** Operations

**Districts:** City-wide

### **SCOPE**

The SFMTA provides paratransit services to persons with disabilities, in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Paratransit services are provided to persons with disabilities who are unable to independently ride bus or light rail service some or all the time and are certified eligible according to federal criteria. Paratransit in San Francisco is administered by a broker that delivers service through a diverse set of providers and resources, including 100 city-owned vehicles that are less than 5 years old, private taxis and group vans associated with community-based organizations throughout the city. On June 14, 2016, the Board of Supervisors approved a contract with Transdev to provide paratransit broker services through June 30, 2021, with an option for a five-year extension, and in an amount not to exceed \$142,902,104. On May 14, 2021, the Board of Supervisors approved exercising the option for the five-year extension recommended by the SFMTA Board and increased the not to exceed amount to \$308,271,023.

The paratransit broker services include determination of client eligibility, customer service, overseeing and monitoring the operation of the taxi debit card system, procuring, subcontracting, and oversight of van and taxi services, and reporting and record keeping. Transdev itself operates the SF Access service and a portion of the group van services. All other transportation services for which the broker is responsible are procured via contracts with other providers. In addition, the broker is responsible for the continued development and implementation of the mobility management program, including activities to make it easier for San Francisco's disabled and senior residents to navigate the transportation services available to them, including the Shop-a-Round and Van Gogh shuttles and Ramp Taxi Incentives programs. The broker also administers the Essential Trip Card (ETC) program, which was initiated in response to the COVID-19 pandemic and reduced Muni service and will continue through FY 2024/25.

The ETC program is a taxi service available to all seniors and individuals with disabilities who need to complete essential trips. SFMTA will be transitioning this service into a permanent program and still needs to identify long term funding. The Mobility Management staff at SF





**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

**Attachment 1.**

Fiscal Year 2024/25 State Transit Assistance County Block Grant Program  
Programming Recommendation  
Paratransit

Paratransit administers this program, including enrollment and handling inquiries from the public, along with other outreach duties.

Key performance trends for the Paratransit program are shown in the table below:

PARATRANSIT PERFORMANCE INDICATORS	FY 2018/19	FY 2019/20	FY 2020/21	FY 2021/22	FY 2022/23	FY 2023/24 (THRU JANUARY 2024)
<b>Total Passenger Trips Provided</b>	720,807	592,207	387,136	488,085	519,626	315,342
<b>ETC Trips Provided</b>	N/A	3,963	63,729	83,939	82,999	51,395
<b>On-time Percentage: Group Van &amp; Access Van</b>	83.07%	90.85%	99.32%	94.64%	93.99%	96.91%
<b>On-time Percentage: Taxi</b>	96.16%	95.53%	95.80%	92.79%	94.35%	97.21%
<b>Complaints</b>	739	517	217	249	208	103
<b>Cost per Passenger Trip</b>	\$39.01	\$44.87	\$57.56	\$53.17	\$54.79	\$53.10

Paratransit Draft Funding & Budget Changes - FY2024/25

Funding Plan	Approved		Proposed		Increase (Decrease)	% Change
	FY2023/24 Budget	% of Contract Budget	FY2024/25 Budget	% of Contract Budget		
<b>Revenues/Recovery</b>						
<b><u>Paratransit (including Essential Trip Card Program, Shop-a-Round and Van Gogh Shuttles, and Ramp Taxi Incentives program)</u></b>						
Federal Transit Agency 5307	\$ 5,585,157	16.5%	\$ 5,752,712	16.6%	\$ 167,555	3%
Prop K/L*	\$ 14,039,647	41.4%	\$ 13,506,000	38.9%	\$ (533,647)	-4%
BART ADA Contribution	\$ 2,134,502	6.3%	\$ 2,198,000	6.3%	\$ 63,498	3%
State Transit Assistance (STA) - Paratransit **	\$ 3,300,000	9.7%	\$ 3,300,000	9.5%	\$ -	0%
SFMTA Operating Budget	\$ 8,333,720	24.6%	\$ 9,436,445	27.2%	\$ 1,102,725	13%
Department of Disabled and Aging Recovery	\$ 500,000	1.5%	\$ 550,000	1.6%	\$ 50,000	10%
<b>Paratransit subtotal</b>	<b>\$ 33,893,026</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>\$ 34,743,157</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>\$ 850,131</b>	<b>3%</b>

Major Line Item Budget	Approved		Proposed		Increase (Decrease)
	FY2023/24 Budget	% of Contract Budget	FY2024/25 Budget	% of Contract Budget	
<b><u>Apportionment</u></b>					
Paratransit Broker	\$ 33,893,026	100%	\$ 34,743,157	100%	\$ 850,131
Muni Paratransit Staff ***	\$ 410,363	1%	\$ 422,674	1%	\$ 12,311
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 34,303,389</b>	<b>101%</b>	<b>\$ 35,165,831</b>	<b>101%</b>	<b>\$ 862,442</b>

\*FY 2024/25 is the amount available for allocation in the Prop L Strategic Plan Baseline.

\*\*FY 2024/25 STA revenues are projections and annual amounts may be higher or lower when confirmed at the end of the fiscal year following the State's reconciliation of actual revenues generated. In the event of a shortfall in SF's STA funds for FY 2024/25, the SFMTA will work with Transportation Authority staff to adjust the Paratransit funding plan accordingly.

\*\*\* Not funded by Prop K or Prop L

**San Francisco County Transportation Authority  
Prop K/Prop AA Allocation Request Form**

**Key Paratransit Performance Trends FY 2019-2024**

YTD  
(January 2024)

<b>Paratransit Performance Indicators</b>	<b>FY 2018/19</b>	<b>FY 2019/20</b>	<b>FY 2020/21</b>	<b>FY 2021/22</b>	<b>FY 2022/23</b>	<b>FY 2023/24</b>
Total Passenger Trips Provided	720,807	592,207	387,136	488,085	519,626	315,342
ETC Trips		3,963	63,729	83,939	82,999	51,395
On-time Percentage						
(Group Van & Access Van)	83.07%	90.85%	99.32%	94.64%	93.99%	96.91%
Taxi	96.16%	95.53%	95.80%	92.79%	94.35%	97.21%
Complaints	739	517	217	249	208	103
Cost per Passenger Trip	\$39.01	\$44.87	\$57.56	\$53.17	\$54.79	\$53.10



**Attachment 3.**

**Fiscal Year 2024/25 San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4  
Programming Recommendation**

## **Elevator Attendant Program**

**Sponsor:** Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART), with San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)

**Recommended SF LTP Cycle 4 Programming:** \$356,901

**Recommended Phase:** Operations

**Districts:** 3, 5, 6

### **SCOPE**

This request for funding would supplement SF LTP funds programmed by the Board in May 2023 for two fiscal years (FY23-24 and FY24-25) of operations of the Elevator Attendant program at all four downtown BART and Muni stations to cover unforeseen cost increases.

BART, the SFMTA and the non-profit Urban Alchemy will continue elevator attendant services during the 21-hour period that the Powell Street, Civic Center/UN Plaza, Montgomery Street, and Embarcadero stations are open to the public. The 21-hour day is broken up into three seven-hour shifts with eight to ten attendants on duty at a time. Attendants fill three shifts per day, with two attendants at each station, one attendant assigned to roam between two stations, and supervisors that assist with breaks. The attendants oversee the operation and cleanliness of each elevator within the stations, providing clean and functioning elevators for BART and SFMTA customers, particularly disabled passengers, seniors, and families with strollers who cannot use the stairs within the station. The transit four stations are located in Equity Priority Communities.

The initial 6-month Elevator Attendant pilot program began in April 2018. It was extended by BART and SFMTA with the help of \$2.6 million in SF LTP Cycle 1 funds programmed by the Transportation Authority Board in April 2019 through the State Transit Assistance Block Grant. In June 2022, the Board approved \$1,035,626 in SF LTP Cycle 2 funds to help fund the project through June 2023. In May 2023, the Board approved up to \$2,340,041 in SF LTP Cycle 3 funds to fund the project for Fiscal Years 2023/24 and 2024/25. The final amount determined by program revenues was \$2,227,224. Since 2019, BART and SFMTA have had an agreement to administer the Program, whereby BART manages the service provider and tracks program data, invoices, and payments. Currently, BART and SFMTA are negotiating a new cost sharing agreement, expected to be executed by summer 2024.

Pre-pandemic, approximately 160,000 customers used the elevators at the four downtown stations each month. Post-pandemic, an average of 36,000 customers have used the



elevators each month (FY 2021/22 data). BART expects ridership of 40,000 customers per station per month and that 1,920,000 customers will benefit from the Program annually.

The goals of the Elevator Attendant Program are to ensure elevators at the four downtown San Francisco stations consistently remain safe, clean, and in working order for all BART and SFMTA customers.

The following are objectives related to the project goals:

- Objective 1: Provide elevator service to transit customers
- Objective 2: Improve cleanliness at Civic Center/UN Plaza, Powell Street, Montgomery Street, and Embarcadero stations
- Objective 3: Reduce elevator down time at the downtown San Francisco stations

See the attached SF LTP Cycle 4 application for additional details on the Elevator Attendant Program.

## REPORTING AND PERFORMANCE METRICS

As a condition of receiving the SF LTP funds:

- The funds must be spent in the fiscal year of allocation; and
- BART will be required to provide quarterly progress reports to the Transportation Authority. In these reports, BART will provide quarterly program expenditure information and will report on the effectiveness of the project with the following performance metrics:

PERFORMANCE METRIC	DESCRIPTION	REPORTING FREQUENCY	GOAL
<b>Users Served</b>	Number of users of elevators at each station, including number of disabled users, users with strollers, luggage, bicycles, and carts.	Monthly	Increase or maintain access to users, particularly disabled users
<b>Biowaste Incidents</b>	Number of incidents, per station, in which BART cleaning staff encounter needles or biowaste in an elevator	Monthly	Reduce biowaste incidents
<b>Passenger Cleanliness Rating</b>	Passenger ratings for station cleanliness (1-4 scale), including platform areas and other areas. Data collected from quarterly passenger surveys.	Quarterly	Improve station cleanliness ratings



**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

Fiscal Year 2024/25 San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4

**Programming Recommendation**

Elevator Attendant Program

Page 3 of 4

<b>PERFORMANCE METRIC</b>	<b>DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>REPORTING FREQUENCY</b>	<b>GOAL</b>
<b>Elevator Availability</b>	Percent of the time station elevators are available for patron use during service periods	Quarterly	Increase elevator availability

---



**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

Fiscal Year 2024/25 San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4

**Programming Recommendation**

Elevator Attendant Program

Page 4 of 4

**COST (SEE DETAILS BELOW)**

	<b>ORIGINAL TOTAL COST FY 2023/24 FY 2024/25</b>	<b>UPDATED TOTAL COST FY 2023/24 FY 2024/25</b>	<b>INCREASE</b>	
Attendant Costs (52 weeks per year, 7 days per week, 21 hours per day)	\$4,535,728	\$4,567,380	\$31,653	0.7%
Program Oversight, Weekly Reporting, Workforce Development, Other Grant Activities	\$1,329,868	\$1,572,782	\$242,914	18.3%
Non-Personnel/Variable Costs (e.g. phones, uniforms)	\$19,200	\$73,280	\$54,080	281.7%
Indirect Costs (Admin and Overhead)	\$900,476	\$1,097,915	\$197,439	21.9%
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>\$6,785,272</b>	<b>\$7,311,358</b>	<b>\$526,086</b>	<b>7.8%</b>

**FUNDING PLAN**

<b>SOURCE</b>	<b>STATUS</b>	<b>TOTAL FUNDING FY 2023/24 - FY 2024/25</b>	<b>% OF COST BY FUND SOURCE</b>
SF LTP Cycle 4	Planned	\$356,901	5%
SF LTP Cycle 3	Allocated	\$2,227,224*	30%
BART Operating Funds	Planned	\$2,363,617	32%
SFMTA Operating Funds	Planned	\$2,363,617	32%
<b>Total Funding</b>		<b>\$7,311,359</b>	

\*The Transportation Authority Board programmed up to \$2,340,041 in SF LTP Cycle 3 funds in May 2023 (MTC has allocated \$2,227,224 to date). If additional Cycle 3 funds become available to the project, this would reduce the need for Cycle 4 funds by a dollar-for-dollar amount.

Original Elevator Attendant Budget - July 1, 2023 Through June 30, 2025								
Station	Participants/ Staff	\$/Hr	Hours/ Day	Days	Units	Year 1 FY23-24	Year 2 FY24-25	Total
<b>A. Direct Program Personnel</b>								
<b>12 Months @ Powell St</b>								
Worker Participants	7.50	\$ 21.00	7.00	365		\$ 402,413	\$ 402,413	\$ 804,826
Fringe Benefits (38%)						\$ 152,917	\$ 152,917	\$ 305,834
<b>12 Months @ Civic Center Station</b>								
Worker Participants	7.50	\$ 21.00	7.00	365		\$ 402,413	\$ 402,413	\$ 804,826
Fringe Benefits (38%)						\$ 152,917	\$ 152,917	\$ 305,834
<b>12 Months @ Montgomery Station</b>								
Worker Participants	7.50	\$ 21.00	7.00	365		\$ 402,413	\$ 402,413	\$ 804,826
Fringe Benefits (38%)						\$ 152,917	\$ 152,917	\$ 305,834
<b>12 Months @ Embarcadero Station</b>								
Worker Participants	7.50	\$ 21.00	7.00	365		\$ 402,413	\$ 402,413	\$ 804,826
Fringe Benefits (38%)						\$ 152,917	\$ 152,917	\$ 305,834
Total Salary						\$ 1,609,650	\$ 1,609,650	\$ 3,219,302
Fringe Benefits (38%)						\$ 611,667	\$ 611,667	\$ 1,223,335
<b>Stand-In for Absence due</b>						\$ 46,547	\$ 46,547	\$ 93,094
<b>Direct Program Personnel Total</b>						<b>\$ 2,267,864</b>	<b>\$ 2,267,864</b>	<b>\$ 4,535,727</b>
<b>B. Program Oversight, Weekly Reporting, Workforce Development, and other Grant Activities</b>								
Executive Director		\$ 72.00	1.25	260		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Program Director	1	\$ 36.00	8.00	260		\$ 74,880	\$ 74,880	\$ 149,760
Deputy Director	1	\$ 30.00	8.00	260		\$ 62,400	\$ 62,400	\$ 124,800
Site Supervisors	6	\$ 26.00	8.00	260		\$ 324,480	\$ 324,480	\$ 648,960
<b>Total Salary</b>						\$ 461,760	\$ 461,760	\$ 923,520
<b>Fringe Benefits</b>					44%	\$ 203,174	\$ 203,174	\$ 406,349
<b>Program Oversight Total</b>						<b>\$ 664,934</b>	<b>\$ 664,934</b>	<b>\$ 1,329,868</b>
<b>Personnel Total</b>	<b>38.00</b>					<b>\$ 2,932,798</b>	<b>\$ 2,932,798</b>	<b>\$ 5,865,595</b>
<b>C. Non-Personnel / Variable Costs</b>								
Phones	1				\$ 2,000	\$ 2,000	\$ 2,000	\$ 4,000
Uniforms	38				\$ 200	\$ 7,600	\$ 7,600	\$ 15,200
								\$ -
<b>Non-Personnel Total</b>						<b>\$ 9,600</b>	<b>\$ 9,600</b>	<b>\$ 19,200</b>
<b>TOTAL DIRECT COSTS:</b>						<b>\$ 2,942,398</b>	<b>\$ 2,942,398</b>	<b>\$ 5,884,795</b>
<b>D. Indirect Costs</b>								
Administrative & Overhead (13%)					13%	\$ 450,238	\$ 450,238	\$ 900,476
<b>Total Costs</b>						<b>\$ 3,392,636</b>	<b>\$ 3,392,636</b>	<b>\$ 6,785,272</b>



Updated Year 1 FY23/24 Elevator Attendant Budget (03.28.24)						
	Particip ants/ Staff	\$/Hr	Hours/ Day	Annual Full Time Salary (for 1.00 FTE)	% FTE funded	Year 1 FY23-24
<b>12 Months @ Powell St</b>						
Practitioners at Powell St.	9	\$19.00	8.00	\$ 39,520	100%	\$ 355,680
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 200,604
<b>12 Months @ Civic Center Station</b>						
Practitioners at Civic Center	9	\$19.00	8.00	\$ 39,520	100%	\$ 355,680
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 200,604
<b>12 Months @ Montgomery Station</b>						
Practitioners at Montgomery	9	\$19.00	8.00	\$ 39,520	100%	\$ 355,680
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 200,604
<b>12 Months @ Embarcadero Station</b>						
Practitioners at Embarcadero	9	\$19.00	8.00	\$ 39,520	100%	\$ 355,680
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 200,604
Total Salary						\$ 1,422,720
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 802,414
<b>Direct Program Personnel Total</b>						<b>\$ 2,225,134</b>
<b>B. Program Oversight, Weekly Reporting, Workforce Development, and other Grant Activities</b>						
Department Director	1	\$34.00	8.00	\$ 70,720	100%	\$ 70,720
Deputy Director	1	\$31.25	8.00	\$ 65,000	100%	\$ 65,000
Supervisor	6	\$26.00	8.00	\$ 54,080	100%	\$ 324,480
Bay Area Operations Director	1	\$57.69	8.00	\$ 119,995	18%	\$ 21,599
Deputy Operations Manager	1	\$36.00	8.00	\$ 74,880	10%	\$ 7,488
Analyst	1	\$24.00	8.00	\$ 49,920	50%	\$ 24,960
<b>Total Salary</b>						\$ 514,247
<b>Fringe Benefits</b>	56.4%					\$ 290,035
<b>Program Oversight Total</b>						<b>\$ 804,283</b>
<b>Personnel Total</b>	<b>47.00</b>					<b>\$ 3,029,417</b>
Materials & Supplies (gloves, masks, others)						\$ 8,000
Technology (tablets, data collection)						\$ 8,000
Uniforms (\$100/each; 100 Total)						\$ 10,000
Communications Radios (\$360/each)					24	\$ 8,640
<b>Non-Personnel Total</b>						<b>\$ 34,640</b>
<b>TOTAL DIRECT COSTS:</b>						<b>\$ 3,064,057</b>
<b>D. Indirect Costs</b>						
Administrative & Overhead @ 17.67%						\$ 541,419
<b>Total Costs</b>						<b>\$ 3,605,476</b>

## Updated Year 2 FY24/25 Elevator Attendant Budget (03.28.24)

	Particip ants/ Staff	\$/Hr	Hours/ Day	Annual Full Time Salary (for 1.00 FTE)	% FTE funded	Year 2 FY24-25
<b>12 Months @ Powell St</b>						
Practicioners at Powell St.	9	\$20.00	8.00	\$ 41,600	100%	\$ 374,400
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 211,162
<b>12 Months @ Civic Center Station</b>						
Practicioners at Civic Center	9	\$20.00	8.00	\$ 41,600	100%	\$ 374,400
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 211,162
<b>12 Months @ Montgomery Station</b>						
Practicioners at Montgomery	9	\$20.00	8.00	\$ 41,600	100%	\$ 374,400
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 211,162
<b>12 Months @ Embarcadero Station</b>						
Practicioners at Embarcadero	9	\$20.00	8.00	\$ 41,600	100%	\$ 374,400
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 211,162
Total Salary						\$ 1,497,600
Fringe Benefits (56.4%)						\$ 844,646
<b>Direct Program Personnel Total</b>						<b>\$ 2,342,246</b>
<b>B. Program Oversight, Weekly Reporting, Workforce Development, and other Grant Activities</b>						
Department Director	1	\$34.00	8.00	\$ 70,720	50%	\$ 35,360
Deputy Director	1	\$31.25	8.00	\$ 65,000	100%	\$ 65,000
Supervisor	6	\$27.00	8.00	\$ 56,160	100%	\$ 336,960
Bay Area Operations Director	1	\$57.69	8.00	\$ 120,000	18%	\$ 21,600
Deputy Operations Manager	1	\$36.00	8.00	\$ 74,880	10%	\$ 7,488
Analyst	1	\$24.00	8.00	\$ 49,920	50%	\$ 24,960
<b>Total Salary</b>						\$ 491,368
<b>Fringe Benefits</b>	56.4%					\$ 277,132
						<b>\$ 768,500</b>
<b>Personnel Total</b>	<b>47.00</b>					<b>\$ 3,110,746</b>
Materials & Supplies (gloves, masks, others)						\$ 12,000
Technology (tablets, data collection)						\$ 8,000
Uniforms (\$100/each; 100 Total)						\$ 10,000
Communications Radios (\$360/each)					24	\$ 8,640
<b>Non-Personnel Total</b>						<b>\$ 38,640</b>
<b>TOTAL DIRECT COSTS:</b>						<b>\$ 3,149,386</b>
<b>D. Indirect Costs</b>						
Administrative & Overhead @ 17.67%						\$ 556,496
<b>Total Costs</b>						<b>\$ 3,705,882</b>



**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
 2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688  
 Oakland, CA 94604-2688  
 (510) 464-6000

2024

April 11, 2024

Bevan Dufty  
 PRESIDENT

Mark Foley  
 VICE PRESIDENT

Robert Powers  
 GENERAL MANAGER

Anna LaForte  
 Deputy Director for Policy and Programming  
 San Francisco County Transportation Authority  
 1455 Market Street, 22<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
 San Francisco, CA 94103

## DIRECTORS

Debora Allen  
 1ST DISTRICT

Mark Foley  
 2ND DISTRICT

Rebecca Saltzman  
 3RD DISTRICT

Robert Raburn, Ph.D.  
 4TH DISTRICT

John McPartland  
 5TH DISTRICT

Elizabeth Ames  
 6TH DISTRICT

Lateefah Simon  
 7TH DISTRICT

Janice Li  
 8TH DISTRICT

Bevan Dufty  
 9TH DISTRICT

RE: Cost Estimate Modification for Elevator Attendant Program, FY23-24 and FY24-25 and Request for State Transit Assistance County Block Grant funds

Dear Anna,

The San Francisco Bay Area Rapid District (BART) presents updated cost estimates for the Elevator Attendant Program and requests to be considered for additional State Transit Assistance funding, administered by the San Francisco Transportation Authority (SFCTA) through the Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP). Additional funding will enable BART, in partnership with San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) to continue providing Elevator Attendant Program services at downtown San Francisco stations, including Embarcadero, Montgomery Street, Powell Street, and Civic Center/UN Plaza.

### Background

The Elevator Attendant Program (the Program) helps to improve safety, mobility, and accessibility for customers who rely on elevators to access downtown San Francisco stations shared between BART and SFMTA. The Program was launched as a 6-month pilot in April of 2018 at the Powell Street and Civic Center/UN Plaza stations, and it was expanded in November of 2019 to Embarcadero and Montgomery Street stations. The Program is coordinated in partnership with SFMTA. Since 2019, BART and SFMTA have had an agreement to administer the Program. The agreement identifies BART as the Program's administrator, managing service provision, tracking program outcomes, and coordinating data management, invoices, and payments. Currently, BART and SFMTA are finalizing details to extend the current agreement. The new agreement between BART and SFMTA will cover the program from the date of execution and forward for three years, with an option for a two-year extension. In the interim, BART has submitted to SFMTA Program details and costs through an existing Joint Maintenance Agreement (JMA) that includes projects and services at the shared downtown stations.

Pre-pandemic, approximately 160,000 customers used the elevators at the four downtown stations each month. In FY19-20, the Program provided services through the COVID-19 pandemic, and in FY20-21, the Program began to serve an average of 36,000 customers per station per month. Usage for FY21-22 slightly increased. Then, in FY22-23, BART saw a 33% increase in ridership, reflected in a greater number of Elevator Attendant Program users: an average of 89,362 users per station each month that year.

BART contracts Urban Alchemy (UA), a community-based organization and social enterprise, to manage and operate the Elevator Attendant Program. The Program addresses sanitation, safety, and security concerns inside each elevator. The Program provides services while trains are in service and stations are open to ensure all customers in need of an elevator can benefit. Each station has two elevators, and each elevator has one to two attendants for each shift. Attendants staff the elevators during the 21-hour period when

April 11, 2024

Page 2

stations are open to the public. The 21-hour period is broken up into three seven-hour shifts. Each shift is also staffed with one floater and multiple supervisors to ensure the service is not interrupted during breaks and emergencies. The Program's services are important for people with disabilities, seniors, families with strollers, and tourists who cannot use the stairs or escalators within the station. The attendants greet customers, operate the elevator, collect data on the number of users and their demographics, and intervene, when appropriate, to deter inappropriate behavior.

The Program addresses the needs of BART and SFMTA's customers and of downtown community members living near the stations. The attendants help to ensure elevators at the four stations consistently remain safe, clean, and in working order. Additionally, improved cleanliness of the elevators has helped to reduce elevator downtime. Customers, including those who arrive by paratransit and need to use the elevator to access fixed route transit service, now have more reliable elevator service to get to and from the platform. Thus, the Program enhances access for people with disabilities and paratransit riders.

The Program also supports the economic recovery for downtown San Francisco, improving the overall experience of public transit for all customers who are served. Tourists, visitors, people with disabilities, families with small children, older adults, and people with limited mobility benefit from having clean, safe, and reliable elevator services when traveling to or from downtown stations. Tourists visiting from out-of-state or out-of-the country, arriving to the Bay Area through the San Francisco International Airport (SFO) or the Oakland International Airport (OAK), can easily travel with luggage to reach destinations downtown. According to the San Francisco Travel Association's Visitor Impact Results for 2023, San Francisco "attracted 23.1 million visitors who spent \$8.8 billion in 2023", showing a 5.2% year-over-year increase. For 2024, San Francisco Travel forecasts growth in visitor spending driven primarily by increased leisure and business travel – visitor volume is expected to reach 23.7 million.

### **Program Management and Cost**

BART and SFMTA jointly fund operation of the Program with operating and grant funds. Since the Program's inception, the San Francisco LTP has been a primary and only source of grant funding, supporting up to ~30% percent of annual costs. SFCTA has been programming these LTP funds in its capacity as the Congestion Management Agency for San Francisco. In 2019, through the SF LTP, Cycle 1, SFCTA programmed \$2.6 million for Program services in FY19-20 and FY20-21. In June 2022, SFCTA programmed approximately \$1 million in SF LTP, Cycle 2, funds for Program services in FY22-23. Most recently, in May of 2023, SFCTA programmed up to \$2,340,041 of SF LTP, Cycle 3 funds, to support Program services in FY23-24 and FY24-25.

### **Cost Modification**

The Program has experienced a cost increase in FY23-24 and FY24-25 due to multiple factors, including increased fringe benefits costs and additional staffing needs:

- Fringe rate: previously submitted cost estimates for the program included a 38% fringe rate for Elevator Attendants/Worker Participants and a 44% fringe rate for Program oversight staff, including site supervisors and directors. The updated cost estimate includes a 56.4% fringe rate. This rate variance is based on increased costs for fringe benefits for the provider of services, UA. Fringe benefits provided by UA to staff include medical benefits, sick leave, holidays, and contributions to retirement saving plans. The current Fringe includes taxes (9.2%), health and welfare (18.5%), other benefits including retirement, phone, and direct fees (2%), Workers Compensation (17.2%), and All Leave, Holiday, PTO, Training (9.62%). The increase in Fringe Rate represents a sharp increase in Workers Compensation rates and Health and Welfare cost increases. Market rate costs for these benefits have increased due to inflation for these services.
- Additional staff: between FY21-22 and FY22-23, UA leadership obtained additional knowledge of the needs of Elevator Attendants/Worker Participant at the downtown San Francisco stations. UA leadership recognized Attendants needed additional support to address the wide-ranging situations they face managing each elevator increasing the number of overall attendants from 30 to 36. Additionally, UA leadership acknowledged a greater need for management to oversee, train, and support Site Supervisors and to coordinate, develop, and present quarterly and annual reports to funding partners. Consequently, UA leadership expanded to include three additional roles, Bay Area Operations Director, Deputy

April 11, 2024

Page 3

Operations Manager, and Data Analyst. These roles are partially attributed to/funded by the Elevator Attendant program at 18%, 10%, and 50%, respectively.

In FY23-24, the Program has experienced a 6.27% cost increase, or \$212,841. For FY24-25, BART expects the Program to experience a 9.23% cost increase, or \$313,246. Please see attached Updated Budgets and Detailed Budgets for specifics. To assist BART and SFMTA with meeting the funding needs of the program, we request to be considered for currently available additional State Transit Assistance County Block Grant funding, administered by SFCTA through the Lifeline Transportation Program.

**Program Management and Monitoring**

BART, in partnership with SFMTA, are committed to ensuring the Elevator Attendant Program provides quality services to all riders and to ensure the Program continues to exist for the economic recovery of San Francisco. BART, as the oversight administrator of the Program recognizes additional training, supervision, and support is needed to ensure the Elevator Attendant Program service provider continues to be successful. In spring 2024, BART will implement additional steps to support the current vendor, UA. BART will provide UA's Elevator Attendants/Worker Participants additional training and UA's management additional administrative and resource building support. BART will also conduct monthly and quarterly check-ins with UA's management to ensure resources needed are identified and addressed early on. This will help BART to put in place control measures to monitor project spending and reduce future escalation for FY24-25. Additionally, we will share with SFCTA in our quarterly reporting all available data from the monthly reports that BART receives from UA on the performance of the Program.

We look forward to continued partnership both with SFMTA and SFCTA on this critical program. Thank you again for your consideration.

Sincerely,



Rob Jaques  
Manager, Grants & Funding Advocacy

cc: Pamela Herhold, Assistant General Manager  
Priya Mathur, Director, Funding Strategy  
Aileen Hernandez, Principal Grants Officer



# Elevator Attendant Program Details

AS SUBMITTED WITH ORIGINAL APPLICATION FOR FY23/24  
AND FY24/25 FUNDING – MAY 2023



## Project Need, Goals and Objectives

### **Provide a detailed project description. Estimate the number of people per month and year that will be served by this project.**

The Elevator Attendant Program is a partnership between the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), also known as Muni, to provide attendant services inside elevators located in San Francisco. The Program was launched as a 6-month pilot in April of 2018 at the Powell St. and Civic Center/UN Plaza stations, and it was expanded to Embarcadero and Montgomery St. stations in November of 2019. In 2020, the Program continued to provide services through the COVID-19 pandemic, although ridership was significantly reduced for both transit agencies. In FY 2021/22, an average of 36,000 customers used the elevators at each station per month. BART expects modest ridership growth to 40,000 customers per station per month in FY 2023/24 and that 1,920,000 customers will benefit from the Program annually. This request for funding would extend the program at all four downtown BART and Muni stations for two additional years (FY23-24 and FY24-25).

The Program addresses sanitation, safety, and security concerns inside each elevator. The Program provides services while trains are in service to ensure all customers in need of an elevator can benefit. Each station has two elevators, and each elevator has one attendant for each shift. Attendants staff the elevators during the 21-hour period when stations are open to the public. The 21-hour period is broken up into three seven-hour shifts. Each shift is also staffed with one floater and multiple supervisors to ensure the service is not interrupted. This service is important for people with disabilities, seniors, families with strollers, and tourists who cannot use the stairs or escalators within the station. The attendants greet customers, operate the elevator, collect data on the number of users and their demographics, and intervene to deter inappropriate behavior. Before the program, only 44% of elevator users rated themselves as very or somewhat satisfied using the elevators. Six months after the program was launched, customers expressed satisfaction stating, "very good for people with disabilities," and "please keep this going. I feel so much safer."<sup>1</sup>

### **Describe the significance of the unmet transportation need or gap that the proposed project seeks to address and how the project will address that need or gap. Specify the goals and objectives of the project.**

The Elevator Attendant Program goals are to ensure elevators at the four downtown San Francisco stations consistently remain safe, clean, and in working order for all BART/Muni customers. Clean, functioning elevators are critical to increasing access to transit service for populations with mobility constraints. Concerns about security and safety in station areas are also barriers to transit access for riders. This can particularly impact people who are of low-income, people with disabilities, and minorities who may not have other transportation options and depend on transit and its elevators. The Elevator Attendant Program's focus is to provide clean, safe, and reliable elevators for BART and SFMTA's customers. The Program directly addresses a need in MTC's Coordinated Public Transit – Human Services Transportation Plan (2018), which identifies safety investments for pedestrians and transfers between fixed route transit and paratransit as gaps in the transportation system. The Program assists to close these gaps in the system by providing pedestrians and people with disabilities safer and enhanced access to BART and SFMTA rail

---

<sup>1</sup> Office of External Affairs, "Elevator Attendant Factsheet," San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District, 2021

service The Program also addresses ongoing frustrations with poor elevator conditions, expressed by customers and BART's Accessibility Task Force (BATF). The BATF provides advise to the BART Board of Directors and staff on disability-related concerns and advocates for people with disabilities and/or seniors, many of whom are of low-income.

Homelessness, crime, and cleanliness are national challenges that are impacting transit stations and systems. In California alone, 72% of the homeless population is unsheltered – the highest share of unsheltered homelessness of any state in the United States.<sup>2</sup> California's homeless population also grew by 22,000 over the pandemic. People experiencing unsheltered homelessness are far more likely to face health challenges, violence and trauma, and longer lengths of homelessness than people staying in shelters. Lack of affordable housing options is one of the reasons people end-up on the street. In San Francisco, elevators, bus, and train stations have become areas where people who are experiencing homelessness, and are unsheltered, congregate. BART and SFMTA's customers, and the residents living around the downtown San Francisco transit stations, have raised concerns about cleanliness and security of the stations and the elevators. With many people in San Francisco who are also experiencing mental health and substance use challenges, the elevators at the downtown stations were often subject to misuse and vandalism, often resulting in elevators not being able to be in use before the Elevator Attendant Program was launched. These impacts have been discussed in multiple City and County of San Francisco studies and plans, including the Tenderloin Neighborhood Plan for COVID-19, and BART's Customer Satisfaction Studies.

The Elevator Attendant Program addresses the needs of BART and SFMTA's customers and of downtown community members living near the stations. The attendants help to ensure elevators at the four downtown San Francisco stations consistently remain safe, clean, and in working order. Additionally, improved cleanliness of the elevators has helped to reduce elevator downtime. Customers, including those who arrive by paratransit and need to use the elevator to access fixed route transit service, now have more reliable elevator service to get to and from the platform. Thus, the Program enhances access for people with disabilities, paratransit riders, families with strollers, tourists, and a wider network of people living and working near the stations.

**Describe how the project supports and the specific benefits to Equity Priority Communities (EPCs) and disadvantaged populations, include a description of the EPCs and pertinent demographic data.**

The Elevator Attendant Program serves the community where the shared BART/Muni stations are located and provides specific benefits to EPCs and people who are historically disadvantaged. The Project's area expands from the Embarcadero station to the Civic Center/UN Plaza station. As shown in the Project's Area Map, Attachment 4, the stations are in an area with a high density of Equity Priority Communities (EPCs). Specifically, the stations are in an area with many people who have a disability, are of low-income, and/or are of a minority background. According to the San Francisco County Transportation Authority EPCs data, the Project's area has 17% to 33% of people with disabilities, 66% to 73% of people who identify as a minority, and 32% to 69% of people who are of low-income. Data captured by Elevator Attendants since the Program was launched, in April of 2018, includes one of these measures – people with disabilities. Between the summer of 2019 and 2022, the program served 3.7 million customers, including

---

<sup>2</sup> Ian Gabriel and Victoria Ciudad-Real, "State of Homelessness In California Fact Sheet," Homelessness Policy Research Institute.



217,907 people with disabilities. The Program's quantitative and qualitative information demonstrates that the Elevator Attendant Program supports and provides benefits to the community where the stations are located.

### **Community-Identified Priority**

**Discuss how the project addresses a transportation gap and/or barrier identified in a Community-Based Transportation Plan (CBTP) and/or other substantive local planning effort involving focused inclusive engagement with low-income populations. Indicate the name of the plan(s) and the page number(s) where the relevant gap and/or barrier is identified. Indicate the priority given to the project in the plan.**

MTC's Coordinated Public Transit – Human Services Transportation Plan (2018) addresses the mobility needs of seniors, people with disabilities, people on low-incomes and veterans. The plan states clean, functioning elevators help provide access to transit, particularly for groups with potential mobility limitations. The plan identifies elevator outages and lack of information about such outages as barriers to transit use (see pages 27, 47, 82, and 84). The Elevator Attendant Program helps to address these issues by reducing elevator service disruptions. The Elevator Attendant Program goals are to ensure elevators at the four downtown San Francisco stations consistently remain safe, clean, and in working order for all BART/Muni customers. The Elevator Attendant Program has significantly improved the elevator experience for BART and Muni customers, many of whom are of low-income, have a disability, and/or are seniors, by consistently meeting objectives that ensure the Program achieves its goals. BART and SFMTA have often heard from groups advocating for people with disabilities and other customers how the Program has made their experience on transit friendlier and safer.

### **Implementation Plan and Project Management Capacity**

**Is the project ready to be implemented? What, if any, major issues need to be resolved prior to implementation and when will they be resolved?**

The Elevator Attendant Program has been successfully operating since the spring of 2018. The Program expanded to provide services at all four downtown San Francisco stations since the fall of 2019. The Program is coordinated in partnership with SFMTA. Since 2019, BART and SFMTA have had an agreement to administer the Program, whereby BART manages the service provider and tracks program data, invoices, and payments. Currently, BART and SFMTA are finalizing details to extend the agreement through June 30, 2025. The Project is ready to be implemented in FY23-24 and FY24-25 without any lapse in service.

**Describe your organization's ability to provide and manage the proposed project.**

BART, in partnership with SFMTA, has successfully managed the Elevator Attendant Program since the spring of 2018. The Program has been managed by BART staff with extensive experience overseeing similar projects benefiting diverse community members. The Program was first managed by Mr. Tim Chan, Group Manager of Station Planning, who has over 20 years of experience in urban planning and relevant experience overseeing projects providing services to Equity Priority Communities. In 2021, the Program transitioned to be managed under BART's first position focused on social service partnerships. Mr. Daniel Cooperman, Senior Manager of Social Service Partnerships, with over 10 years of relevant experience, joined BART in May 2021. Mr. Cooperman will continue to manage the Program in FY23-24 and FY24-25.

**Describe any proposed use of innovative approaches that will be employed for this project and their potential impact on project success.**

The presence of attendants at transit station elevators and the partnership established between BART, SFMTA, and Urban Alchemy, a community-based organization (CBO) and social enterprise, is an innovative approach. The attendants serve as ambassadors for BART and the SFMTA in addition to helping to improve cleanliness, safety, and security. Urban Alchemy manages the elevator attendants, who are also participating in the organization's workforce development program. Urban Alchemy engages with "situations where extreme poverty meets homelessness, mental illness and addiction" with a "peaceful and supportive presence."<sup>3</sup> Urban Alchemy now has over five years of sourcing, training, and supervising the elevator attendants. BART is confident that the Program will continue to be successful in FY23-24 and FY24-25.

**Project Sustainability**

**Describe the project sustainability: (Operating Projects) describe efforts to identify potential funding sources for sustaining the service beyond the grant period. If funding is identified, provide the responsible agency(is) and funding sources for all ongoing service.**

BART and SFMTA jointly fund operation of the Program, each providing 50 percent of operational costs. The Program is currently funded through June 30, 2023. This LTP application is to fund costs for FY23-24 and FY24-25. BART and SFMTA are committed to continuing this initiative beyond the performance period of this grant.

**Cost-Effectiveness and Performance Indicators**

**Demonstrate how the proposed project is the most appropriate and cost-effective way in which to address the identified transportation need.**

Various plans and community input have identified the need to improve the sense of safety and security in accessing elevators at transit stations and the need to reduce elevator down time, thus improving transit access for people who are of low-income and/or have a disability. The Elevator Attendant Program addresses this transportation need in a cost-effective way that has multiple benefits to the community where the stations are located, BART and SFMTA riders – from San Francisco, Bay Area, or from outside the region, and people who have a disability. Since the program was launched, safety and security concerns have been significantly reduced. The presence of attendants at the elevators in downtown San Francisco stations has discouraged and reduced unwanted activities inside the elevators and decreased elevator down time due to cleaning and maintenance needs. Through the program, Urban Alchemy is providing elevator attendants at the four stations 52 weeks per year, 21 hours per day, 7 days per week, with eight to ten attendants on duty at a time (attendants fill three shifts per day, with two attendants at each station, one attendant that "floats" between two stations, and supervisors that assist with breaks). This is a total of 76,440 service

---

<sup>3</sup> Urban Alchemy, "Our People," Transforming the Energy In Traumatized Urban Spaces," May 02, 2022, <https://urban-alchemy.us/>.

hours per year for a total cost of \$3,392,636 per fiscal year, including costs to pay attendants (with benefits), program oversight, weekly reporting, grant specific activities, equipment costs, and indirect costs.

**Identify performance measures to track the effectiveness of the project in meeting the identified goals. Provide the baseline and new or continued units of service to be provided (e.g., number of trips, service hours, etc.) and cost per unit of service (e.g., cost per trip or persons served per month and year).**

The Program goals are to ensure elevators at the four downtown San Francisco stations consistently remain safe, clean, and in working order for all BART/Muni customers. The following performance measures are being used, and will continue to be used, to track the effectiveness of the Program and report for the LTP grant in FY23-24 and FY24-25.

Performance Metric	Description	Reporting Frequency	Goal
Users Served	Number of users using elevators at each station, including number of disabled users, strollers, luggage, bicycles, and carts.	Monthly	Increase or maintain access to users, particularly disabled users
Biowaste Incidents	Number of incidents, per station, in which BART cleaning staff encounter needles or biowaste in an elevator	Monthly	Reduce biowaste incidents
Passenger Cleanliness Rating	Passenger ratings for station cleanliness (1-4 scale), including platform areas and other areas. Data collected from quarterly passenger surveys.	Quarterly	Improve station cleanliness ratings
Elevator Availability	Percent of the time station elevators are available for patron use during service periods	Quarterly	Increase elevator availability

## **Coordination and Program Outreach**

**Describe how the project will be coordinated with the community, public and/or private transportation providers, social service agencies, and non-profit organizations serving Equity Priority Communities. Describe plans to market the project, and ways to promote public awareness of the project.**

BART, the SFTMA, and Urban Alchemy work closely with the community in implementing the Elevator Attendant Program services. Urban Alchemy specifically serves low-income, “high-risk” youth and adults across San Francisco, providing workforce development opportunities for this population. These team members of a professional workforce simultaneously provide public safety and maintain clean public spaces, while engaging and educating the public. Attendants have come to be regarded as assets and stewards of the communities in which they work, creating a sense of safety and security in some of the most dangerous and socially impacted communities in San Francisco. Since 2018, BART and SFMTA have conducted media campaigns, including press releases, and other outreach to inform the public about the Program. The Elevator Attendants themselves are the ultimate ambassadors of the initiative. Recent news stories about the program can be found here:

<https://www.bart.gov/news/articles/2021/news20210518>

<https://www.sfchronicle.com/bayarea/article/BART-installs-gates-adds-attendants-to-make-14814852.php>

**Please confirm that BART and SFMTA are in agreement on project cost sharing, funding strategy, scope and schedule.**

BART and SFMTA agree on these items, this mutual agreement will be vetted through the execution of an extension to the current agreement between the agencies.



**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

1455 Market Street, 22ND Floor, San Francisco, California 94103 415-522-4800 info@sfcta.org www.sfcta.org

#### **Attachment 4.**

### **Fiscal Year 2024/25 San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4 Programming Recommendation**

## **Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service**

**Sponsor:** Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)

**Recommended SF LTP Programming:** \$1,418,858 up to \$1,686,004

**Recommended Phase:** Operations

**Districts:** 6

### **SCOPE**

The requested funds would help fund the operations for a Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service for 12 months. The 2021 Treasure Island Mobility Management Program Implementation Report (pg. 15-16) identifies a frequent ferry service between Treasure Island and downtown San Francisco as a central part of improving transit access on the island. Planned housing development on Treasure Island will dramatically increase the population from 2,000 residents to more than 20,000. The Treasure Island Electric Ferry is an important element of the transportation network of the Bay Area and is currently planned to commence service as early as January 2026.

The Treasure Island Ferry will serve about 245,000 riders in the opening year of operations. The operating funds from this grant will contribute to funding the service for 12 months. There will be an expected 14 departures per day in both the westbound and eastbound directions, 7am-9pm on weekdays, and 9am-11pm on weekends. Details of the service plan will be determined through a service plan and business plan developed jointly by WETA and TIMMA. The service will operate using one small electric vessel (149 passenger capacity) and two crews.

Fully electric service will benefit the Equity Priority Community of Treasure Island by reducing point source emissions in the area. According to data collected via the American Community Survey between 2014 and 2018, Treasure Island is classified as an Equity Priority Community (EPC) with over 73% of individuals identifying as people of color, 64% classified as low income, and 31% classified as zero-vehicle households.

The Treasure Island Electric Ferry service will add a critical transit link to downtown San Francisco for Treasure Island residents, workers, and visitors that avoids potential congestion and delays on the Bay Bridge. The only current public transit link is Muni's 25 Treasure Island bus line, which terminates at the Salesforce Transit Center in San Francisco. The ferry service will add redundancy and access to more destinations, jobs, and activity centers in downtown San Francisco and along the waterfront. Additionally, the Treasure Island Electric Ferry will provide a seamless transfer to the rest of SF Bay Ferry's regional routes, Golden Gate Ferry's routes, and various Muni bus and metro lines nearby. With WETA's emergency response mandate, the Treasure Island Electric Ferry and the associated infrastructure will allow the agency to perform evacuations or other emergency operations in the event of a critical failure of the Bay Bridge that would otherwise cut off vehicular access to Treasure Island.



**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

**Attachment 3.**

Fiscal Year 2024/25 San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4  
Programming Recommendation  
Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service

Page 2 of 3

The 2023 Treasure Island Supplemental Transportation Study (pg. 37) discusses the extensive outreach and engagement that has been conducted on Treasure Island to date. This included both surveys and focus groups in multiple languages. WETA will work with TIMMA and other relevant stakeholders to establish a fare policy for the service. Additionally, TIMMA would work with the transit operators on Treasure Island to establish a multi-operator transit pass that would allow unlimited trips on the electric ferry service. This pass would be offered at a discount to low-income residents.

Work is currently underway to construct and upgrade the necessary infrastructure at both the downtown San Francisco Ferry Terminal and the Treasure Island Ferry Terminal to support a fully electric ferry service. A charging float is expected to be available at Downtown San Francisco in May 2025, and the Treasure Island Ferry Terminal will be fully electrified by January 2026. The electric vessel has an anticipated delivery date of August 2026 as of now. WETA is working to accelerate the delivery schedule of the vessel. The agency will work to identify a suitable interim vessel to provide the service starting in January 2026 or potentially seek an exception to the electric vessel requirement for routes under 3 miles if the electric vessel is unavailable.

## REPORTING AND PERFORMANCE METRICS

Key performance metrics are shown in the table below:

PERFORMANCE METRIC	DESCRIPTION	REPORTING FREQUENCY
<b>Number of trips</b>	Number of total passenger trips	Monthly and Yearly
<b>Service hours and miles</b>	Hours of operation and miles travelled by vessels	Monthly and Yearly
<b>On time performance</b>	Includes late and cancelled trips	Monthly and Yearly
<b>Ridership and occupancy</b>	Number of passengers and percent of capacity filled. Includes bikes.	Monthly and Yearly
<b>Operating cost per boarding</b>	Total cost per individual passenger trip.	Monthly and Yearly



**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

**Attachment 3.**

Fiscal Year 2024/25 San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program (SF LTP) Cycle 4  
Programming Recommendation  
Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service

Appendix A. Treasure Island Ferry Route Map



## San Francisco Lifeline Transportation Program Cycle 4 Operating Project Schedule, Cost, and Funding Plan



**San Francisco  
County Transportation  
Authority**

<b>Project Name:</b>	Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service
<b>Project Sponsor:</b>	Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)

Operating Projects	
<b>Start Date of Operations:</b>	1/2/2026
<b>End Date of Operations:</b>	12/31/2026

Source	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Total	Status <sup>1</sup>
SF LTP (requested)	\$1,418,858	\$0	\$0	\$1,418,858	Planned
Fare Revenue	\$521,850	\$0	\$0	\$521,850	Planned
TBD (e.g. STA, tolls [once program is adopted])	\$1,835,125	\$0	\$0	\$1,835,125	Planned
	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
<b>Total Funding</b>	<b>\$3,775,833</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$3,775,833</b>	

Cost by Task and Agency	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Total	Source of Cost Estimate
<i>Vessel Crew Labor</i>	\$1,598,658	\$0	\$0	\$1,598,658	Treasure Island Ferry Feasibility Study + Escalation
<i>Vessel Electricity</i>	\$648,748	\$0	\$0	\$648,748	Treasure Island Ferry Feasibility Study + Escalation
<i>Vessel Operation and Maintenance</i>	\$247,596	\$0	\$0	\$247,596	Treasure Island Ferry Feasibility Study + Escalation
<i>Facility Operation and Maintenance</i>	\$663,032	\$0	\$0	\$663,032	Treasure Island Ferry Feasibility Study + Escalation
<i>System Expenses</i>	\$617,799	\$0	\$0	\$617,799	Treasure Island Ferry Feasibility Study + Escalation
	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	
<b>Total Expenditures</b>	<b>\$3,775,833</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$3,775,833</b>	

Additional Schedule/Status/Cost/Source Information (If needed)

Costs are in 2026 dollars. Ridership for 12 months of service assumed to be 245,000 boardings (Treasure Island Ferry Feasibility Study). 14 trips/day in both directions on both weekdays and weekends using one small (149 pax) electric vessel. Average fare calculated to be \$2.13 (85% of full adult one-way fare of \$2.50). The \$2.50 adult fare is the lowest fare considered in the ferry feasibility study. Exact service plan and fare structure will be determined at a later date.

<sup>1</sup> Planned funds have not been programmed or allocated specifically to the project or program that is the subject of the current request; Programmed funds have been committed to the project by the agency with the authority to do so; Allocated funds have been approved for expenditure for the subject project by the funding authority.





RESOLUTION APPROVING PROGRAMMING PRIORITIES FOR UP TO \$5,342,905 IN  
SAN FRANCISCO'S ESTIMATED FISCAL YEAR 2024/25 STATE TRANSIT  
ASSISTANCE COUNTY BLOCK GRANT FUNDS

WHEREAS, In 2018, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) established a transit-focused State Transit Assistance (STA) County Block Grant program, combining funds that were previously distributed via a regional paratransit program, a regional Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP), and a northern counties/small transit operators' program; and

WHEREAS, As the Congestion Management Agency (CMA) for San Francisco, the Transportation Authority is responsible for administering San Francisco's STA County Block Grant program; and

WHEREAS, MTC requires that by May 15 of each year, CMAs submit the distribution policy or proposed programming for STA population-based funds which come from the state sales tax on diesel fuel; and

WHEREAS, Annual STA revenues are projections and annual amounts may be higher or lower when confirmed at the end of each Fiscal Year (FY) following the State's reconciliation of actual revenues generated; and

WHEREAS, MTC's current projection for San Francisco's FY 2023/24 STA County Block Grant funds, totals \$5,342,905; and

WHEREAS, Given the uncertainty of forecasting STA revenues, MTC recommends that CMAs program 95% of their county's estimated STA amount; and

WHEREAS, Consistent with the prior cycle of STA County Block grant programming approved by the Transportation Authority Board, staff recommended programming \$3,300,000 in STA funds to support the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's (SFMTA) Paratransit program, and through Cycle 4 of the SF LTP recommended programming up to \$356,901 to BART's Elevator Attendant



Program for FYs 2023/24 and 2024/25, and up to \$1,686, to the San Francisco Bay Area Water Emergency Transportation Authority's (WETA) Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service as summarized in Attachment 1 with additional project details in Attachments 2 through 4; and

WHEREAS, At its April 24, 2024 meeting the Community Advisory Committee was briefed on the staff recommendation and unanimously adopted a motion of support for its approval; now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, That the Transportation Authority hereby approves \$3,300,000 for the SFMTA's Paratransit program, up to \$356,901 for BART's Elevator Attendant Program (SF LTP Cycle 4), and up to \$1,686,004 for WETA's Treasure Island Electric Ferry Service (SF LTP Cycle 4) as summarized in Attachment 1 and detailed in Attachments 2 through 4; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the Executive Director is hereby authorized to communicate this information to the MTC, other relevant agencies, and interested parties.

Attachments:

1. Recommended Fiscal Year 2024/25 STA Block Grant Programming
2. SFMTA's Paratransit Program
3. BART's Elevator Attendant Program
4. WETA's Electric Ferry Service